

ASIIN Seal & European Labels

Accreditation Report

Master's Degree Programme

Dental Sciences

Specialist Programmes

Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery

Provided by **Universitas Hasanuddin – Makassar, Indonesia**

Version: 26 September 2025

Table of Content

Α	About the Accreditation Process	3
В	Characteristics of the Degree Program	5
C	Accreditation Report for the ASIIN Seal	.10
	1. The Degree Program: Concept, content & implementation	
	2. Exams: System, Concept and Organization	
	3. Resources	
	4. Transparency and documentation 5. Quality management: quality assessment and development	
D	Additional Documents	.47
Ε	Comment of the Higher Education Institution (02.08.2024)	.48
F	Summary: Expert recommendations (16.08.2024)	.63
G	Comment of the Technical Committee 14 – Medicine (09.09.2024)	.65
Н	Decision of the Accreditation Commission (24.09.2024)	.67
I	Fulfilment of Requirements (26.09.2025)	.70
Αı	ppendix: Program Intended Learning Outcomes and Curricula	.73

A About the Accreditation Process

programme (in original language) Magister Ilmu Kedokteran Gigi (MKG)	Name of the degree	(Official) English	Labels	Previous	Involved
Magister Ilmu Kedokteran Gigi (MKG) Master of Dental Sciences (M.DSc) Magister Ilmu Kedokteran Gigi (MKG) Dokter Gigi Spesialis Bedah Mulut dan Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist (Sp.B.M.M) Date of the contract: 30.05.2023 Submission of the final version of the Self-Assessment Report: 24.01.2024 Date of the audit: 05.06. – 06.06.2024 At: Universitas Hasanuddin, Makassar Expert panel: Prof. Dr. Maria Cristina Manzanares Céspedes, Universitat de Barcelona Dr. med. dent. Thomas Koch, MedUni Graz DDS, M.Biotech., Dr. Heribertus Dedy Kusuma Yulianto, Universitas			applied	accreditation	Technical
Magister Ilmu Kedokteran Gigi (MKG) Master of Dental Sciences (M.DSc) Master of Dental Accreditation Agency for Higher Education in Health (LAM- PTKes) Grade B, valid until April 2026. Date of the contract: 30.05.2023 Submission of the final version of the Self-Assessment Report: 24.01.2024 Date of the audit: 05.06. – 06.06.2024 At: Universitas Hasanuddin, Makassar Expert panel: Prof. Dr. Maria Cristina Manzanares Céspedes, Universitat de Barcelona Dr. med. dent. Thomas Koch, MedUni Graz DDS, M.Biotech., Dr. Heribertus Dedy Kusuma Yulianto, Universitas	original language)	name	for ¹	(issuing	Committees
Magister Ilmu Kedokteran Gigi (MKG) Master of Dental Sciences (M.DSc) Dokter Gigi Spesialis Bedah Mulut dan Maksilofasial (Sp.B.M.M) Date of the contract: 30.05.2023 Submission of the final version of the Self-Assessment Report: 24.01.2024 Date of the audit: 05.06. — 06.06.2024 At: Universitas Hasanuddin, Makassar Expert panel: Prof. Dr. Maria Cristina Manzanares Céspedes, Universitat de Barcelona Dr. med. dent. Thomas Koch, MedUni Graz DDS, M.Biotech., Dr. Heribertus Dedy Kusuma Yulianto, Universitas				agency,	(TC) ²
Kedokteran Gigi (MKG) Sciences (M.DSc) Sciences (M.DSc) Accreditation Agency for Higher Education in Health (LAM-PTKes) Grade B, valid until June 2027. Dokter Gigi Spesialis Bedah Mulut dan Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist (Sp.B.M.M) Study Program Study Program ASIIN Accreditation Agency for Higher Education in Health (LAM-PTKes) Grade B, valid until April 2026. Date of the contract: 30.05.2023 Submission of the final version of the Self-Assessment Report: 24.01.2024 Date of the audit: 05.06. – 06.06.2024 At: Universitas Hasanuddin, Makassar Expert panel: Prof. Dr. Maria Cristina Manzanares Céspedes, Universitat de Barcelona Dr. med. dent. Thomas Koch, MedUni Graz DDS, M.Biotech., Dr. Heribertus Dedy Kusuma Yulianto, Universitas				validity)	
Bedah Mulut dan Maksilofasial (Sp.B.M.M) Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program Accreditation Agency for Higher Education in Health (LAM- PTKes) Grade B, valid until April 2026. Date of the contract: 30.05.2023 Submission of the final version of the Self-Assessment Report: 24.01.2024 Date of the audit: 05.06. — 06.06.2024 At: Universitas Hasanuddin, Makassar Expert panel: Prof. Dr. Maria Cristina Manzanares Céspedes, Universitat de Barcelona Dr. med. dent. Thomas Koch, MedUni Graz DDS, M.Biotech., Dr. Heribertus Dedy Kusuma Yulianto, Universitas	Kedokteran Gigi		ASIIN	Accreditation Agency for Higher Education in Health (LAM- PTKes) Grade B, valid	14
Submission of the final version of the Self-Assessment Report: 24.01.2024 Date of the audit: 05.06. – 06.06.2024 At: Universitas Hasanuddin, Makassar Expert panel: Prof. Dr. Maria Cristina Manzanares Céspedes, Universitat de Barcelona Dr. med. dent. Thomas Koch, MedUni Graz DDS, M.Biotech., Dr. Heribertus Dedy Kusuma Yulianto, Universitas	Bedah Mulut dan Maksilofasial	Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist	ASIIN	Accreditation Agency for Higher Education in Health (LAM- PTKes) Grade B, valid	14
Prof. Dr. Maria Cristina Manzanares Céspedes, Universitat de Barcelona Dr. med. dent. Thomas Koch, MedUni Graz DDS, M.Biotech., Dr. Heribertus Dedy Kusuma Yulianto, Universitas	Submission of the final 24.01.2024 Date of the audit: 05.0 At: Universitas Hasanue				
Dr. med. dent. Thomas Koch, MedUni Graz DDS, M.Biotech., Dr. Heribertus Dedy Kusuma Yulianto, Universitas	Expert panel:				
DDS, M.Biotech., Dr. Heribertus Dedy Kusuma Yulianto, Universitas	Prof. Dr. Maria Cristina				
	Dr. med. dent. Thomas				
	DDS, M.Biotech., Dr. Gadjah Mada	Heribertus Dedy K	usuma Yulia	nto, Universitas	

¹ ASIIN Seal for degree programs

² TC: Technical Committee for the following subject areas: TC 14 Medicine

Windy Sepry Marcelina Sihombing, student at Universitas Gadjah Mada	
Representative of the ASIIN headquarter: Dr. Emeline Jerez	
Responsible decision-making committee: Accreditation Commission for	
Degree Programs	
Criteria used:	
European Standards and Guidelines as of 15.05.2015	
ASIIN General Criteria as of 28.03.2023	

B Characteristics of the Degree Program

a) Name	Final degree (original/Englis h translation)	b) Areas of Specializatio n	c) Correspondin g level of the EQF3	d) Mod e of Stud y	e) Double/Joi nt Degree	f) Duration	g) Credit points/uni t	h) Intake rhythm & First time of offer
Master of Dental Sciences Study Program	Magister Ilmu Kedokteran Gigi (MKG)		Level 7	Full time	No	4 semester s	41-46 credits equivalen t to 74.21– 83.26 ECTS	Biannuall y in August and February First offered in 2020
Oral and Maxillofaci al Surgery Specialist Study Program	Dokter Gigi Spesialis Bedah Mulut dan Maksilofasial (Sp.B.M.M)		Level 8	Full time	No	8 semester s	78 credits equivalen t to 208 ECTS	Biannuall y in August and January First offered in 2018

³ EQF = The European Qualifications Framework for Lifelong Learning

The ASIIN experts acknowledged and considered the contextual framework within which the Master's and Specialist programs under review are offered:

Universitas Hasanuddin (UNHAS) is a state-owned higher education institution located in Makassar, Indonesia. It was officially established in 1956.

Accounting for over 44,000 students, the university has 17 faculties covering various fields in science, technology, engineering, mathematics and medicine, as well as the arts and social sciences. The educational offer ranges from vocational and undergraduate to postgraduate programs, including specialist, professional, master's, and doctoral study programs.

UNHAS' vision is "to become a leading centre of excellence in human development, science, technology, art, and culture based on the Indonesian Maritime Continent." In the 2025 QS World Universities Ranking, the university is ranked 12th in Indonesia and in the range of 1001-1200th in the world.

The Faculty of Dentistry

Fakultas Kedokteran Gigi was established in 1983 and manages 11 study programs. Currently, the Faculty offers bachelor's programs in dentistry and dental therapy, dentist profession, master of dental sciences, specialist and doctoral-level education. Its vision is "to be a center for the development of science, technology, and dental research that able to compete nationally and internationally in the fields of education, research, and community service based on the Indonesian Maritime Continent."

The Faculty has presented its mission statement on its website.

- 1. "Organizing quality learning to produce independent and superior scholars at the national level and able to compete at the national and international levels
- 2. Developing science, technology and art in the field of Dentistry.
- 3. Producing and carrying out superior research and service in the field of Dentistry that is beneficial to the community
- 4. Organizing modern and digital-based faculty governance".

As part of this cluster, the Faculty of Dentistry seeks ASIIN accreditation for the *Master of Dental Sciences* and *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist* study programs. The programs are introduced in the self-assessment report with the following profile:

i. Master of Dental Sciences

Vision: "To become a leading and excellent research-based study program in the areas of dental health service management, oral biology, dental biomaterials, and clinical dentistry in the field of dentistry based on the spirit of the Indonesian maritime continent."

Mission:

- a. "Conduct education, implement and disseminate dentistry science and technology based on ethics and morals, and be responsive to changes and developments in dentistry science and technology.
- b. Conducting interdisciplinary dental research in support of master's programs situated in the Indonesian Maritime Continent.
- c. Performing community service and collaborating with others on a national and global level to support master's education".

Graduate Profile/Program Learning Outcomes (PLO)

- a. **"Decision maker:** Be able to decide how to use appropriate tools effectively and efficiently to improve dental health services and research.
- b. **Communicator:** Be able to effectively communicate with both urban and rural communities to improve healthy lifestyles through counselling services, and be able to publish or share research results with stakeholders.
- c. **Community leader:** Be able to initiate, motivate, and mobilize individuals and communities in both urban and rural areas to improve oral health.
- d. **Creator and innovator:** Be able to create new things and innovate while being more sensitive to environmental health needs in order to make changes and find solutions to improve the state of public health.
- e. **Lecturer/Researcher:** Be able to act as a professional educator and researcher by constantly developing themselves according to research ethics.
- f. **Manager:** Be able to organize, be responsible, work together effectively and harmoniously in the health organization system."

ii. Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program

Vision: "to become a reliable and highly competitive education program as well as able to master and apply science and technology based on the Indonesian maritime continent to be applied in a global aspect".

Mission:

- a. "Become an education center that produces professional graduates who can bring benefits as well as fulfilling the Oral Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist needs not only in Indonesia but also in international world.
- b. Become a center for research development, create patents in the field of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery that focus on the development of maritime continental resources (research and patents on the exploration of resources in the form of algae into printing and analgesic materials).
- c. To create an interdisciplinary collaboration in research and patent development cross-faculties; build partnerships with international institutions and organizations to facilitate knowledge exchange, collaborative research, and a better understanding of global health aspects.
- d. Implementing a quality education and teaching system and being able to contribute to scientific activities at the national and international scope; we will equip students with a comprehensive understanding of the healthcare system, including the social, economic, and political factors that influence access and quality of care.
- e. Conducting research on the role of the development of science and technology in maritime continental resources, especially in the Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery field; we will encourage students and faculty members to engage in medical research relevant to oral and maxillofacial surgery.
- f. Carry out community service in the field of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery; integrate relevant content addressing the community health needs into our educational program. Engage students in hands-on learning experiences within the community, ensuring that they understand their roles and responsibilities in addressing current public health issues".

Graduate Profile/Program Learning Outcomes (PLO)

- a. **"Care Provider;** Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeon who are experts in managing oromaxillofacial abnormalities that require surgery.
- b. **Lecturer/Researcher**; Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeon who are experts in education and conducting research in the field of oromaxillofacial surgery.
- Communicator; Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeon who can be a motivator for behavioral changes.
- d. **Community leader**; Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeon who can be a leader of a problem-solving work team in the field of oromaxillofacial surgery.
- e. **Manager**; Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeon who can work effectively and harmoniously within and outside the organization of the health care system.

- f. **Creator and Innovator**; Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeon who are creative and innovative and give benefit to professional and community development.
- g. **Decision Maker**; Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeon who are able to choose appropriate technology in providing good health services at reasonable rates."

As per the discussion held with the representatives of the Rector's Office, UNHAS's strategic priority is to attain the highest class and international level. Pursuing international accreditation aligns with a current focus on internationalisation. The assessment team recognises and commends the efforts that the University has made to provide the resources to improve the national ranking position and international profile of its study programs.

C Accreditation Report for the ASIIN Seal

1. The Degree Program: Concept, content & implementation

Criterion 1.1 Objectives and learning outcomes of a degree program (intended qualifications profile)

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- Outcomes-Module-Matrices as part of the self-assessment report
- Faculty of Dentistry's website: https://dent.unhas.ac.id/
- Module handbook, both programs under review
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers

i. <u>Learning Outcomes</u>

At the program level, there are two tiers of development for the educational objectives of the programs under review, as elaborated in the self-assessment report and the Curriculum documents:

- Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs), which are a subset of the competence profile, and specify the skills and competences that a student should possess upon successful completion of the programs (see section B).
- Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs), which are derived from the PLOs and guide the design and assessment of the curriculum (see <u>Appendix</u>).

As documented, ILOs are developed based on each program's learning outcomes, a process involving stakeholders, and benchmarking against pertinent national and international standards and references. The programs' ILOs align with the Indonesian National Qualification Framework, the National Higher Education Standards, the Indonesian Medical Council Standards for Specialist Dentists in Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery, UNHAS's vision and mission, and the mandates of the Faculty of Dentistry.

Based on the Indonesian National Qualification Framework, the ILOs of the programs are distinguished as aspects of Attitude (*sikap*), Knowledge (*pengetahuan*), General Skills (*kemampuan umum*), and Competency (*kemampuan khusus*).

Within the provided documentation, the University presents mapping tables outlining the relationship between module learning objectives and ILOs, teaching/learning strategies and assessments and ILOs, as well as ILOs and ASIIN subject-specific criteria for both programs.

In addition, the assessment team also verified and confirmed that the PLOs and ILOs are published on the program's websites, accessible via the Faculty's URL.

At the module level, course learning objectives (CLOs) are defined in the respective module handbooks, where links to the defined program learning objectives are moreover documented. The experts appreciate the detailed and multi-layered description of objectives in the programs.

In the course of their assessment, the assessment team believes that the objectives of both programs are well-established and the intended learning outcomes are, in general, coherent with these objectives. However, in the experts' opinion, the <u>Master of Dental Sciences</u> study program requires special attention because it offers nine different profiles, making it more complex and requiring greater flexibility. To address in a comprehensive manner this complexity, the University should divide the learning outcomes in two blocks, a common one, aimed to the health research needs of the community, and a specialized one, to be focused on the relevant speciality issues of each program.

Aside from this, the assessment team attests that the learning outcomes of the programs correspond to level 7 (*Master of Dental Sciences*) and level 8 (*Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist*) of the European Qualification Framework (EQF), respectively. The ILOs have been designed by considering the Indonesian National Qualification Framework, the provisions of the corresponding Indonesian professional and scientific associations and using the instrument of internal and external benchmarking. Moreover, the experts assess that the outlined objectives suffice the ASIIN Criteria for the Accreditation of Degree Programmes. Further discussion of the curricula will follow under <u>Criterion 1.3</u>.

ii. <u>Graduate Qualification Profiles</u>

The *Master of Dental Sciences* aims to prepare students for roles as decision-makers, communicators, community leaders, creators and innovators, lecturers/researchers and managers (see Section B). The expert panel acknowledges that the Faculty of Dentistry conducts regular consultations to align the graduate profile of the <u>Master's program</u> with the aspirations of both internal and external stakeholders. However, they believe that there is room for improvement within the program to better prepare students for transdisciplinary collaborations, as recommended by the World Health Organization's

Global Strategy and action plan on oral health (https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240090538). It is important that the Master's program graduates are also able to collaborate with a wide variety of other professionals. In light of this, the experts request the university to plan how to reinforce the transdisciplinary profile of the Master of Dental Sciences. This plan should focus on enhancing the facilities and infrastructure necessary to support multidisciplinary and transdisciplinary research (more under Criterion 3.2).

Based on the self-assessment report, graduates of the *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist program* are expected to contribute with their knowledge and skills as care providers, lecturers/researchers, communicators, community leaders, managers, creators and innovators and decision makers (see Section B).

Even though the experts would have liked to speak with partners from the industry, they noted from the discussion with representatives of health-provider institutions that students are well prepared for entering the job market. These representatives conveyed their satisfaction with the knowledge and technical skills of the graduates, as well as their attitude. The audit team also learned about the extent of cooperation and, based on that, commends the Faculty for establishing a cooperative web with regional health-provider institutions by providing them with specialist oral health professionals.

Similarly, students and alumni expressed their satisfaction with both programs, the learning they deliver, and future job prospects.

As a result of their assessment, the experts confirm that students, alumni and healthcare partners are satisfied with both programs under review. They gained the overall impression that the imparted qualification profiles of the programs satisfy expectations on all sides and allow the students to take up employment corresponding to their qualifications after graduation.

iii. Review of Learning Outcomes

When asked about the process of reviewing the learning outcomes, the program coordinators explained to the audit team that the program learning outcomes, intended learning outcomes, and curricula are reviewed every five years in alignment with University regulations. In updating the curriculum, they consider advancements in science and technology, emerging trends, and government regulations. They also take into account input from the accreditation processes and feedback from assessors.

Each semester, the study programs conduct regular assessments of the achievement of the intended learning outcomes. The results of the evaluation of ILOs for selected modules are

presented in the self-assessment report. They also gather feedback from students and faculty members through regular learning surveys and discussions. Such practices offer insights into the perceived relevance and effectiveness of competency objectives.

From the provided documentation, their exchanges during the audit, as well as the further discussion about the University's quality assurance mechanisms under <u>Criterion 1.3</u> and <u>Criterion 5</u>, the experts gained the impression that appropriate, recurring review mechanisms concerning the learning outcomes of the programs under review are in place.

Criterion 1.2 Name of the degree program

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- Faculty of Dentistry's website: https://dent.unhas.ac.id/
- Curriculum Documents, both programs under review
- Sample Diploma, both programs under review
- Sample Diploma Supplement, both programs under review

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

The naming of the degrees awarded follows the Director General of Research, Technology and Higher Education's decree No 163/E/KPT/2022.

Graduates of the *Master of Dental Sciences* study program are conferred the title *Magister Ilmu Kedokteran Gigi (MKG)* or Master of Dental Sciences.

Graduates of the *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist* study program receive the title of *Dokter Spesialis Ilmu Bedah Mulut dan Maksilofasial (Sp.B.M.M.)* or Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeon.

The experts confirm that the English translation and the original Indonesian names of both study programs under review are appropriate and correspond to the programs' intended aims and learning outcomes.

However, for the <u>Master of Dental Sciences</u>, the experts suggest that the University consider changing the name of the program to "Master in Oral Health Sciences". The reasoning behind this suggestion is that "Dental" appears to limit the scope to a technical aspect, while "Oral Health" is the internationally recognised (WHO, IADR⁴) denomination

⁴ IADR: International Association for Dental, Oral and Craniofacial Research (https://www.iadr.org/).

of a science with a wide variety of specialists, thus expanding the study program's opportunities for transdisciplinary-collaboration.

Criterion 1.3 Curriculum

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- Faculty of Dentistry's website: https://dent.unhas.ac.id/
- Curriculum Documents, all programs under review
- UNHAS Academic Calendar 2023/2024: https://www.unhas.ac.id/kalender-akademik/?lang=id
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

The University provides the curricula, structure, and composition of the study programs in the "Curriculum Documents". According to the self-assessment report, the programs are in line with the Indonesian Qualification Framework and the National Standards for Higher Education. Additionally, the programs meet the requirements of professional and governmental bodies such as the Indonesian Dental Faculty Association, the Indonesian College of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgeons, the Indonesian Dentists Association, the Indonesian Medical Council, and the Indonesian Ministry of Health.

i. <u>Structure of the Programs</u>

Each semester equals 16 weeks, including 14 weeks of learning activities and two weeks for midterm and final exams. The odd semester starts in August and ends in January; the even semester lasts from February to June. The mode of study for both programs under review is full-time.

The *Master of Dental Sciences* involves 41-45 Indonesian Credit Points, with a duration of four semesters of study. The courses are divided into three clusters: behavioural and social sciences, basic biomedical sciences, and basic medical and dental sciences. The Dental Health Service Management major includes a course in a fourth cluster: Clinical Services. In the first semester, students study basic sciences, the philosophy of dentistry, research methodology, and biostatistics. During the second semester, courses are specific to the chosen specialization. In the second year, students focus on completing their theses and research. To obtain the Master's degree, students must publish a journal article and write a final Master's thesis.

The *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist* consists of 78 Indonesian Credit Points and has an expected duration of eight semesters. Courses are divided into four clusters (general science, medical and dental science, basic specialists and clinical specialists) and three levels of competence (Junior, Madya and Senior). The Junior level, covering the first, second, third and part of the fourth semesters, provides foundational theoretical knowledge and practical skills. The Madya level, spanning the fourth to sixth semesters, delves into more advanced practices. The Senior level, from the seventh to eighth semesters, focuses on comprehensive clinical practice in various settings.

After reviewing the documentation in the "Curriculum Documents", the assessment team focused on the curricular outlines for both the Master's and Specialist programs (refer to the <u>Appendix</u> for details). The team notes that the presented outlines do not provide a clear overview of the entire program, as they have yet to reflect how the curriculum is structured and organised over time, including the sequence and progression by semester.

The experts stress the importance of guaranteeing that the candidates are knowledgeable about how to enter, advance and complete their study program. Therefore, they ask the University to ensure, for <u>both programs</u>, that the program structure is explicitly described in the curriculum and module handbook, particularly in terms of requirements (admission, progression and graduation). A curriculum mapping is strongly advised.

Further details regarding the Indonesian Credit System and its alignment with the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS) can be found under <u>Criterion 1.5</u>.

ii. <u>Contents</u>

The curriculum for the *Master of Dental Sciences* study program is organised based on the following content (see <u>Appendix</u>):

1. The **first semester** consists of modules such as:

Philosophy of Dentistry; Research Methodology and Biostatistics; Molecular Biology and Immunology; and Management and Policy of Dental and Oral Health Services

2. During the **second and third semesters**, students deepen their knowledge in their respective areas of specialization through courses such as:

Specialization in Dental Health Service Management: Health Sociology and Anthropology; Risk Management, Health Promotion; Human Resource Management; Proposal of Qualification; Residency 1; Information Systems and Marketing Management; Law of Dental Health Service Management; Managerial Economics and Dental Health financing; Dental Health Planning Policy and Advanced Strategic Management; Advanced Health Service Management; and Residency 2.

Specialization in Oral Biomedics: Oral Anatomy; Oral Physiology; Oral Microbiology; Dental Pharmacology; Research Methodology 2; Proposal of Qualification; Research on Thesis; and Elective Study.

Specialization in Dental Biomaterials: Dental Materials Science; Dental materials and biomechanics test; Herbal and Marine materials and application; Nanomaterials and application; Bone and tissue engineering materials; Digital Dentistry; Research Methodology 2; Proposal of Qualification; Research on Thesis; Elective study.

Specialization in Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery: Oral pathology/oral medicine oromaxillofacial region, Oromaxillofacial Infection, Emergency Infection and Trauma; Principles of dentoalveolar surgery, management of pain and anxiety; Preprosthetic Surgery and Dentomaxillofacial Implants; Oromaxillofacial Trauma; Salivary Gland and Oromaxillofacial Nerve Disorders; Surgical and nonsurgical theories of TMJ disorders; Benign and Malignant Oromaxillofacial Tumors; Surgical principles of congenital cleft lip and palate disorders; Oromaxillofacial regional reconstruction and microsurgery; and Principles of orthognathic, osteodistraction and craniofacial surgery.

Specialization in Orthodontic: Orthodontic Fundamentals; Occlusion, Professionalism; Growth and development; Orthodontic Biomechanics; Proposal of Qualification; Orthodontic Radiography; Orthodontic Treatment Theory; Corrective Orthodontic Theory; Interdisciplinary Orthodontics; Elective Orthodontics; and Preventive & Interceptive Orthodontics.

Specialization in Prosthodontic: Prosthodontics Theory I; Prosthodontics Theory II; Maxillofacial Prosthodontics Theory; Logopedy; Proposal of Qualification; Implant Prosthodontics Theory; Complex Prosthodontics Theory II; and Complex Prosthodontics Theory III

Specialization in Periodontics: Periodontal Diseases /Abnormalities; Theory of non-surgical periodontal therapy; Fundamentals of periodontal surgery; Multidisciplinary therapy; Proposal of Qualification; Review of Periodontology; Advanced periodontal surgery theory; Management of

patients with special needs; Basic theory of dental implant therapy; and Book review of periodontology journal.

Specialization in Endodontic: Cariology I; Cariology II; Basis of adhesion technology; Dentin-pulpa complex; Proposal of Qualification; Bleaching Tooth; Regenerative Endodontics; Endodontic Instrumentation, and Dental Restorations.

Specialization in Paediatric Dentistry: Hard tissue problems and hard tissue oral pathology; soft tissue problems and oral soft tissue pathology; Craniofacial Development; Malocclusion and Problems; Proposal of Qualification; Behavior of normal and special needs children; Telemedicine dentistry; and Marine dentistry.

3. The **fourth semester** focuses on the Seminar on Thesis Research Results, Thesis, and Publication.

The *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist* program is designed with the following content framework:

The **Specialist** curriculum comprises 37 mandatory modules with no electives (see <u>Appendix</u>). According to the self-assessment report, there are plans to develop elective modules in line with the expansion of the discipline.

1. Junior level is comprised of modules such as:

Biomedicine; Behavior and Humaniora; Skill Lab 1; Practice 1; Practice 2; Practice 3; Practice 4; Practice 5; Oromaxillofacial Disorder; Dentoalveolar Surgery; Basic Surgery.

2. Madya level includes the following modules:

Basic Surgery; Salivary Gland Disorder, Neurocranial Disorder and TMD; Skill Lab 2; Practice 6; Practice 7; Dental Implant; Special Care Dentistry; Practice 8; Practice 9; Marine Biota; Lab 4; Lab 5.

3. Senior level consists of modules such as:

Disgnaty; Skill Lab 6; Skill Lab 7; Practice 10; Practice 11; Practice 12; Practice 13; Practice 14; Skill Lab 8; Reconstruction and Rehabilitation of Oromaxilofacial Deformity; Practice 15; Practice 16; Practice 17; Final Scientific Work (Thesis).

Regarding the levels of competence in the *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist* study program, the assessment team inquired, during the visit, about the standard minimum required before performing operations. The program coordinators clarified that students undergo training on mannequins before proceeding to actual operations. They also provided the experts with an excerpt from the 'Log Book Oral & Maxillofacial Surgery Resident,' detailing the minimum number of procedures required per topic. The team highlights, once again, the importance of maintaining clear and transparent information

on minimum requirements as well as feedback on students progress through the program.

Apart from this, and after reviewing the structure and content of the curricula for both programs under review, along with the discussions held during the audit, the experts confirm that these programs are suitable to adequately prepare students for the labour market. They commend the program coordinators for their motivation and significant efforts put into the optimisation of the programs.

iii. <u>Internship</u>

The programs under review align their curricula with a defined focus and stated objectives, which dictate the integration of practical components. This ensures that theoretical learning is complemented by hands-on experience, if applicable, reinforcing the application of knowledge in real-world contexts

According to the program coordinators, as a research-based program, the *Master of Dental Sciences*' emphasis is on cognitive skills specific to each specialty. Then, students have the opportunity to engage in research projects related to dental science, both on and off campus.

For the *Master of Dental Sciences, specializing in Healthcare Service Management*, there are two mandatory hospital-based residency modules. These modules are designed to provide students with practical experience in applying their knowledge and problem-solving skills in hospital management, particularly in oral and dental care. Students are expected to gain insights and experiences within oral and dental hospital settings and collaborate with hospital staff to analyse and formulate improvement plans.

The *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist* study program offers a resident education experience to achieve the expected competence level. Teaching and learning activities are mostly conducted at UNHAS dental hospital, the dental centre of the University hospital. In addition, satellite hospitals support the main hospital in an integrated academic health system. The laboratories are equipped with sophisticated instruments to accommodate the needs of the students in conducting practicals demanded by each course (more under *Criterion 3.2*).

The experts appreciate the number of hands-on experiential opportunities provided, particularly within the *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist* program. During the discussion, students expressed satisfaction with their early engagement with patients at the hospital, as well as their ability to communicate effectively with them. Alumni emphasised that throughout their education, they gained sufficient knowledge and soft

skills necessary for patient care. The study program provided valuable skills and experience, for example, to treat maxillofacial injuries resulting from earthquakes.

iv. Mobility

At UNHAS, the International Office oversees international student mobility. Its mandate is to enhance the quality and quantity of international cooperation to support the university's international reputation. At the Faculty level, efforts are being made to support the International Office's initiatives and facilitate outbound and inbound student exchanges.

In terms of international cooperation, the *Master of Dental Sciences* is currently implementing a joint-degree program with Okayama University, Japan. The program has also hosted numerous guest lectures from abroad, including Universitas Kebangsaan Malaysia and Universiti Malaya, Malaysia.

During the audit, the Master's students confirmed to the experts that UNHAS promotes student mobility in their student journey. Some students mentioned their plans to go to Japan. To do that they must submit a research proposal outlining their intended study. Meanwhile, others are currently engaged in research with Okayama University, benefitting from a joint supervision arrangement involving two supervisors: one from UNHAS and one from Okayama.

Student exchanges in the *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist* program are facilitated through the establishment of several memorandums of understanding with universities in Taiwan, Japan and Malaysia. The program regularly invites lecturers from these universities to present as scientific experts. Some students have also taken part in international events such as congresses and conferences in South Korea, Thailand, and India.

During the on-site visit, the experts confirmed the collaborations established with international partners. Specialist program students confirmed opportunities to attend seminars in India, Korea, and Japan. They also emphasised the possibility of deepening their knowledge of specific technologies abroad, which can be arranged through the lecturers. Additionally, they noted the opportunities available for supervision by professors from other countries, such as Japan and the Netherlands.

The expert team also reviewed the data in the University's self-assessment report regarding outbound and inbound student mobility for the programs under review. They examined the list of activities that support student mobility and internationalisation.

Based on the evidence presented and the discussions held during the audit, the experts commend the University for its current collaboration with international partners. However, they identified a need for both programs to strengthen their

internationalisation efforts. This includes a further increase in student mobility. The panel suggests the University to increase its participation in research and education associations and meetings, both at a regional and at a global level⁵.

In terms of credit recognition for study performance achieved abroad, the University's "Credit Transfer & Credit Equivalency" guidelines state the equivalency process as outlined further under <u>criterion 1.5</u>.

v. Curriculum review

The learning outcomes and curricula of the programs undergo comprehensive review every five years in accordance with Unhas regulations, alongside periodic monitoring each semester. At the program level, the Head of the Study Program is responsible for compiling, implementing, and evaluating the curriculum with support from the Dental Education Unit (DEU).

The programs are assessed at the Faculty level by the Quality Assurance and Reputation Enhancement Unit (QAREU) at the end of each semester and, at the University level, by the Internal Quality Audit (IQA) at the end of each year.

On the basis of their assessment, the experts acknowledge the Faculty's commitment to working on revising the curriculum and adapting to new research and the changing needs of the population through regular reviews. They particularly commend the teaching staff for their high motivation to improve both curricula. The experts recognise the value of these review processes. However, they emphasise the need for ongoing encouragement, as the dynamic nature of oral health research necessitates continuous curriculum improvement. This process should adapt to the evolving needs of stakeholders and incorporate advancements in health and medical technology.

Criterion 1.4 Admission requirements

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- Faculty of Dentistry's website: https://dent.unhas.ac.id/
- UNHAS admission of new students websites: https://regpmb.unhas.ac.id/
- UNHAS Academic Calendar 2023/2024: https://www.unhas.ac.id/kalender-akademik/?lang=id
- Admission-related regulation as part of the self-assessment report

⁵ IADR (https://www.iadr-sea.com/); ADEAP-Association for Dental Education, Asia Pacific

- Statistical data about the progress of studies, both programs under review
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

At UNHAS, the Rector's Regulation No. 36621/UN4.1/PP.37/2017 establishes selection guidelines for each study program. The admission requirements, procedures, schedules, and steps are published and announced on the UNHAS website and are thus accessible to all stakeholders. The selection process is carried out twice a year, and prospective students can apply through the online admission platform.

Master of Dental Sciences

Applicants for the *Master's degree in Dental Sciences* need to fulfil several prerequisites. These include having a Bachelor's degree, a minimum GPA of 2.50, and never declared a drop-out at UNHAS at the same educational level.

Eligible candidates are required to complete an acceptance procedure, including written tests, interviews, letters of recommendation, or portfolios of prospective study programs. Additionally, they will go through a series of tests, including English proficiency and personality tests.

Admission is possible biannually, with studies starting in August and February. The annual maximum capacity is 40 students. The University has provided the following student numbers as part of its self-assessment report:

Table 1: Student Intake for the Master's program. Source: Appendix Self-assessment report, UNHAS.

Dunamana	Year of Entry	Number of students			
Program		Participation	Pass Selection		
	2019	27	3		
Master	2020	43	43		
	2021	21	21		

Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist

The admissions process includes criteria common to all specialist programs and program-specific requirements. To be eligible, candidates must be dentists who graduated from the Faculty of Dentistry of an accredited public or private university, have a minimum GPA of 3.00, and not have dropped out of studies at another university. They also need to demonstrate English language skills with a score equivalent to TOEFL 450, pass an entrance selection exam, have a minimum of two years of work experience, and be no older than 31 years.

Intake is possible biannually, with studies starting in August and January. According to the self-assessment report, the annual average intake target is 14 students. The University has also included student numbers as part of the evidence:

Table 2: Annual Student Intake for the Specialist program. Source: Appendix Self-assessment report, UNHAS.

Dugguan	Year of	Number of students				
Program	Entry	Participation	Pass Selection			
	2018/2018	33	14			
Coorialist	2019/2020	13	13			
Specialist	2020/2021	18	14			
	2021/2022	19	11			

The tuition fee for the Master of Dental Sciences is 10,000,000 IDR (570 EUR) per semester. For the Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist, the tuition fee is 15,000,000 IDR (860 EUR) per semester, in addition to a one-time institutional development fee of 50,000,000 IDR (2,850 EUR).

In assessing this criterion, the experts find the admission rules to be binding, transparent, and based on decrees by the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education and UNHAS written regulations.

The experts see evidence that the University monitors the student's progress and performance. Master graduates had an average GPA of 3.96 over the last three batches, while Specialist graduates also maintained an average GPA of 3.96 over the past two years. However, upon reviewing the "Academic Student Data in Study Programs" presented as an appendix to the self-assessment report, it was noted that the information on "dropout" rates and "on-time graduation" is unclear. The assessment team request the University to provide clear data on student progression for <u>both programs</u>, improving reporting protocols.

Criterion 1.5 Workload and Credits

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- Curriculum Documents, both programs under review
- Guidelines for Credit Transfer & Credit Equivalency as published on the university's website: https://dikmawa.unhas.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/2023/08/dokumen-1620651628-passkey Credit-Transfer-UNHAS.pdf).
- Discussions during the audit.

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

Study programs at UNHAS must follow the Indonesian credit system regulations. Each credit point (CP) is distributed between guided and independent learning activities According to the National Standards for Higher Education (SNPT), the learning activities are lectures, practicum, and seminars. The duration of one course is generally 16 weeks per semester. In this context, 1 CP course consists of 16 weeks of direct contact (50 minutes), 16 weeks of assignments (60 minutes), plus 16 weeks of independent study (60 minutes). Consequently, the total hours spent for 1 CP course in one semester will be 2720 minutes or 45.3 hours per semester.

1 CP of practicum field study, research, workplace study, clerkship consists of 170 minutes of a practical session or equivalent 8 hours a day for a week.

Master of Dental Sciences

The Master's curriculum requires a study load of 41-46 Indonesian credits, depending on the specialization. Regarding their equivalence to ECTS, the information provided in the self-assessment report shows that the program uses the equivalence of 1 ECTS = 25 hours of student workload according to the ECTS Users' Guide. The general equivalence applied is 1 CP = 1.81 ECTS.

The following table offers a breakdown of the total workload for the Master's program:

Table 3: Course Competence Cluster Composition in the Curriculum.

Source: Self-assessment report, UNHAS.

Course				ECTS p	er Specialization				
Course Competence Cluster	Health Service Management	Oral Biomedics	Biomaterial	Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery	Prosthodontic	Orthodontic	Periodontic	Endodontic	Pediatric Dentistry
Behavioural and Social Sciences	21.76	3.63	3.63	3.63	3.63	3.63	3.63	3.63	3.63
Basic Biomedical Sciences	3.63	18.13	21.76	3.63	3.63	3.63	3.63	3.63	3.63
Basic Medical and Dental Sciences	50.76	54.39	58.02	67.08	67.08	68.89	68.89	68.89	67.08
Clinical Sciences	3.63	-	-		-	-	-	-	
Total ECTS (CP)	79.64 (44)	76.15 (42)	83.26 (46)	74.21 (41)	74.21 (41)	76.02 (42)	76.02 (42)	76.02 (42)	74.21 (41)

The allocation of workload and credits predominantly focuses on basic medical and dental sciences, aligning with the profile of graduates from the Master of Dental Sciences, who specialize in research within these fields

For the Master's program, the maximum number of credits per semester that students can take is 18 CP. In the final semester, the curriculum involves a seminar on the thesis research results, worth 4 credits. Furthermore, students are required to publish (status under review) at least one scientific article related to their thesis in a reputable international journal indexed in Scopus/WoS or international proceedings indexed in Scopus/WoS, with

a weight of 5 credits. Finally, the completion and thesis and thesis defense contribute 9 credits to the program requirements.

Upon reviewing the module descriptions for the Master's program, it is observed that the relation workload/credits is not consistent across all modules. For example, "Human Resource Management" indicates a total workload of 16 hours per semester for fieldwork, allocating 2 credits (3.627 ECTS). While, "Health Promotion", among others, states a total workload of 32 hours per semester for field work, assigning also 2 credits (3.627 ECTS). Furthermore, a total workload of 32 hours per semester does not seem to translate into 3.627 ECTS but less.

Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist

As described in the self-assessment report, the specialist curriculum requires a study load of 78 Indonesian credits, which the University calculates as equivalent to 243.72 ECTS.

Table 4: Course Competence Cluster Composition in the Curriculum. Source: Appendix Self-assessment report, UNHAS.

No	Course Competence Cluster	OGS		
INO		ECTS	Workload %	
1	General Science	9.06	3.72	
2	Medical and Dental Science	3.63	1.49	
3	Basic Medical and Dental Sciences	41.72	17.12	
4	Clinical Sciences	189.31	77.68	
	Total	243.72	100	

The Specialist program employs a learning strategy focused on clinical specialists, with a collaborative, practice-based interprofessional health education approach.

Upon perusal of the module descriptions for the Specialist program, it is noted that the conversion ratio to ECTS does not apply consistently across all modules. For instance, the module description for "Practice 17: Orthognathic and Osteodistraction surgery/Hard tissue reconstruction (osteotomy, genioplasty)" indicates that the total workload is 336 hours per semester for fieldwork, with 1 CP allocated, equivalent to 4.48 ECTS. However, the module description for "Practice 15: Jaw Fracture Treatment and Management of TMD" states that the total workload is 112 hours per semester for fieldwork but also assigns 1 CP, equivalent to 4.48 ECTS. In other cases, the same teaching format/hours per week for one semester does not allocate the same number of credits. For example, "Practice 1: Open and closed method extraction" indicates 100 minutes face-to-face per week, 16 time face-to-face per semester, with 1 credit (4.48 ECTS), but "Behavior and humaniora", which also states 100 minutes face-to-face per week, 16 time face-to-face per semester, assigns 1 credit (1.81 ECTS).

In view of this, the experts request the University to clarify the simultaneous application of different equivalencies and the variation in workload allocation for modules with identical credits with the <u>Master's and Specialist programs</u>. They emphasise the importance of reviewing the information provided to stakeholders to ensure it reflects the programs in a consistent manner. Furthermore, the module description should clearly distinguish between credits given for various forms of supervised studies and self-study time (more in Criterion 4.1).

During the on-site visit, the expert panel asked the student from both programs about their perceptions of the workload. The students did not highlight any significant imbalance or excessive workload during the audit. They reported having sufficient time to participate in other activities outside study.

For the programs being reviewed, the University provided data on the average time students take to complete their studies. The average completion time for the Master's program is less than 2 years, while the Specialist program takes slightly longer, with an average completion time of 4.5 years. As mentioned in <u>Criterion 1.4</u>, it is important to provide further clarification on other important key performance indicators, such as the number of students who graduate on time and statistics on dropout rates.

The experts confirm that regulations for the transfer of credits obtained outside of UNHAS exist (https://dikmawa.unhas.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/2023/08/dokumen-1620651628-passkey_Credit-Transfer-UNHAS.pdf).

Criterion 1.6 Didactic and Teaching Methodology

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report.
- Academic Guidelines, both programs under review.
- Mapping of Teaching and Learning Strategies towards the Achievement of ILOs, both programs under review.
- Discussions during the audit.

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

In its self-assessment report, UNHAS records that appropriate didactical instruments and methods are implemented for the Master's and Specialist programs. The variations in learning methods and tools are adjusted to the level of knowledge, skills, and competences set in each module. The choice of learning method depends on each lecturer, who can freely select appropriate learning strategies that adhere to the study materials and support

ILOs' achievements. The teaching staff at UNHAS uses a Semester Learning Plan to document the instruments and methods for a course.

The university's approach to learning is student-centred and involves teaching methods that prioritise the student's involvement in the learning process, with the support of face-to-face and digital infrastructure. The lecturers utilise the learning management system (SIKOLA) for learning and teaching processes.

The study programs also support students in the development of scientific work through courses, tutorials for producing scientific publications as participation as co-researchers. The Faculty of Dentistry exposes all students to relevant knowledge through initiatives such as hosting guest lecturers from the health sector and building partnerships with international institutions.

The expert team appreciate the comprehensive mapping of teaching and learning strategies toward the achievement of intended learning outcomes. These maps illustrate the diverse array of teaching methods employed within each program, which include lecturers, small group discussions, and discovery and project-based learning for the Master's program. While, the Specialist program employs strategies such as lecturers, small group discussion, student oral case analysis, project-based and simulation-based learning, reflective study, media-based learning, bedside teaching, pre-post conference and journal critical appraisal.

Both programs have courses on research methodology. Depending on their academic level, these courses guide students in developing, writing, and publishing papers and theses. To prevent plagiarism, an anti-plagiarism software (Turnitin) subscription is used. In the discussions with students, the experts learn that they are generally satisfied with the quality of teaching and learning in the programs under review.

In summary, the expert group considers the range of teaching methods and instruments suitable to support the students in achieving the intended learning outcomes. They confirm the study concepts of all programs under scrutiny comprise a variety of teaching and learning forms as well as practical parts adapted to the respective subject culture. Finally, they attest that the imparting of academic research skills is sufficiently ensured.

Final assessment of the experts after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 1:

The experts thank the University for the provided statements and additional documentation concerning criterion 1.

(ASIIN 1.1) Revision and division of the ILOs into two blocks – Master of Dental Sciences

The experts appreciate the program's recognition of the benefits of a two-block structure to improve the curriculum's clarity, focus, and effectiveness. However, the information provided through the link does not clarify whether any changes have been introduced. Specifically, there appears to be no distinction in focus between specializations. Consequently, the audit team continues to recommend a revision and division of the learning outcomes to better align with the oral health research needs of the community.

(ASIIN 1.1) Reinforcement of transdisciplinary profile – Master of Dental Sciences

The experts are pleased that the program is considering the Global strategy and action plan on oral health 2023–2030 for future development plans. They appreciate the collaborative initiatives with the University of Malaya, Makassar City Health Office, local governmental organisations, and schools in the South Sulawesi area. The experts also acknowledge that the program promotes multidisciplinary collaboration by involving researchers, conducting lab work within the Faculty of Pharmacy, and partnering with private sector firms like Phapros TBK on algae-based anti-inflammatory drugs. The experts appreciate these initiatives but maintain their requirement for a more detailed plan, with clear milestones, on how to reinforce the transdisciplinary profile of the program.

(ASIIN 1.2) Change in the program's name – Master of Dental Sciences

The audit team takes note of the program's decision to propose renaming the study program to the Director General of Research, Technology, and Higher Education. They appreciate that the program recognises the value of the suggested new name, "Master in Oral Health Sciences." This name aligns with internationally recognised standards, such as those set by WHO and IADR, which could help broaden the program's scope and enhance opportunities for transdisciplinary collaboration. However, as no action has yet been undertaken in this regard, the experts reaffirm their initial recommendation.

(ASIIN 1.3) Curriculum mapping – Both programs

The experts thank the Master of Dental Science and Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist study programs for their efforts in expanding and detailing the curriculum's order and progression by semester. However, after reviewing the provided "Curriculum Mapping" and "Student Logbook" documents, the team finds that sequence and progression are not clearly delineated, nor are the prerequisites and interdependencies between modules adequately represented. Consequently, the experts request the development of a curriculum map that clearly illustrates these elements and that this mapping be made publicly available to all interested stakeholders.

(ASIIN 1.3) Clear and transparent information on minimum requirements — Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist

The experts have reviewed the links provided by the University and verified that minimum requirements are categorised by competence levels—junior, intermediate, and senior. Based on this information, the assessment team concludes that no further recommendations are necessary on this matter.

(ASIIN 1.3) Strengthened internationalisation efforts- Both programs

The experts commend the University and the Faculty of Dentistry for their efforts to promote internationalisation. Master of Dental Science students recently took part in exchange programs in Malaysia. There are further mobility activities planned, including research projects at international institutions. The Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist study program's focus is on both domestic and international mobility, with internships, social services, and research being emphasised. At the international level, efforts are underway to participate in events, collaborate on research, and present in Malaysia, Thailand, and Korea. The experts appreciate these initiatives and recommend a continued, consistent strengthening of internationalisation efforts, including student mobility and participation in research and associations across both programs.

(ASIIN 1.3) Continuous cycle of curriculum improvement- Both programs

The assessment team acknowledges the Faculty's dedication to continuously advancing its curricula in response to developments in health and medical technology. This commitment is demonstrated through regular consultations with industry experts, alumni, and stakeholders. Additionally, the experts note the plans to establish a dedicated committee tasked with integrating new research findings and technological innovations. They also appreciate the plans to enhance mechanisms for gathering and incorporating feedback from both students and faculty. However, considering that this is an ongoing challenge that requires consistent and long-term effort, the experts reaffirm their initial recommendation.

(ASIIN 1.4) Improvement in reporting protocols – Both programs

The audit team has reviewed the data from both programs. They observed that 84% of Master's students graduate on time, while 33% of Specialist's students graduate on time. They also noted that there are no cases of dropouts in either program. The experts thank the University for this additional information, particularly the summary presented by the Specialist program. They encourage both programs to continue improving reporting protocols, ensuring that student progression data is presented clearly and comprehensively.

ASIIN (1.5) Consistency in the conversion SKS to ECTS – Both programs

The audit team acknowledges both programs' responses and appreciates the efforts to ensure consistency and accuracy in the presentation of the programs. They take note of the plans to implement corrections in the next semester's curriculum.

However, there are still some inconsistencies that demand the University's attention. For example, the Module "Behavior and Humaniora", in the Specialist program, specifies a total workload of "133.33 hours per semester" and 1 SKS (2.67 ECTS). Whereas, the Module "Biomedicine" also specifies a total workload of "133.33 hours per semester" but assigns 2 SKS (5.33 ECTS).

Furthermore, it seems that for the Specialist program, in general, 1ECTS equates to 25 hours, in alignment with the guidelines set by the European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System (ECTS). Nonetheless, for the Master's program, 1ECTS seems to be equivalent to 8.81 hours as illustrated by the Module "Fundamentals of Periodontal Surgery", which indicates that the "total workload is 32 hours per semester for field work" and 2 SKS (3.63 ECTS).

Given these considerations, the experts ask the University to revise the module handbooks ensuring that SKS to ECTS conversion is applied consistently.

ASIIN (1.5) Clarification on key performance indicators – Both programs

The assessment team thank the programs for providing additional drop-out and on-time graduation data. However, as noted earlier, they reiterate the importance of improving reporting protocols on key performance indicators, including student progression data.

The experts consider criterion 1 to be partially fulfilled.

2. Exams: System, Concept and Organization

Criterion 2 Exams: System, concept and organization

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- Module descriptions, both programs under review
- · Academic Guidelines, both programs under review
- UNHAS academic calendar https://www.unhas.ac.id/academic-calendar/
- Examination-related regulations
 - Academic Senate's regulation No 2/UN4.2/2020 concerning student code of ethic at UNHAS
 - Rector's regulation No 7243/ UN4.1 /KEP/2022 concerning master program implementation at UNHAS
 - Rector's regulation No 7/UN4.1/2019 concerning the implementation of specialist program at UNHAS
- Samples of student's work (projects, exams and thesis)
- Discussions during the audit.

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

i. Forms of Examinations and Exam Schedule

According to the self-assessment report, formative and summative assessments evaluate students' academic performance in both programs.

Exams measure intended learning outcomes (attitude, knowledge, skills and competence) according to a predefined grading scale reference. The module handbook specifies the

course intended learning outcomes (CLOs) and identifies the types of examinations used to assess the achievement of these outcomes.

Master of Dental Sciences

In the self-assessment report, the University describes the common assessment methods employed in the Master's program, including written assignments, multiple choice questions, and logbooks, alongside projects and presentations.

Students are informed about assessment methods at each first-course meeting, including correction and grading as part of the Semester Learning Plan. The form and length of each exam are specified in the course descriptions available to the students via the university's learning management system (SIKOLA). This platform facilitates access to study material and the interaction between lecturers and students. The students also learn about midterm and final exams via the academic calendar. Mid-term examinations typically occur during the eighth week, with final examinations in the sixteenth.

Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist

The University also provides an overview of the assessment methods employed within the Specialist program. The overview includes written work, multiple choice questions, objective structured clinical examination, resident logbook, DOPS, student oral case analysis, report evaluation, oral assessment, mini CEX and National Board examination.

Similarly, information is provided to students in the Specialist program at the start of each module. The teaching staff confirmed that during the initial meeting, they will discuss the learning contract, which outlines the planned activities for the semester. Students will also review the learning outcomes outlined in the Semester Learning Plan. All course materials and resources are uploaded to SIKOLA for easy access.

All in all, the experts confirm that a range of university-wide regulations governs all examinations and their conduct across the different qualification levels. However, after reviewing the assessment system and discussing it with the stakeholders during the audit, the experts believe that the renewal of the assessment methods could be beneficial. They specifically highlight the need for a more objective-oriented assessment system. The assessment team also points out that there are numerous new methods for evaluating highly skilled professionals, and this is an area where every higher education institution needs to continuously improve.

ii. Grading and Graduation Requirements

The final grade of each module is a combination of the scores of the individual types of assessment. The final grade required to pass the module is given in the semester learning

plan. The exam grade is presented in an absolute numeric value with a range of 0-100. The final grade of the course is given as a quality letter and quality score as follows:

Table 5: Grading Category.
Source: Self-assessment report, UNHAS.

Mas	ter of Dental Scie	nces	Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist			
Numeric range grade	Letter grade	Conversion	Numeric range grade	Letter grade	Conversion	
85-100	А	4.00	85-100	Α	4.00	
80 - < 85	A-	3.75	80 - < 85	A-	3.75	
75 - < 80	B+	3.50	75 - < 80	B+	3.50	
70 - < 75	В	3.00	70 - < 75	В	3.00	
65 - < 70	B-	2.75	65 - < 70	B-	2.75	
55 - <65	С	2.00	00-<65	Е	0.00	
00 - < 55	E	0.00				

Master of Dental Sciences

For the Master's program, Grades A to C are passing grades and cannot be repeated, while E grade is the category for failing grades. Based on the regulation, students are required to attend at least 85% of all learning activities to be allowed to take the final examination.

To graduate, students must have completed the required study load and meet several conditions that are required before conducting results seminars: students must pass all courses with a minimum GPA of 3.00, have a TOEFL score of at least 450 or equivalent, and submit the proof of publication in a reputable international journal (Q1-Q4) indexed by Scopus/WoS.

Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist

For the Specialist program, Grades A to B are passing grades, while Grade E is a failing grade. Students must have a minimum of 80% attendance rate, unless there is a justifiable reason, and they must have followed the entire course learning process to be eligible to take the final examination.

Specialist Education Program students are required to undertake a research results seminar (thesis). To take part in this, it must be ensured a minimum GPA of 3.00 and a TOEFL score of at least 450. The Collegium of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery administers a competency test (national exam). There is also a final exam carried out to assess student's ability to master knowledge comprehensively. Requirements for taking the final exam include submitting proof of acceptance in a reputable international journal or accredited national journal.

Both programs

In case a student is unable to attend examinations schedule due to force majeure (a natural, unavoidable condition among students, such as disease, pregnancy, or disability, among others), the student has a right to re-sit or reschedule the examination.

Final grades are available on students' academic accounts NEOSIA no later than 2 weeks after the last exams. When students have objections to their exam results, they have the chance to appeal to the course coordinator, usually within one week of being notified of the results. The students confirmed during the audit that an appeal mechanism exists if they perceive their grades as unfair.

UNHAS has a policy on academic integrity in all student activity, including examinations and assignments. According to the UNHAS Student Code of Ethics, if students engage in plagiarism, they will face sanctions that correspond to the severity of their actions, which may range from academic penalties and suspension to expulsion. To help prevent plagiarism, the university offers teachers and students access to anti-plagiarism software, which can be used to check for similarities in written work.

iii. Thesis

In accordance with academic guidelines, Master's and Specialist's students are required to complete a research project as their final assignment before graduation. This project involves creating and presenting a research proposal, conducting research, analysing and interpreting data, and writing a thesis. After finishing the research and thesis writing, students must defend their thesis in front of a panel of examiners, which includes their supervisors and three examiners.

The expert team examined a selection of final theses and determined that they were of an appropriate academic level. However, based on the sample of the final thesis provided for the <u>Master of Dental Science</u> study program, the team noted that there is an extensive focus on literature research. Therefore, the experts recommend that the university consider building knowledge through a more clinical practice-based approach. This approach would emphasise the development of problem-solving strategies directly applicable to real-world community health issues⁶. The program has the advantage of access to a willing population, extensive collaboration with institutes and hospitals, and dedicated teaching staff and students committed to serving the community. Therefore, the

⁶ Byrne E, Prado N, Glossop S, Waring D. The Gold guide for dental core and speciality training in the UK: a review. *Br Dent J.* 2023 Jan;234(1):46-50. doi: 10.1038/s41415-022-5397-x.

Kelly GM, Roberts A, Lynch CD. A literature review: Entrustable professional activities, an assessment tool for postgraduate dental training? *J Dent*. 2022 May;120:104099. doi: 10.1016/j.jdent.

MCM3 Hissink E, Fokkinga WA, Leunissen RRM, Lia Fluit CRMG, Loek Nieuwenhuis AFM, Creugers NHJ. An innovative interprofessional dental clinical learning environment using entrustable professional activities. *Eur J Dent Educ*. 2022 Feb;26(1):45-54. doi: 10.1111/eje.12671.

experts encourage the program to follow a path focused on achieving more practiceoriented outcomes.

In assessing Criterion 2, the expert group finds that appropriate university-wide and Faculty-specific rules and procedures govern the examination systems. These rules and procedures are adequately communicated and transparently published. The students in the interviews confirmed that they were aware of all necessary information regarding examination schedules, forms, and grading rules. They are reportedly given sufficient time to prepare for the exams.

Lecturers in the discussion report that a variety of exam forms are used to check the attainment of the respective learning outcomes, including a mix of oral and written exams. The experts acknowledge that forms and assessment rubrics to assess the quality of the student's work are available.

Final assessment of the experts after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 2:

The experts thank the University for the provided statements and additional documentation concerning criterion 2.

ASIIN 2) Renewal of assessment methods – Both programs

The experts appreciate the Specialist program's response and are pleased to learn about the development of several objective assessment methods, including written work, oral presentations, multiple-choice questions, and the national board examination. They also recognise the significance of the National Board Examination, which is conducted nationwide by examiners from all OMFS educational centers in Indonesia. There was no response on this matter from the Master's program. Given that this is an ongoing challenge needing sustained and long-term effort, the experts continue to endorse their initial recommendation.

(ASIIN 2) More clinical practice-based approach on thesis work – Master of Dental Sciences

The experts understand that the COVID-19 pandemic demanded a shift in focus to literature reviews for student research due to restrictions on clinical activities and patient interactions. The team appreciates that, in post-pandemic, the program has transited back to a clinical practice-based research approach in line with its research roadmap. The experts would have liked to review the titles demonstrating the integration of clinical experiences, but the link was not provided. The experts encourage the program to continue emphasising the development of problem-solving strategies directly applicable to real-world community health issues.

The experts consider criterion 2 to be mostly fulfilled.

3. Resources

Criterion 3.1 HR Resources, Staff Development and Student Support

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report
- Staff Handbooks and Lecturer Profiles, both programs under review
- UNHAS website: https://www.unhas.ac.id/
- Operational Guidelines for Lecturer Workload
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

i. <u>Staff</u>

UNHAS personnel comprise both teaching and supporting staff, encompassing a scheme of civil servants administered by the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education and non-civil servants managed by UNHAS as a Legal Entity State University. Teaching staff members have different academic positions. There are professors, associate professors, assistant professors, and lecturers. The academic position of each staff member is based on research activities, publications, academic education, student supervision, and other supporting activities. In addition, the responsibilities and tasks of a staff member concerning teaching, research, and supervision depend on the academic position.

Based on the self-assessment report, the *Master of Dental Sciences* program has a total of 27 teaching staff members. This includes 16 full professors (59%) and 11 associate professors (41%). The *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist* program has 22 teaching staff members, including 8 full professors (36%), 4 associate professors (18%), 9 assistant professors (41%), and 1 lecturer (5%).

As per the discussion with the teaching staff, the university's regulations require a standard ratio of 1 lecturer to 3 residents for the Specialist program. The expert team confirms that this ratio is sufficient to meet the current needs of both programs. They commend the University for maintaining this standard and encourage its continued support in the future.

At UNHAS, the academic staff consists mainly of permanent full-time civil servants. Additionally, the University has provisions for recruiting permanent staff members who are non-civil servants through established internal processes. This recruitment is based on a requirement analysis prepared by the Faculty of Dentistry and submitted to the university level. The Ministry of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform centralises the recruitment process for civil servants, while non-civil servants are recruited by the Human Resources

Department of the Central Administration Office. Minimum academic requirements include a doctoral level of education for appointments to the *Master's* and *Specialist* programs.

Teaching staff may face termination for reasons including poor performance, as evaluated by students at the end of the academic year, or serious breaches of the academic Code of Ethics. In instances of dismissal, disciplinary proceedings are carried out through the Disciplinary Commission and the University Internal Control Unit, in accordance with established staffing regulations and protocols.

Regarding promotion, lecturers who are public servants have to follow the system regulated by the government. The teaching staff's promotion to a higher academic position is based on several factors, such as achievement in teaching, research, and community service activities (*Tridharma Perguruan Tinggi*). In order to be promoted to the position of a full professor, the applicant must hold a doctoral degree.

ii. Job Conditions and Performance Review of Staff

Every semester, faculty members formulate their work objectives and submit their workload reports electronically using the Integrated Resource Information System (SISTER). All lecturers must meet the national standards for lecturer workload of a minimum of 12 and a maximum of 16 credit hours of the so-called Three Pillars of Higher Education (*Tri dharma*), Education and Teaching, Research and Development, and Community Service.

Monitoring and evaluation of faculty member's performance in the three pillars are conducted every semester based on Operational Guidelines for Lecturer Workload (PO-BKD). The rewards provided to teaching staff are determined by the evaluation of outcomes of their workload and are disbursed on a monthly basis, including lecturer certification and performance incentives.

In order to evaluate performance and as outlined in <u>Criterion 5</u>, students are required to submit course evaluations for each course. The program coordinators confirmed that the results of these evaluations contribute to the overall assessment of the staff.

iii. Staff Development

The formal recognition of the quality of academic staff within the study programs is achieved through the 'Certification of Lecturers', a process overseen by the government under Regulation No. 37/2009 concerning lecturers.

Teaching staff attend workshops and seminars on knowledge and skill enhancement organised by the government. Together with this, the University conducts regular teaching

and learning workshops to improve/refresh the teaching skills of junior and senior lecturers. Newly recruited lecturers should attend Instructional Techniques Training (PEKERTI) and Applied Approach (AA) workshops. These workshops cover various topics, including the fundamental principles of learning and teaching in higher education, curriculum planning, assessment of learning and teaching, and continuous improvement in teaching and learning.

Financial resources are available for staff members to participate in national and international conferences or other events to stay up to date with the scientific development in their area of expertise. There are also opportunities to pursue doctoral studies abroad. In addition, the Faculty of Dentistry promotes the internationalisation process at UNHAS by hosting international scientific events and international guest lecturers.

The experts discussed the opportunities to develop their skills with the teaching staff and learned that the teachers are satisfied with the staff development program at UNHAS. For instance, one lecturer in the *Specialist program* completed their PhD in the Netherlands, which has opened up research opportunities for students there. They feel that the Faculty has provided substantial support. Additionally, there are ongoing research collaborations with Portugal to explore new methods. Lecturers in the *Master's program* emphasised the advancements achieved through partnerships with universities in Taiwan and Malaysia, including joint publications. Moreover, the Faculty collaborates with Taiwan to facilitate international exchanges and collaborations.

In their appreciation of this criterion, the experts come to the following conclusions:

In the experts' view, the teaching staff's composition, scientific orientation and qualification are suitable for successfully implementing and sustaining the programs under review.

During the discussions with the expert team, the lecturers confirmed that a range of professional development opportunities are available. The experts appreciate the University's efforts to support teaching staff in enhancing their didactics and teaching methods and provide them with opportunities for professional development.

Teaching staff expressed satisfaction with their working conditions and exhibited a strong commitment to their students. As regards the students, they were equally satisfied with the approachable, enthusiastic, and motivated teaching staff as well as with the learning environment. Overall, the experts attest that students and alumni were highly satisfied with the programs and happy to have joined UNHAS.

Criterion 3.2 Funds and equipment

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- Discussions during the audit
- Guided tour through the University's facilities and laboratories

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

i. <u>Funds</u>

According to information provided in the self-assessment report, the University's primary funding sources are the Indonesian government, through the State Budget (APBN), and tuition fees. Other sources of funding include research and community service grants along with partnerships with domestic and international partners. As discussed with the program coordinators and the teaching staff, there is basic funding from the University for teaching, research and community service. Funding is allocated centrally after a pre-fiscal year meetings with the faculty leaders to determine budget allocations. The Annual Budget Work Plans are then adjusted based on the allocation and aligned with the university and Faculty programs.

Additional funds from grants can be applied through government and non-government organisations/institutions for research and teaching projects, student and staff exchange, community engagements, and equipment.

ii. Collaborations

As part of its self-assessment report, the University provided a list of MoUs and cooperation agreements with both local and international universities, as well as partners from the health sector. Examples include national joint research on cleft congenital defects, alongside collaborations with Undata Hospital in Palu and the Celebes Cleft Center Foundation.

During the discussion with industry representatives and teaching staff, collaborations with various partners were highlighted. Thanks to partnerships with UNHAS and several hospitals, people without access to oral surgery now have the required specialists. In addition, students participate in community service and provide care to patients as part of their community outreach in regional areas. The assessment team observed a clear demonstration that the university is applying the results of both programs to improve the community's oral health. The team appreciates the university's dedication to social responsibility and tangible contribution to the community.

Additionally, there is a good level of collaboration in research across Faculties of health sciences. The teaching staff provided examples, particularly from the Faculty of Pharmacy.

The experts acknowledge the Faculty of Dentistry's collaborative approach, but they believe that staff exchange and participation in international consortia could be improved. They encourage the university to enhance opportunities, for example, through European Union-funded projects like ERASMUS+, HORIZON for research, or COST for the advancement of new techniques.

It should also be verified, if there is a possibility to get in direct collaboration with the manufacturing industry to enlarge the scientific equipment in some research fields, such as thermocycle equipment or others.

iii. <u>Infrastructure and technical equipment</u>

During the audit, the audit team visited the listed facilities in order to assess the quality of infrastructure and technical equipment:

Master of Dental Sciences	Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist
Master Of Dental Sciences Room	Oral and Maxillofacial Clinic
OSCE Room	Discussion Room for Residents
CBT Room	Simulation Room
International A Lecturer Room	Dental Center
Reading Room	Third floor (Lecturer Room and SCL Room)
JDMFS Room	Second Floor (Department Room and Resident
Fitofarmaka Laboratory	Room)
Pathological Anatomy and Clinical Pathology	Library
Laboratory	
• Library	

In their appreciation of the quality of infrastructure and equipment, the experts came to the following conclusions:

The facilities visited left a positive impression. The positive impression stems from a well-integrated infrastructure and accessibility, which benefit both students and staff in working efficiently. These facilities are well-designed with good infrastructure to support the needs of students during their education. They also have good accessibility, as evidenced by the many students working there at the time. The program coordinator and Rector share a strategic vision to build a network of facilities that will further enhance research opportunities for staff and students. The ongoing construction projects show that UNHAS is actively improving its facilities to further support learning, research, and other activities.

UNHAS Faculty of Dentistry also has a building that houses all its departments, enabling interdisciplinary collaboration. However, one area for improvement identified in the recent audit documentation is the development of a scientific infrastructure that is fit for transdisciplinary research.

Reading rooms are available at the Faculty's and University Dental Hospital's premises. At the university level, the central library offers services to students and teaching and administrative staff. Operating hours are from 8 am to 6 pm on weekdays, with continuous access to online resources available 24/7. The services encompass lending physical and e-books, as well as access to diverse scientific databases. Additionally, dedicated learning rooms are available for students to study foreign languages like German, Mandarin, and French. These rooms host classes in collaboration with embassies for interested students.

The experts find no severe bottlenecks due to missing equipment or a lack of infrastructure for the programs under review. In discussions with the expert team, the students confirmed that they are generally satisfied with the available facilities and equipment. The students also expressed their satisfaction with the library and the available literature.

However, it is also important to inform that a completely new hospital, including the Dental Department, is currently under construction opposite the existing building.

Overall, the auditors can confirm that facilities are sufficient for guaranteeing the sustenance of both programs under review.

iv. Supporting resources for staff

UNHAS provides support for its lecturers, including various opportunities such as pursuing higher academic degrees abroad, participating in national and international conferences, receiving training to enhance didactic and managerial competencies, and assistance in realising their research aspirations. Funding for research is available from several sources, including the University, government, and national and international institutions. The experts appreciate the access that teaching staff has to international research funding.

The University also supports lecturers in disseminating the results of their research. The teaching staff confirmed the existence of university-level service units dedicated to assisting with paper and proposal writing. The institutional support for research and publication is well-recognized by both senior and young academia. The expert team commends UNHAS for its well-established and developed service units that support research and publications.

v. <u>Supporting resources for students</u>

As mentioned previously, UNHAS has an online learning management system called "SIKOLA" through which students have access to lectures, materials, student-lecturer interactions, as well as for administrative processes. During the auditors' exchanges with students and alumni during the on-site visit, the latter also emphasised their satisfaction with the online services. Although, there were also opinions suggesting the need to improve the quality of the internet network on campus.

Every student is assigned to an academic advisor lecturer who is responsible for student activities from beginning to end. The academic advisors can monitor students' performance online through the academic portal NEOSIA. The students confirm during the discussion with the expert group that they all have an academic advisor, that they meet regularly, and that they can always contact their advisor personally and ask for help or advice.

Besides the above, students can rely on an early introductory program at the start of their studies, as well as on several dedicated support units, such as the Student Activity Units, Library, and Career and Counselling Services. Additionally, there are various events and developmental programs available for students to participate in outside of the classroom, including student organisations and clubs, as well as a program that promotes entrepreneurial skills.

The experts attest that there is a good and trustful relationship between the students and the teaching staff; enough resources are available to provide individual assistance, advice and support for all students. The support system helps students adjust to the university environment, achieve the intended learning outcomes and complete their studies successfully. The students are well-informed about the services available to them.

Final assessment of the experts after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 3:

The experts thank the University for the provided statements and additional documentation concerning criterion 3.

(ASIIN 3.1) Staff exchange and participation in international consortia – Both programs

After reviewing the response from the Master of Dental Science, the experts appreciate the program's commitment to fostering a collaborative and internationally engaged academic environment. The experts take note of the program's participation in international seminars, collaborative research, and international service community projects, and recognise the plans for joint activities.

Additionally, the experts reviewed the lecturer exchange reports provided by the Specialist of Oral and Maxillofacial study program for the various international workshops attended.

The assessment team is also pleased to learn that the University participates as a member of the UK-Indonesia Consortium for Interdisciplinary Sciences (UKICIS) 2022 and that the Faculty of Dentistry actively conducts research under the consortium.

The experts appreciate both programs' efforts. Since this challenge is ongoing and demands continuous, long-term effort, the experts stand by their original recommendation and strongly encourage the Faculty to expand its staff exchange programs and participation in international consortia.

(ASIIN 3.2) Scientific infrastructure fit for transdisciplinary research – Both programs

The experts are pleased to see the programs' dedication to advancing technological development and collaborating with international industries. They take note of the participation of the Specialist's program's teaching staff in activities in Singapore aimed at observing and learning the process of creating customised plates and prosthetic maxillofacial implants that are biocompatible. Furthermore, the experts appreciate the ongoing international collaborative research with universities in Taiwan and Japan. They encourage both programs to further enhance collaboration with the manufacturing industry in order to expand scientific equipment in various research fields. The experts recommend that the university devise a clear plan with specific milestones for developing scientific infrastructure suitable for interdisciplinary research, as they have observed that the programs currently operate on an as-needed basis.

(ASIIN 3.2) Improvement in the internet connection quality – Both programs

The experts have acknowledged the improvements made to enhance the quality of students' online learning. They examined the internet speed test data provided and the photograph documenting the installation of a new router to expand internet coverage and ensure a more reliable and efficient network on campus. Based on the measures taken and the evidence provided, they do not see any need to make further recommendations concerning this matter.

The experts consider criterion 3 to be mostly fulfilled.

4. Transparency and documentation

Criterion 4.1 Module descriptions

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- UNHAS Learning Management System (SIKOLA): https://sikola.unhas.ac.id/index.php?language=english
- Module Descriptions, both programs under review

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

The module descriptions for the programs under review were provided as appendices to the self-assessment report.

The experts confirm that the module descriptions contain information about the persons responsible for each module, the language, the teaching methods and workload, the credit points awarded, the intended learning outcomes, the examination requirements, the assessment forms and how the final score is calculated. However, there needs to be a clearer specification of the workload for the different types of activities. Several modules lack module content, prerequisites, workload and specifications of reading reference material.

These module description files are stored in SIKOLA (http://sikola.unhas.ac.id), which ensures students' accessibility. As confirmed by the teaching staff, the module description is explained to class participants during the first week of lectures. However, as noted under Criterion 1.5, the experts ask the University to ensure that the information provided to stakeholders reflects the programs in a consistent manner.

Furthermore, the experts observe that the module handbooks provided appear to be unavailable through the Faculty of Dentistry URL. The experts hence emphasise that module descriptions including all required module information need to be published in full detail (e.g. in PDF format) to be accessible to all interested stakeholders. The experts ask the program coordinators to review and publish the module handbooks for the <u>Master's and Specialist</u> study programs accordingly.

Criterion 4.2 Diploma and Diploma Supplement

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- Sample Transcript of Records, both programs under review
- Sample Diploma/Degree Certificate, both programs under review
- Sample Diploma supplements, both programs under review

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

According to the information provided in the self-assessment report, students from the *Master of Dental Sciences* and *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist* study programs receive upon graduation a Diploma Certificate, accompanied by a Transcript of Academic Records. The issuance of Diploma certificates is the university's authority and is signed by the Rector and the Dean of the Faculty of Dentistry.

Along with these documents, the graduates receive a Diploma Supplement, an official statement letter issued by the Faculty of Dentistry. It contains all necessary information

about the degree program, including learning outcomes, acquired soft skills, and student achievement in academic, co-curricular, extracurricular, or non-formal education.

The ASIIN experts are provided with samples of these documents. They confirm that the students of both programs under review are awarded a Diploma Certificate, as well as a Transcript of Records and a Diploma Supplement. The Transcript of Records lists all the courses the graduate has completed, the achieved credits, grades, cumulative GPA, and the seminar and thesis title.

Criterion 4.3 Relevant rules

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- University's website: https://www.unhas.ac.id/
- All relevant regulations as published on the university's website: https://dikmawa.unhas.ac.id/regulasi-akademik-2/

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

The auditors confirm that the rights and duties of both UNHAS and the students are clearly defined and binding. All rules and regulations are published on the university's website and hence available to all relevant stakeholders. In addition, the students receive all relevant course material in the language of the degree programs at the beginning of each semester.

Final assessment of the experts after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 4:

The experts thank the University for the provided statements and additional documentation concerning criterion 4.

(ASIIN 4.1) - Revision of the module descriptions- Both programs

The evaluation team acknowledges the University's work to revise and finalise the module descriptions for the programs under review. However, certain information is still missing. For example, in many cases, the module content repeats the module's name and could benefit from further elaboration. Additionally, as mentioned in Criterion 1, inconsistencies need to be addressed. Consequently, the experts believe this requirement still needs to be met.

(ASIIN 4.1) Transparency and accessibility of module description – Both programs

The experts recognise that the University has posted the student guide for the programs on the official website of the Faculty of Dentistry. However, upon review, they have observed that the guide only offers a brief description of each module. The assessment team maintains its requirement that the module descriptions, including all necessary

module information, should be published in full detail (e.g. in PDF format) in order to be accessible to all interested stakeholders.

The experts consider criterion 4 to be partially fulfilled.

5. Quality management: quality assessment and development

Criterion 5 Quality management: quality assessment and development

Evidence:

- Self-assessment report
- Internal Quality Assurance System Policy Hasanuddin University
- LAM-PTKes Accreditation status (LAM-PTKes website: https://lamptkes.org/)
- Samples Student Satisfaction Survey Report, Lecturer Participation Satisfaction
 Report, and Graduate Survey Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Report
- Discussions during the audit.

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the experts:

Quality at Universitas Hasanuddin is managed through a system involving internal and external Quality Assurance processes. This system has been institutionalised in line with Government regulations and is periodically evaluated and updated. At the university level, the Internal Quality Assurance and Educational Development (IQAED) monitors, evaluates and provides feedback on academic aspects. At the faculty level, there is a Quality Assurance and Reputation Enhancement Unit (QAREU) team tasked with assisting study programs in conducting internal evaluations based on UNHAS policy.

Based on the UNHAS Quality Policy, the study programs undergo internal screening processes of the following aspects: (1) planning (course modules, teaching team preparation); (2) implementation (lecturer attendance, timeliness, alignment with course modules); and (3) evaluation of course implementation (learning survey feedback from both lecturers and students). Data is also gathered from lecturer performance assessments and external stakeholders.

As described in the self-assessment report, the Faculty of Dentistry has developed a process to gather and review feedback from students and teaching staff. This is facilitated through end-of-semester surveys available on the study program websites. The student satisfaction survey assesses different aspects of the learning experience, including facilities, infrastructure, administrative services, and information delivery. The results from

2022/2023 indicate that students are generally satisfied with the areas that were evaluated. Similarly, the lecturer satisfaction survey evaluates aspects such as institutional support, working atmosphere, and teaching staff performance. The results from 2022/2023 show that 76% of the lecturers who participated stated that UNHAS provides good opportunities and support for teaching staff to continue their studies.

During the audit, the program coordinators, students, and lecturers of the respective programs confirmed the existence of such evaluation instruments. The expert group was given access to samples of questionnaires and reports that were used in the programs under review. The experts appreciate that regular evaluations are conducted to ensure the quality of the programs but ask the programs to improve reporting protocols, stating the process, dates and number of respondents.

Overall, students feel that their feedback is valued and taken into consideration. However, the assessment team believe that student participation at all levels of the decision-making process should be strengthened.

Student performance is analysed by calculating mean scores as the semester concludes, providing insights into annual trends. Additionally, the achievement of intended learning outcomes (ILOs) is quantified through Intended Learning Outcome Achievements (ILOAs) derived from percentage scores linked to specific assessments.

Aside from such internal quality assurance mechanisms, recurring external quality assurance exercises at UNHAS relate to the legal obligation to submit every degree program for accreditation by a recognised agency in addition to the compulsory institutional accreditation The Faculty of Dentistry ensures that the programs align with the standards set by the Independent Accreditation Institution of Indonesian Health Higher Education (LAM-PTKes), which conducts regular assessments every five years. Both the *Master's and Specialist* programs have received a "B" accreditation grade from LAM-PTKes.

The program coordinators confirmed during the audit that alumni surveys are conducted after graduation to evaluate the learning process and the graduates' acceptance in the labour market. According to the consultations, it was found that those who have graduated from the Master's program work in areas related to their study within the healthcare sector. Additionally, all alumni from the Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist program work in hospitals.

Additionally, feedback is sought from industry representatives and other stakeholders. During discussions with the experts, industry representatives mentioned that the surveys they receive provide an opportunity for feedback. They can share their thoughts about the benefits that come from the alumni. They also know that the feedback they provide is used

for evaluation to improve the curriculum. Additionally, apart from the survey, they also have the opportunity to meet with the head of the study program and discuss areas for improvement.

Other than the comments mentioned earlier, the expert panel has a positive impression of the quality assurance system for the programs. They believe that UNHAS and the Faculty conduct an adequate number of evaluations to gather the opinions of students, stakeholders, and staff on a regular basis. The findings from these assessments are integrated into the ongoing improvement of the programs under review.

Final assessment of the experts after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 5:

The experts thank the University for the provided statements and additional documentation concerning criterion 5.

(ASIIN 5) Improvement in reporting protocols – Both programs Addressed under criterion 1.

(ASIIN 5) Strengthened participation of students in decision-making- Both programs

The experts are glad to learn about the plans to increase student involvement in decision-making processes. They also appreciate that student feedback is continuously sought after through satisfaction surveys. However, the experts believe that student participation goes beyond collecting feedback, as they need more real voices in the university boards. Therefore, the experts reiterate the recommendation and suggest the University to explore the possibility for more involvement at the University, faculty, and department levels.

The experts consider criterion 5 to be mostly fulfilled.

D Additional Documents

Before preparing their final assessment, the panel asks that the following missing or unclear information be provided together with the comment of the Higher Education Institution on the previous chapters of this report:

None

E Comment of the Higher Education Institution (02.08.2024)

The institution provided the following statement:

Criterion 1.1 Objectives and Learning Outcomes of a Degree Program (Intended Qualifications Profile)

In the draft report, on **p.9, line 16**, it is observed that "the Master of Dental Sciences study program requires special attention because it offers nine different profiles, making it more complex and requiring greater flexibility. To address in a comprehensive manner this complexity, the University should divide the learning outcomes in two blocks, a common one, aimed to the health research needs of the community, and a specialized one, to be focused on the relevant speciality issues of each program".

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"Observation regarding the complexity of the Master of Dental Sciences study program, which offers nine distinct specializations. Currently, our program includes nine Intended Learning Outcomes (ILOs) that represent the nine areas of specialization. These ILOs are detailed in the following matrix, illustrating how each specialization aligns with the overall program objectives. By adopting this two-block structure, we aim to enhance our curriculum's clarity, focus, and effectiveness, thereby better serving the diverse needs of our students and the community.

In the first semester, all nine specializations share four common courses (National Courses). In the second and third semesters, students take core courses that support their respective specializations. In the fourth semester, there are university-required courses for each specialization, such as Thesis and Publication. You can see the detail in this link ILO"

Criterion 1.1 Objectives and Learning Outcomes of a Degree Program (Intended Qualifications Profile)

On **p.10, line 3**, regarding the **Master's program**, the experts noted that "there is room for improvement within the program to better prepare students for transdisciplinary collaborations, as recommended by the World Health Organization's Global Strategy and action plan on oral health (https://www.who.int/publications/i/item/9789240090538). It is important that the Master's program graduates are also able to collaborate with a wide variety of other professionals. In light of this, the experts request the university to plan how to reinforce the transdisciplinary profile of the Master of Dental Sciences. This

plan should focus on enhancing the facilities and infrastructure necessary to support multidisciplinary and transdisciplinary research".

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"We appreciate the thoughtful comments and suggestions provided by the experts. We have learned about the Global oral health action plan (2023-2030), particularly the action areas and possible partnerships that may be involved. We are fully considering the action plan to meet the Global and national targets, healthcare factors, civil society organizations, and the private sector. We hope to leverage the parties included in the action plan and partnership. Therefore, we cooperate with the University of Malaya to jointly organize Symposiums, research, and community services that meet both countries' interests. We also cooperate with the local governmental organization, Makassar City Health Office, and schools around the South Sulawesi area. We have been promoting multidisciplinary collaboration by involving interdisciplinary approaches such as involving researchers and conducting laboratory research in the Faculty of Pharmacy and collaborating with private sectors, including Phapros TBK, to develop algae-based anti-inflammatory drugs. In the other pharmacy industry, we have indofarma tbk."

Criterion 1.2 Title of the degree programme

On **p.11, line 30,** the assessment team suggested for the **Master's program** "that the University consider changing the name of the program to "Master in Oral Health Sciences". The reasoning behind this suggestion is that "Dental" appears to limit the scope to a technical aspect, while "Oral Health" is the internationally recognised (WHO, IADR) denomination of a science with a wide variety of specialists, thus expanding the study program's opportunities for transdisciplinary-collaboration".

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"The name of the Master of Dental Sciences study program was established in accordance with the government regulation outlined in the Director General of Research, Technology and Higher Education's decree No. 163/E/KPT/2022. In light of the recommendation provided by the ASIIN assessor, we will propose renaming the study program to the Director General of Research, Technology, and Higher Education. The proposed new name, Master in Oral Health Sciences, aligns with internationally recognized standards such as those set by WHO and IADR. This change aims to broaden the program's scope and enhance opportunities for transdisciplinary collaboration.

As for the assessment attests of the programs correspond to level 7 (Master of Dental Sciences) and level 8 (Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist) of the European Qualification Framework (EQF), we agree."

Criterion 1.3 Curriculum

On **p.13**, line **16**, the experts noted for **both the Master's and Specialist programs** that "the presented [curriculum] outlines do not provide a clear overview of the entire

program, as they have yet to reflect how the curriculum is structured and organised over time, including the sequence and progression by semester".

In addition to that, on **line 16,** "the experts stress the importance of quaranteeing that the candidates are knowledgeable about how to enter, advance and complete their study program. Therefore, they ask the University to ensure, for **both programs**, that the program structure is explicitly described in the curriculum and module handbook, particularly in terms of requirements (admission, progression and graduation). A curriculum mapping is strongly advised".

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"We have clarified the outline by presenting details about the order and progression of the curriculum by semester, including the expected learning outcomes and the interrelation between subjects. This way, it will be easier to assess how the curriculum can support the achievement of competencies and overall program objectives. We added noted to detail in this link Curriculum Mapping"

Response Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program:

"Regarding the curriculum, Specialist Programme of Oral and Maxillofacial consists of three levels of competence, i.e:

- 1. Junior level is the competency level for new students who are being assisted for intermediate and senior levels. In this level, students in this level are taught about minor surgery competencies in local anesthesia which are carried out in semesters 1 and 2. While performing their competencies, students in this level are under high supervision by the lecturer. Students are then entered the stage at pre-basic surgery rotation, basic surgical stage and emergency unit station, coupled with the competence of working on cases in polyclinics / outpatients (done in semester 3). These stages are organized in the Medical Faculty, Hasanuddin University. After passing semesters 1-3, an assessment will be carried out for graduation. To move to the intermediate level, students must pass the cognitive exam (minimum grade B), practical exam (minimum grade B), and complete the requirements as stated in the student logbook.
- 2. Intermediate level are competency level of student with ability to carry out integrated patient management, patient surgery schedule (Doctor in charge), as a senior on duty with decision making competencies in outpatient case services and also able to work on minor surgery cases independently and as an assistant in the major surgery cases (Implemented in the 4th, 5th and 6th semester). students in this level are under intermediate supervision by the lecturer. To gain the senior level, students must pass the cognitive exam (minimum grade B), practical exam (minimum grade B), and complete the requirements as stated in the student log book.
- 3. Senior level are students with ability and competency to perform duty independently in the operating room, conduct research, and produce scientific

papers. (Performed in the 7th and 8th semester). Students in this level are considered to have responsibility and wisdom with the highest level of competence, therefore they are under low supervision by the lecturer. The final assessment at the end of the study period is a comprehensive exam (CBT, SOCA, DOPS, MiniCeX) and National Board Examination.

Regarding student knowledge on how to enter, advance and complete their study can be found in the official website of Hasanuddin University. The process of transfer of students from level to level, must be determined through the level up exam. Students can take the level-up exam when they meet the following requirements:

- 1. Presence in each learning activity in the module in each semester > 80%, attendance in service duty activities in hospital polyclinics and night watch at assigned main and satellite teaching hospitals.
- 2. Students pass all modules in each required semester with a minimum grade of B.
- 3. Fulfill the number of clinical requisitions set at each competency level".

Criterion 1.3 Curriculum

Then, on **p.15**, **line 19**, the team highlighted for the **Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist** study program, "once again, the importance of maintaining clear and transparent information on minimum requirements as well as feedback on students progress through the program."

Response Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program:

"At the junior level, students are required to complete requirement cases, such as closed and open method tooth extraction, odontectomy of wisdom teeth in upper and lower jaw, intra/extraoral abscess incision, open windowing, treatment of emergency cases (bleeding control, dentoalveolar trauma, soft tissue trauma). At intermediate level, students must complete requirement cases of treatment of salivary cysts and glandular diseases, prospective surgery, endodontic surgical treatment, periodontal surgery, oral tumor surgery, inpatient and outpatient care. At the senior level, student's requirement cases are implant treatment, fistula closure, sequestrectomy, labioplasty, palate reconstruction, jaw fracture treatment, large cyst treatment, large tumor treatment. A description of the clinical repertoire for each competency level is provided in: Students logbook.pdf, and Level of Competence OMFS.pdf

All courses or modules that are mandatory in this Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Study Program are in accordance with the provisions of the Indonesia Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Collegium. All modules are mandatory, so there are no elective modules. As an addition, according to Collegium, each OMFS study program in Indonesia must have a flagship program, in this case the flagship of OMFS Hasanuddin University is the Marine Biota Course".

Criterion 1.3 Curriculum

On **page 17, line 23**, the assessment team identified "<u>a need for **both programs** to strengthen their internationalisation efforts. This includes a further increase in student mobility. The panel suggests the University to increase its participation in research and education associations and meetings, both at a regional and at a global level".</u>

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"In response to the assessor's comments regarding the need to strengthen internationalization efforts and increase student mobility, we are pleased to inform the expert panel that we have initiated significant efforts to enhance student mobility starting in May 2024. Twenty students have participated in exchange programs at the University Kebangsaan Malaysia and Hospital Counselor Tuanku Muhriz. These students, whose names are attached, have engaged in practical fieldwork and studied hospital management practices outside Indonesia.

Furthermore, we have planned additional mobility activities, including research projects at international institutions. For instance, Ainia Filza will conduct research at Okayama University in Japan. The letters of invitation or Letters of Acceptance (LOA) are attached.

These initiatives reflect our commitment to strengthening internationalization efforts and increasing our participation in research and educational associations at both regional and global levels. By expanding these activities, we aim to provide our students with valuable international exposure and foster collaborative opportunities that align with the panel's recommendations."

Response Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program:

"To strengthen their internationalization efforts, our student mobility established a program divided into domestic and international level.

Domestic Level:

- 1. One month internship at Undata Hospital, Palu, Central Sulawesi; Andi Makkasau Hospital, Pare-pare; Tenriawaru Hospital, Bone; Makassar General Hospital.
- 2. Carrying out social services in all regions of the republic of Indonesia by working on cleft lip and palate patients. Each resident has a minimum of 5 patients.
- 3. Research member of the Indonesian Collaboration research.

International level:

- 1. Speakers at international events or international scientific seminars
- 2. Research collaboration between Hasanuddin University and Niigata University Andi Tajrin, DDS., MS., OMFS and residents (Reza Irian Pratama and Rizky Adipratama),
- 3. Research collaboration between Hasanuddin University and VU University Medical Center (VUMC), led by Prof. Muhammad Ruslin, DDS., MS., Ph.D.,OMFS, Yossy Yoanita Ariestiana, DDS., MDSc., OMFS and resident (Carolina Stevanie).

- 4. Research collaboration between TMU and Hasanuddin University, led by Prof. Muhammad Ruslin, DDS., MS., Ph.D., OMFS, Yossy Yoanita Ariestiana, DDS., MDSc., OMFS, Mukhtar Nur Anam, DDS., OMFS, (Resident: Yeggie Nugranti).
- 5. All residents who presented in Malaysia (KLEF 2024), in Thailand ACOMST 2023, and in CLEFT 2023 Seoul Korea".

Criterion 1.3 Curriculum

On **page 18, line 10**, the experts noted for **both programs** that "<u>the dynamic nature of oral health research necessitates continuous curriculum improvement. This process should adapt to the evolving needs of stakeholders and incorporate advancements in health and medical technology".</u>

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"We appreciate the expert panel's recognition of the value of our review processes. We fully acknowledge the necessity for ongoing encouragement and continuous improvement of our curriculum to address the dynamic nature of oral health research and the evolving needs of our stakeholders.

To this end, we are committed to an iterative process of curriculum enhancement that not only adapts to but anticipates advancements in health and medical technology. This process involves regular consultations with industry experts, alumni, and other stakeholders to ensure that our curriculum remains relevant and forward-thinking.

We will also establish a dedicated committee to oversee the integration of new research findings and technological innovations into our teaching methodologies and course content. This committee will be responsible for conducting bi-annual reviews of the curriculum, ensuring that it aligns with the latest developments in the field of oral health.

Furthermore, we will enhance our mechanisms for collecting and incorporating feedback from students and faculty, ensuring that their insights directly contribute to curriculum adjustments. By fostering a culture of continuous improvement and responsiveness, we aim to provide our students with an education that is both cutting-edge and deeply relevant to their future professional practice.

This commitment to continuous curriculum improvement reflects our dedication to maintaining the highest standards of academic excellence and preparing our students to meet the challenges of an ever-evolving healthcare landscape."

Criterion 1.4 Admission requirements

On **p.18**, **line 20**, the experts noted that upon reviewing the "Academic Student Data in Study Programs" presented as an appendix to the self-assessment report, "the information on "drop-out" rates and "on-time graduation" is unclear. The assessment team request the University to provide clear data on student progression for both programs, improving reporting protocols."

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"We appreciate the assessor's feedback regarding the clarity of the "drop-out" rates and "on-time graduation" data. To address this, we provide the following detailed information on student progression for both programs:

A total of 34 students have completed their studies within the designated time frame, while 5 students have taken longer than the standard duration to graduate. Importantly, there have been no cases of student drop-outs to date.

We are committed to improving our reporting protocols to ensure that data on student progression is presented clearly and comprehensively. This includes providing detailed annual reports that outline student enrollment, progression, on-time graduation rates, and any deviations from expected timelines. By enhancing the transparency and accuracy of our reporting, we aim to better inform our stakeholders and continuously improve our academic programs. Student Progress"

Response Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program:

"Regarding the clarity of the "drop-out" rates and "on-time graduation" data, for both Master Dental Science and Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Study Program may be dismissed through Drop Out (DO) established by the Rector's Decree with conditions:

- a. Resign at his/her own request
- b. Received an "E" grade in one of the courses
- c. Expelled for committing a criminal offense; and
- d. Violate the provisions set by the government and / or Hasanuddin University.

The percentage of on-time graduation of Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Study Program in the 4-year program were 8 students out of 24 students, with a percentage of on-time graduation of 33%. Until date, there are no drop-out case so the percentage of dropouts is 0%. We provide the data in the graduates study cohort. This includes annual reports that outline student enrollment, progression, on-time graduation rates, and any deviations from expected timelines. The evaluation of student progress was carried out through periodic reporting using a logbook that was checked by academic supervisors at the end of each semester, and the results were submitted to the program coordinator and re-evaluated in a joint meeting with the entire teaching team. Faculty and study programs are committed to increasing the rate of on-time graduates and conducting regular evaluations for on-going students."

Criterion 1.5 Workload and Credits

On **p.21, line 20**, it is observed for the **Master's program** that "<u>the relation workload/credits</u> is not consistent across all modules. For example, "Human Resource Management" indicates a total workload of 16 hours per semester for fieldwork, allocating 2 credits (3.627 ECTS). While, "Health Promotion", among others, states a total workload of 32 hours per

<u>semester for field work, assigning also 2 credits (3.627 ECTS). Furthermore, a total workload of 32 hours per semester does not seem to translate into 3.627 ECTS but less</u>".

Aditionally, on **p 22**, line **5**, the experts noted that "<u>upon perusal of the module descriptions</u> for the **Specialist program**, it is noted that the conversion ratio to ECTS does not apply consistently across all modules".

On the **same page, line 18**, "the experts request the University to clarify the simultaneous application of different equivalencies and the variation in workload allocation for modules with identical credits with the **Master's and Specialist programs**. They emphasise the importance of reviewing the information provided to stakeholders to ensure it reflects the programs in a consistent manner. Furthermore, the module description should clearly distinguish between credits given for various forms of supervised studies and self-study time".

Response Master of Dental Science Study Program:

"We have addressed the discrepancies in the workload-to-credits ratio across various modules, particularly those with differing contact hours yet identical ECTS allocations. Adjustments have been made to ensure consistency and accuracy, and these corrections will be implemented in the next semester's curriculum. The detailed changes can be found at the following link: [insert link].

In response to the ASIIN assessor's suggestion regarding variations in the learning process, we have standardized the allocation of learning activities for each ECTS credit as follows: 50 minutes for interactive lectures, 60 minutes for independent study, and 50 minutes for structured assignments. This allocation adheres to the credit and hour references stipulated in the Regulation of the Minister of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia No. 3 of 2020 on National Higher Education Standards, Article 19, Paragraph 1.

Link Course Module "

Response Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program:

"Regarding the feedback about the inconsistent conversion ratio to ECTS across all modules, we have revised the <u>ECTS</u> computation. 1 CP are equivalent to 2.67 ECTS. The updated total number of ECTS is 208. <u>ECTS and workload</u> have been included in the <u>module documents</u>, and resident <u>logbook</u>."

Criterion 1.5 Workload and Credits

On **p.23, line 4**, it is mentioned again for **both programs** that "<u>it is important to provide</u> further clarification on other important key performance indicators, such as the number of students who graduate on time and statistics on dropout rates".

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"We appreciate the assessor's feedback regarding the clarity of the "drop-out" rates and "on-time graduation" data. To address this, we provide the following detailed information on student progression for both programs:

A total of 34 students have completed their studies within the designated time frame, while 5 students have taken longer than the standard duration to graduate. Importantly, there have been no cases of student drop-outs to date.

We are committed to improving our reporting protocols to ensure that data on student progression is presented clearly and comprehensively. This includes providing detailed annual reports that outline student enrollment, progression, on-time graduation rates, and any deviations from expected timelines. By enhancing the transparency and accuracy of our reporting, we aim to better inform our stakeholders and continuously improve our academic programs. Student Progress"

Criterion 2 Exams: System, concept and organization

On **p.26, line 2,** it is stated for **both programs** that "<u>the experts believe that the renewal of the assessment methods could be beneficial. They specifically highlight the need for a more objective-oriented assessment system. The assessment team also points out that there are numerous new methods for evaluating highly skilled professionals, and this is an area where every higher education institution needs to continuously improve".</u>

Response Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program:

"In response to the reviewers comments, we have evaluated the existing assessment method. We have developed several <u>assessment methods</u> which are considered to be objectives such as written work, oral presentation, Multiple Choice Question and <u>national board examination</u>. As already mentioned in our first proposal, the National Board Examination is carried out nationally by bringing in examiners from all OMFS educational centers in Indonesia. This aims to standardize all graduates comes from other centers of Oral and Maxillofacial throughout Indonesia.

All the various assessment methods for each course are different depend on the ILO in module description".

Criterion 2 Exams: System, concept and organization

On **p.27, line 31**, "based on the sample of the final thesis provided for the **Master of Dental Science** study program, the team noted that there is an extensive focus on literature research. Therefore, the experts recommend that the university consider building knowledge through a more clinical practice-based approach. This approach would emphasise the development of problem-solving strategies directly applicable to real-world community health issues".

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"During the COVID-19 pandemic, our approach to student research was necessarily adapted to focus primarily on literature reviews due to the restrictions on clinical activities and direct patient interactions. This shift was essential to ensure the continuity of academic progress while adhering to health and safety protocols.

In the post-pandemic period, we have refocused our research efforts on a clinical practice-based approach. This realignment follows the program's established research roadmap, which emphasizes the development of problem-solving strategies through hands-on clinical experience. We believe this approach builds on theoretical knowledge and enhances practical skills and the ability to apply evidence-based practices in real-world settings.

To illustrate this shift, we have provided examples of thesis titles recently undertaken by our students, which reflect a strong emphasis on clinical practice and applied research. These titles demonstrate our commitment to integrating clinical experiences into our research framework, thereby addressing the recommendations made by the expert team. This transition is part of our ongoing efforts to maintain high academic standards and to prepare our graduates for the complexities of professional practice in dental science".

Criterion 3.2 Funds and equipment

On **p.32**, **line 31**, concerning the Faculty of Dentistry's collaborative approach, the experts noted that "staff exchange and participation in international consortia could be improved. They encourage the university to enhance opportunities, for example, through European Union-funded projects like ERASMUS+, HORIZON for research, or COST for the advancement of new techniques".

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"Regarding improving staff exchange and participation in international consortia, we outline the steps we have taken and our plans to enhance these areas.

International Seminar Participation: Our faculty members have actively participated as speakers in international seminars. For instance, a representative from our department was a speaker at the Malaysian Specialist Dental Public Health seminar organized by the Department of Community Dental Health in Malaysia in 2024.

Collaborative Research: We have established a joint research initiative between our Master of Dental Sciences program and the Faculty of Dentistry at Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia (UKM). This collaboration is underpinned by a memorandum of understanding, fostering a robust partnership in dental research.

International Service Community: We have undertaken international community service projects, such as providing dental care to stateless children. This initiative was a collaboration between our Master of Dental Sciences program and the Faculty of Dentistry at UKM, demonstrating our commitment to global health outreach.

Future Plans for Joint Activities: Looking ahead, we plan to expand our collaborative efforts by publishing joint articles and hosting international guest lectures in partnership

with Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia. These initiatives aim to further enhance our academic exchange and strengthen our participation in international consortia.

Through these activities, we are committed to fostering a collaborative and internationally engaged academic environment, which we believe will contribute significantly to the advancement of our Faculty of Dentistry".

Response Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program:

"In response to the reviewers comments about staff exchange and participation in international consortia, Faculty of Dentistry, Hasanuddin University are committed to improve the collaboration and participation of teaching staff. This is realized by including staff in various *international workshops*".

Criterion 3.2 Funds and equipment

Furthermore, on **p.33**, line **3**, the experts observed that "<u>It should also be verified</u>, <u>if there is a possibility to get in direct collaboration with the manufacturing industry to enlarge the scientific equipment in some research fields, such as thermocycle equipment or others".</u>

On **p.33, line 20** of the draft report, it is stated that "<u>one area for improvement identified</u> <u>in the recent audit documentation is the development of a scientific infrastructure that is fit for transdisciplinary research"</u>.

On **p.34, line 10**, the experts mentioned that "<u>it is also important to inform that a completely new hospital, including the Dental Department, is currently under construction opposite the existing building".</u>

On **p.34**, line **32**, the assessment team noted that during the meetings "<u>there were also opinions suggesting the need to improve the quality of the internet network on campus.".</u>

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"In response to the assessor's comments regarding the campus internet network, we would like to inform you that significant improvements have been made to enhance the quality of online learning for our students. Attached, you will find the internet speed test data and photographs documenting the installation of a new router, which has been implemented to expand internet coverage and ensure a more reliable and efficient network on campus. These measures have been taken to address the feedback received and to support the continued satisfaction of our students and alumni with our online services".



Figure 1 New router installation



Figure 2 Speed test internet connection

Response Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program:

"In response to the reviewers advice about internet access, Faculty of Dentistry, Hasanuddin University has improved the speed of internet access, with <u>download speed capacity reached 606.18 Mbps and upload speed reached 312.45 Mbps</u>. High-speed internet access is expected to significantly enhance student's learning and research processes by providing them with a broader range of information and resources. It allows for quicker and more efficient access to academic materials, online courses, and research databases. Additionally, it facilitates seamless collaboration with peers, educators, and researchers from around the world, fostering an environment of international cooperation and exchange of knowledge. This connectivity is crucial in preparing students to be global citizens, equipped with the latest information and skills needed in their respective fields.

In terms of technology development, we also committed to enhancing technological development and cooperation with international industries. This is shown by the involvement of one of the teaching staff, Yossy Yoanita Ariestiana, DDS., MDSc., OMFS in 2023 to <u>Osteopore</u>, <u>Singapore</u> to observe and learn the process of making customized plate and prosthetic maxillofacial implants that are biocompatible. The visit was conducted for 2 days on April 23rd and 24th, 2023.

International collaborative research with international universities continues to be developed, one of which is a collaborative research between the Faculty of Dentistry, Hasanuddin University led by Prof. Muhammad Ruslin, DDS., MS., Ph.D.,OMFS with Taiwan Medical University about "Feasibility and Preliminary Efficacy of Alpha-Calcium Sulfate Hemihydrate (α -CSH) in Socket Preservation". This research has already been

published entitled "Feasibility and Preliminary Efficacy of Alpha-Calcium Sulfate Hemihydrate (α-CSH) in Socket Preservation: Study Protocol for a Pilot Randomized Control Trial". The Faculty of Dentistry Hasanuddin University and Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program have committed to increasing internationalization by collaborating with various international institutions such as Niigata University, Japan and Toyama University, Japan. In addition, Hasanuddin University also participates as a member in the UK-Indonesia Consortium for Interdisciplinary Sciences (UKICIS) 2022 Consorsium to conduct various international research with other states in various scientific fields. Faculty of Dentistry Hasanuddin University and Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program actively conducts research under the consortium."

Criterion 4.1 Module Descriptions

On **p.36, line 4,** it is stated that "<u>there needs to be a clearer specification of the workload</u> for the different types of activities. Several modules lack module content, prerequisites, workload and specifications of reading reference material".

In addition, on **line 11**, "the experts ask the University to ensure that the information provided to stakeholders reflects the programs in a consistent manner".

On **line 14,** the experts hence emphasised that <u>"module descriptions including all required module information need to be published in full detail (e.g. in PDF format) to be accessible to all interested stakeholders. The experts ask the program coordinators to review and publish the module handbooks for the Master's and Specialist study programs accordingly".</u>

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"For completeness, we have included the module details in the following link: [Link Course Module].

Additionally, we have developed a Student Guidebook to provide students with a comprehensive overview of the assessment and development processes. By taking these steps, we aim to create a more inclusive and participatory environment that empowers students to contribute meaningfully to the continuous improvement of our programs. link here"

Response Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program:

"In response to the reviewers comments about the need of clearer specification of the workload for the different types of activities, we have revised the improved the workload for each module, as attached in the <u>Resident logbook</u>. The updated of workload of each module is attached in <u>Workload assessment</u>.

Also, improvements to module content, prerequisites, workload and specifications of reading reference materials have also been made in each module description, as attached to: Module descriptions.

In terms of all required module information need to be published in full detail (e.g. in PDF format) to be accessible to all interested stakeholders, this is already available on the student guide in official website of faculty".

Criterion 5 Quality management: quality assessment and development

On **p.39, line 23**, the experts asked **both programs** "to improve reporting protocols, stating the process, dates and number of respondents".

Furthermore, on the **same page, line 26**, the assessment team expressed their strong belief that "<u>student participation at all levels of the decision-making process should be strengthened</u>".

Response Master of Dental Sciences Study Program:

"We acknowledge the importance of enhancing student involvement in the evaluation and curriculum development processes. Moving forward, we will ensure thorough documentation of these activities, including detailed protocols for conducting curriculum evaluations, descriptions of the processes for gathering student feedback, documentation of the activities, and measures to increase the number of respondents.

These evaluations will be systematically conducted at the beginning and end of each semester to ensure continuous improvement and responsiveness to student input. By doing so, we aim to strengthen student participation at all levels of the decision-making process, thereby ensuring that their feedback is not only valued but also effectively integrated into the development and enhancement of our programs. This approach aligns with our commitment to maintaining high-quality educational standards and fostering a collaborative academic environment."

Response Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program:

"In order to ensure the quality of the learning process, the program has implemented an online survey. The assessment instrument used is a questionnaire using google drive form distributed to all students and lecturers and conducted every final semester. The survey form both for student and lecturer's satisfaction can be accessed through google form by the period of September 8th-21st, 2023.

Survey of student's satisfaction results on <u>63 students</u> obtained satisfaction regarding the learning process, an average of 75.7% (very good) and 24.3% (good), surveys related to facilities and infrastructure averaged 66% (very good), 30.7% (good), and 3.3% (fair), regarding student activities 23.35% (very good), 55% (good), 19% (fair), and 2.65% (poor), regarding improving student welfare, with results of 54.4% of students getting scholarships and 45.6% not getting scholarships.

<u>Lecturer satisfaction survey's result</u> with <u>21 respondents</u> show that the institution provides support in the implementation of the study program 71.4% (very good), 28.6% (good). The institution provides a comfortable working atmosphere and directs and guides at work 57.1% (very good), 42.9% (good). Facilities and infrastructure provided by the institution 52.4% (good), 47.6% (very good), Institutional support for seminars and

workshops to improve lecturers' competence 52.4% (very good), 42.9% (good), Ability and accuracy of academic staff in serving and providing information to lecturers 61.9% (very good), 28.6% (good), Institutional support for lecturers in carrying out education is 76.2% (very good), 19% (good). Institutional support for lecturers in carrying out research 52.4% (very good), 42.9% (good), Institutional support for lecturers in carrying out community service programs 76.2% (very good), 23.8% (good).

Performance of students and graduates

The results of the graduate's performance survey which received 91 respondents gained by the period of September 2023 - January 2024. The form of <u>Student and Graduates'</u> <u>Performance Survey</u> can be accessed through the google form and gained by the period of July 2023. <u>Instance Satisfaction of Graduates Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery' Survey</u> were responded by <u>9 stakeholders on July 2023</u>. Stakeholders gave excellent assessments to graduates specifically for attitudes and communication skills. They hope that more graduates from the study program will serve to meet the need for specialist dentists in every region to remote areas.

Involvement of stakeholders

The results of the Graduate Survey with 11 respondents show that 3 important elements in Oral and Maxillofacial, which are the relevance of the knowledge that has been obtained to current employment, satisfaction with social service and research activities, also facilities and infrastructure showed that they are satisfied with the current condition".

The experts also reviewed the following additional information that were integrated into the University's statement:

- 1. Monitoring Master of Dental Student
- 2. Master of Dental Science Alumni

F Summary: Expert recommendations (16.08.2024)

Taking into account the additional information and the comments given by the University the experts summarize their analysis and **final assessment** for the award of the seals as follows:

Degree Programme	ASIIN Seal	Maximum duration of accreditation			
Master Dental Sciences	With requirements for one year	30.09.2030			
Specialist Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery	With requirements for one year	30.09.2030			

Requirements

For both programs

- A 1. (ASIIN 1.3) Ensure the programs develop a curriculum mapping clearly delineating the sequence and progression between modules by semester.
- A 2. (ASIIN 1.5, 4.1) Revise the module handbooks ensuring that SKS to ECTS conversion is applied consistently.
- A 3. (ASIIN 4.1) Ensure that all module descriptions are made publicly available, including reviewed ECTS conversions.

For the Master Dental Sciences

A 4. (ASIIN 1.1) Develop a detailed plan on how to reinforce the transdisciplinary profile of the program as recommended by the World Health Organization's Global strategy and action plan on oral health.

Recommendations

For both programs

- E 1. (ASIIN 1.3) It is recommended to further enhance internationalisation efforts by expanding student mobility and actively participating in research and educational associations and conferences, both at regional and international levels.
- E 2. (ASIIN 1.3) It is recommended that the curriculum be continuously improved to keep pace with the dynamic advancement of research in oral health.

- E 3. (ASIIN 1.4, 1.5, 5) It is recommended to improve reporting protocols, ensuring that student progression data is presented clearly and comprehensively.
- E 4. (ASIIN 2) It is recommended that the assessment methods be renewed to implement a more objective-oriented system, as this could be beneficial for improving the overall evaluation process.
- E 5. (ASIIN 3.1, 3.2) It is recommended that staff exchange and participation in international consortia, such as ERASMUS+, HORIZON, and COST, be strengthened.
- E 6. (ASIIN 3.2) It is recommended to enhance collaboration with the manufacturing industry to enlarge the scientific equipment in some research fields, such as thermocycler or others.
- E 7. (ASIIN 3.2) It is recommended to develop scientific infrastructure that is fit for transdisciplinary research.
- E 8. (ASIIN 5) It is recommended that student participation at all levels of the decision-making processes be strengthened.

For the Master Dental Sciences

- E 9. (ASIIN 1.1) It is recommended to divide the learning outcomes into two blocks, a common one, aimed at the health research needs of the community, and a specialized one, to be focused on the relevant speciality issues of each specialization.
- E 10. (ASIIN 1.2) It is recommended to consider a change in the name of the program to "Master in Oral Health Sciences" in order to expand opportunities for transdisciplinary collaboration.
- E 11. (ASIIN 2) It is recommended that the University further enhance its curriculum by incorporating a greater emphasis on clinical practice sciences, as the sample of final theses provided shows a significant focus on literature research.

G Comment of the Technical Committee 14 – Medicine (09.09.2024)

Assessment and analysis for the award of the ASIIN seal:

The Technical Committee discusses the requirements and recommendations proposed by the expert group, which are accepted by the Technical Committee without making any changes.

The Technical Committee 14 - Medicine recommends the award of the seals as follows:

Degree Programme	ASIIN Seal	Maximum duration of accreditation				
Master Dental Sciences	With requirements for one year	30.09.2030				
Specialist Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery	With requirements for one year	30.09.2030				

Requirements

For both programs

- A 1. (ASIIN 1.3) Ensure the programs develop a curriculum mapping clearly delineating the sequence and progression between modules by semester.
- A 2. (ASIIN 1.5, 4.1) Revise the module handbooks ensuring that SKS to ECTS conversion is applied consistently.
- A 3. (ASIIN 4.1) Ensure that all module descriptions are made publicly available, including reviewed ECTS conversions.

For the Master Dental Sciences

A 4. (ASIIN 1.1) Develop a detailed plan on how to reinforce the transdisciplinary profile of the program as recommended by the World Health Organization's Global strategy and action plan on oral health.

Recommendations

For both programs

- E 1. (ASIIN 1.3) It is recommended to further enhance internationalisation efforts by expanding student mobility and actively participating in research and educational associations and conferences, both at regional and international levels.
- E 2. (ASIIN 1.3) It is recommended that the curriculum be continuously improved to keep pace with the dynamic advancement of research in oral health.
- E 3. (ASIIN 1.4, 1.5, 5) It is recommended to improve reporting protocols, ensuring that student progression data is presented clearly and comprehensively.
- E 4. (ASIIN 2) It is recommended that the assessment methods be renewed to implement a more objective-oriented system, as this could be beneficial for improving the overall evaluation process.
- E 5. (ASIIN 3.1, 3.2) It is recommended that staff exchange and participation in international consortia, such as ERASMUS+, HORIZON, and COST, be strengthened.
- E 6. (ASIIN 3.2) It is recommended to enhance collaboration with the manufacturing industry to enlarge the scientific equipment in some research fields, such as thermocycler or others.
- E 7. (ASIIN 3.2) It is recommended to develop scientific infrastructure that is fit for transdisciplinary research.
- E 8. (ASIIN 5) It is recommended that student participation at all levels of the decision-making processes be strengthened.

For the Master Dental Sciences

- E 9. (ASIIN 1.1) It is recommended to divide the learning outcomes into two blocks, a common one, aimed at the health research needs of the community, and a specialized one, to be focused on the relevant speciality issues of each specialization.
- E 10. (ASIIN 1.2) It is recommended to consider a change in the name of the program to "Master in Oral Health Sciences" in order to expand opportunities for transdisciplinary collaboration.
- E 11. (ASIIN 2) It is recommended that the University further enhance its curriculum by incorporating a greater emphasis on clinical practice sciences, as the sample of final theses provided shows a significant focus on literature research.

H Decision of the Accreditation Commission (24.09.2024)

Assessment and analysis for the award of the subject-specific ASIIN seal:

The Accreditation Commission discusses the requirements and recommendations proposed by the expert group and the Technical Committee and decides to adjust requirement A2 and recommendation E5.

Regarding requirement A2 and the allocation of ECTS points, the Accreditation Commission believes that the focus of the requirement needs to be placed on the importance of ensuring that the awarded ECTS reflect the students' actual workload.

With respect to recommendation E5, the Accreditation Commission decides to remove HORIZON as an example of an international consortium, as it may not be applicable within the Indonesian context. However, ERASMUS+ and COST are considered relevant examples that UNHAS could take into account.

In all other respects, the Accreditation Commission concurs with the assessments provided by the experts and the Technical Committee, without any additional changes.

The Accreditation Commission decides to award the following seals:

Degree Programme	ASIIN Seal	Maximum duration of accreditation			
Master Dental Sciences	With requirements for one year	30.09.2030			
Specialist Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery	With requirements for one year	30.09.2030			

Requirements

For both programs

- A 1. (ASIIN 1.3) Ensure the programs develop a curriculum mapping clearly delineating the sequence and progression between modules by semester.
- A 2. (ASIIN 1.5, 4.1) Ensure that the awarded ECTS points are aligned with the students' actual workload.
- A 3. (ASIIN 4.1) Ensure that all module descriptions are made publicly available, including reviewed ECTS conversions.

For the Master Dental Sciences

A 4. (ASIIN 1.1) Develop a detailed plan on how to reinforce the transdisciplinary profile of the program as recommended by the World Health Organization's Global strategy and action plan on oral health.

Recommendations

For both programs

- E 1. (ASIIN 1.3) It is recommended to further enhance internationalisation efforts by expanding student mobility and actively participating in research and educational associations and conferences, both at regional and international levels.
- E 2. (ASIIN 1.3) It is recommended that the curriculum be continuously improved to keep pace with the dynamic advancement of research in oral health.
- E 3. (ASIIN 1.4, 1.5, 5) It is recommended to improve reporting protocols, ensuring that student progression data is presented clearly and comprehensively.
- E 4. (ASIIN 2) It is recommended that the assessment methods be renewed to implement a more objective-oriented system, as this could be beneficial for improving the overall evaluation process.
- E 5. (ASIIN 3.1, 3.2) It is recommended that staff exchange and participation in international consortia, such as ERASMUS+ and COST, be strengthened.
- E 6. (ASIIN 3.2) It is recommended to enhance collaboration with the manufacturing industry to enlarge the scientific equipment in some research fields, such as thermocycler or others.
- E 7. (ASIIN 3.2) It is recommended to develop scientific infrastructure that is fit for transdisciplinary research.
- E 8. (ASIIN 5) It is recommended that student participation at all levels of the decision-making processes be strengthened.

For the Master Dental Sciences

- E 9. (ASIIN 1.1) It is recommended to divide the learning outcomes into two blocks, a common one, aimed at the health research needs of the community, and a specialized one, to be focused on the relevant speciality issues of each specialization.
- E 10. (ASIIN 1.2) It is recommended to consider a change in the name of the program to "Master in Oral Health Sciences" in order to expand opportunities for transdisciplinary collaboration.

E 11. (ASIIN 2) It is recommended that the University further enhance its curriculum by incorporating a greater emphasis on clinical practice sciences, as the sample of final theses provided shows a significant focus on literature research.

I Fulfilment of Requirements (26.09.2025)

Analysis of the experts and the Technical Committee 14 (16.09.2025)

Requirements

For both programmes

A 1. (ASIIN 1.3) Ensure the programs develop a curriculum mapping clearly delineating the sequence and progression between modules by semester.

Initial Tre	atment
Experts	Fulfilled Justification: UNHAS has developed curriculum maps for both programs and presented them in a visual format. These visualizations organize the modules by semester, reflecting a logical progression of knowledge and skills aligned with the program learning outcomes and competency development across academic stages. The experts appreciate the effort to provide visual representations of the curricula and that these have been made accessible through the respective websites. They also suggest that incorporating a time frame based on the weeks of the academic year could give students a better overview.
TC 14	Fulfilled Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts without any changes.

A 2. (ASIIN 1.5, 4.1) Ensure that the awarded ECTS points are aligned with the students' actual workload.

Initial Tre	atment
Experts	Fulfilled
	Justification: For both programs, UNHAS has recalculated the credit
	allocations to reflect actual student workload, including contact hours,
	independent study, and assessment activities. Revised Indonesian credit
	values were then converted to ECTS using a standardized formula, in
	accordance with the Regulation of the Minister of Education on National
	Standards for Higher Education. To ensure that the assigned credit points
	align with the student workload, the university states that several
	monitoring mechanisms are employed, including reviews of teaching
	schedules, analysis of student logbooks and assignments, and periodic
	evaluations at both program and faculty levels. The experts are satisfied
	with these measures, but suggest that ECTS credits on the final transcript of
	records could be presented in rounded values.

TC 14	Fulfilled
	Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts without any
	changes.

A 3. (ASIIN 4.1) Ensure that all module descriptions are made publicly available, including reviewed ECTS conversions.

Initial Tre	eatment								
Experts	Fulfilled								
	Justification: UNHAS has made the module descriptions for both programs								
	publicly accessible on their respective websites and has ensured								
	consistency in ECTS conversion. After reviewing the provided links for t								
	Master Dental Sciences and the Specialist Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery,								
	the experts confirm that the module descriptions are available for access.								
TC 14	Fulfilled								
	Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts without any								
	changes.								

For the Master Dental Sciences

A 4. (ASIIN 1.1) Develop a detailed plan on how to reinforce the transdisciplinary profile of the program as recommended by the World Health Organization's Global strategy and action plan on oral health.

Initial Tre	atment
Experts	Fulfilled
	Justification: UNHAS has presented a comprehensive action plan to
	reinforce the transdisciplinary profile of the Master Dental Sciences. The
	experts appreciate the implementation of specific strategies and initiatives
	to integrate Oral Health Science, as outlined in the plan. They are impressed
	by the university's forward-looking approach and look forward to following
	and observing its continued development.
	As an overall reflection, the experts hope their recommendations have been
	helpful to UNHAS. Based on the evidence presented, the university has made
	excellent progress in incorporating some of them to their day-to-day
	practice.
TC 14	Fulfilled
	Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts without any
	changes.

Decision of the Accreditation Commission (26.09.2025)

Degree programme	ASIIN-label	Subject-specific label	Accreditation until max.		
Master Dental Sciences	All requirements fulfilled	-	30.09.2030		
Specialist Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery	All requirements fulfilled	-	30.09.2030		

Appendix: Program Intended Learning Outcomes and Curricula

According to the self-assessment report and the provided "Curriculum Documents", the following intended learning outcomes shall be achieved:

Master of Dental Sciences

		INTENDED LEARNING OUTCOMES (ILOs)
A44'4	ILO-1	Be able to become graduates who have an attitude of religious mindset, empathy, responsibility, nationalism, social sensitivity, discipline and also the capability to collaborate within the ethical and legal standards
Attitude		Be able to become professional graduates by internalising principles, norms, and academic ethics that have a responsible attitude combined with a sense of independence, struggle, and entrepreneurship
		Be able to master the theories and application theories of health policy and law, service management science and health promotion in the field of dentistry
Knowledge/Un derstanding		Be able to master the theory and application theory of research methods, research ethics, biostatistics and health epidemiology.
	ILO-5	Be able to master the theory and application theory of biomedical, basic dentistry and clinical dentistry
CL:II-		Be able to study, develop and use science and technology in accordance with their expertise based on rules, procedures, scientific ethics, and humanities values.
Skills	_	Be able to develop networks, make decisions and take responsibility for the completion of work and learning appropriately and independently in their field of competence
		Be able to analyze and synthesize dental health problems, basic dentistry, and clinical dentistry scientifically using science and technology.
Competence	11 ()_9	Be able to conduct research and publication of research results on dental health, basic dentistry, and clinical dentistry in international scientific journals.

The following curriculum map is presented for the *Master of Dental Sciences*:

1. Major Dental Health Service Management

MAJOR	SEMESTER 1			SEMESTER 2			SEMESTER 3			SEMESTER 4		
	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	CP	ECTS
	Philosophy of Dentistry	1	1.81	Health Sociology and Anthropology	1	1.81	Information Systems and Marketing Management	2	3.63	Seminar on Thesis Research Results	4	7.25
	Research Methodology and Biostatistics	2	3.62	Risk management	2	3.6	Law of Dental Health Service Management	1	1.81	Thesis	9	16.32
DENTAL	Molecular Biology and Immunology	2	3.62	Health Promotion	2	3.6	Managerial Economics and Dental Health financing	2	3.63	Publication	5	9.07
HEALTH SERVICE MANAGEMENT	Management and Policy of Dental and Oral Health Services	1	1.81	Human Resource Management	2	3.6	Dental Health Planning Policy and Advanced Strategic Management	2	3.63			
				Proposal of Qualification	2	3.6	Advanced Health Service Management	2	3.63			
				Residency 1	1	1.81	Residency 2	1	1.81			
	TOTAL ECTS=	б	10.88	TOTAL ECTS=	10	18.13	TOTAL ECTS=	10	18.13	TOTAL ECTS=	18	32.64
Beha	Behavioral and Social Sciences Basic Biomedical Sciences Clinical Sciences Basic Medical and Dental Sciences											

2. Major Oral Biomedics

N. Ton	SEMESTER	1		SEMESTE	R 2		SEMESTER 3			SEMESTE	R 4	
MAJOR	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS
	Philosophy of Dentistry	1	1.81	Oral Anatomy	2	3.63	Proposal of Qualification	5	9.07	Seminar on Thesis Research Results	4	7.25
	Research Methodology and Biostatistics	2	3.62	Oral Physiology	2	3.63	Research on Thesis	2	3.63	Thesis	9	16.32
	Molecular Biology and Immunology	2	3.62	Oral Microbiology	2	3.63				Publication	5	9.07
ORAL BIOMEDICS	Management and Policy of Dental and Oral Health Services	1	1.81	Dental Pharmacology	2	3.63						
				Research Methodology 2	2	3.63						
	TOTAL ECTS=	6	10.88	TOTAL ECTS=	10	18.13	TOTAL ECTS=	7	12.69	TOTAL ECTS=	18	32.64

Behavioral and Social Sciences Basic Biomedical Sciences Basic Medical and Dental Sciences

MATOR	SEMESTE	R 1		SEMESTE	R 2		SEMESTER 3			SEMESTE	R 4	
MAJOR	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	СР	СР	ECTS		СР	ECTS
	Philosophy of Dentistry	1	1.81	Dental Materials Science	2	3.63	Proposal of Qualification	5	9.07	Seminar on Thesis Research Results	4	7.25
	Research Methodology and Biostatistics	2	3.62	Dental materials and biomechanics test	2	3.63	Research on Thesis	2	3.63	Thesis	9	16.32
	Molecular Biology and Immunology	2	3.62	Herbal and Marine materials and application	2	3.63				Publication	5	9.07
DENTAL BIOMATERIALS	Management and Policy of Dental and Oral Health Services	1	1.81	Nanomaterials and application	2	3.63						
JOMATERIALS				Bone and tissue engineering materials	2	3.63						
				Digital Dentistry	2	3.63						
				Research Methodology 2	2	3.63						
	TOTAL ECTS=	б	10.88	TOTAL ECTS=	14	25.39	TOTAL ECTS=	7	12.69	TOTAL ECTS=	18	32.64

4. Major Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery

	SEMESTER	1		SEMESTE	R 2		SEMESTER 3			SEMESTE	R 4	
MAJOR	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS
	Philosophy of Dentistry	1	1.81	Oral pathology/oral medicine oromaxillofacial region	1	1.81	Salivary Gland and Oromaxillofacial Nerve Disorders	1	1.81	Seminar on Thesis Research Results	4	7.25
	Research Methodology and Biostatistics	2	3.62	Oromaxillofacial Infection, Emergency Infection and Trauma	1	1.81	Surgical and non-surgical theories of TMJ disorders	2	3.63	Thesis	9	16.32
ORAL AND	Molecular Biology and Immunology	2	3.62	Principles of dentoalveolar surgery, management of pain and anxiety	1	1.81	Benign and Malignant Oromaxillofacial Tumors	2	3.63	Publication	5	9.07
MAXILLO- FACIAL SURGERY	Management and Policy of Dental and Oral Health Services	1	1.81	Preprosthetic Surgery and Dentomaxillofacial Implants	1	1.81	Surgical principles of congenital cleft lip and palate disorders	2	3.63			
				Oromaxillofacial Trauma	1	1.81	Oromaxillofacial regional reconstruction and microsurgery	2	3.63			
				Proposal of Qualification	1	1.81	Principles of orthognathic, osteodistraction and craniofacial surgery	2	3.63			
	TOTAL ECTS=	6	10.88	TOTAL ECTS=	6	10.88	TOTAL ECTS=	11	19.94	TOTAL ECTS=	18	32.64
	Behavioral an	d Soc	ial Scie	ences Basic Bi	ome	lical Sc	iences Basic Medica	l and	Dental	Sciences		

5. Major Orthodontic

NA TOR	SEMESTER	1		SEMESTER	R 2		SEMESTER 3			SEMESTEI	R 4	
MAJOR	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS
	Philosophy of Dentistry	1	1.81	Orthodontic Fundamentals	1	1.81	Orthodontic Radiography	1	1.81	Seminar on Thesis Research Results	4	7.25
	Research Methodology and Biostatistics	2	3.62	Occlusion	1	1.81	Orthodontic Treatment Theory	2	3.63	Thesis	9	16.32
	Molecular Biology and Immunology	2	3.62	Professionalism	1	1.81	Corrective Orthodontic Theory	2	3.63	Publication	5	9.07
ORTHODONTIC	Management and Policy of Dental and Oral Health Services	1	1.81	Growth and development	1	1.81	Interdisciplinary Orthodontics	2	3.63			
				Orthodontic Biomechanics	2	3.63	Elective Orthodontics	1	1.81			
				Proposal of Qualification	2		Preventive & Interceptive Orthodontics	2	3.63			
	TOTAL ECTS=	6	10.88	TOTAL ECTS=	8	14.51	TOTAL ECTS=	10	18.13	TOTAL ECTS=	18	32.64

Behavioral and Social Sciences Basic Biomedical Sciences Basic Medical and Dental Sciences

Maior Prosthodontic

144 TOD	SEMESTER	1		SEMESTE	R 2		SEMESTER 3			SEMESTER 4		
MAJOR	COURSE	CP	ECTS	COURSE	CP	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	CP	ECTS
	Philosophy of Dentistry	1	1.81	Prosthodontics Theory I	2	3.63	Implant Prosthodontics Theory	1	1.81	Seminar on Thesis Research Results	4	7.25
	Research Methodology and Biostatistics	2	3.62	Prosthodontics Theory II	2	3.63	Complex Prosthodontics Theory I	2	3.63	Thesis	9	16.32
	Molecular Biology and Immunology	2	3.62	Maxillofacial Prosthodontics Theory	2	3.63	Complex Prosthodontics Theory II	2	3.63	Publication	5	9.07
PROSTHODONTIC	Management and Policy of Dental and Oral Health Services	1	1.81	Logopedy	2	3.63	Complex Prosthodontics Theory III	2	3.63			
				Proposal of Qualification	2	3.63						
	TOTAL ECTS=	6	10.88	TOTAL ECTS=	10	18.13	TOTAL ECTS=	7	12.69	TOTAL ECTS=	18	32.64

Behavioral and Social Sciences Basic Biomedical Sciences Basic Medical and Dental Sciences

7. Major Periodontic

MATOR	SEMESTER	R 1		SEMESTE	R 2		SEMESTER 3			SEMESTER 4			
MAJOR	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	CP	ECTS	
	Philosophy of Dentistry	1	1.81	Periodontal Diseases / Abnormalities	2	3.63	Advanced periodontal surgery theory	2	3.63	Seminar on Thesis Research Results	4	7.25	
	Research Methodology and Biostatistics	2	3.62	Theory of non- surgical periodontal therapy	2	3.63	Management of patients with special needs	2	3.63	Thesis	9	16.32	
	Molecular Biology and Immunology	2	3.62	Fundamentals of periodontal surgery	2	3.63	Basic theory of dental implant therapy	2	3.63	Publication	5	9.07	
PERIODONTIC	Management and Policy of Dental and Oral Health Services	1	1.81	Multidisciplinary therapy	1	3.63	Book review of periodontology journal	2	3.63				
				Proposal of Qualification	2	3.63							
				Review of Periodontology	1	18.13							
	TOTAL ECTS=	б	10.88	TOTAL ECTS=	10	36.27	TOTAL ECTS=	8	14.51	TOTAL ECTS=	18	32.64	

8. Major Endodontic

	SEMESTER	1		SEMESTE	R 2		SEMESTER 3			SEMESTER 4		
MAJOR	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS
	Philosophy of Dentistry	1	1.81	Cariology I	2	3.63	Bleaching tooth	2	3.63	Seminar on Thesis Research Results	4	7.25
	Research Methodology and Biostatistics	2	3.62	Cariology II	2	3.63	Regenerative Endodontics	2	3.63	Thesis	9	16.32
ENDODONTIC	Molecular Biology and Immunology	2	3.62	Basis of adhesion technology	2	3.63	Endodontic Instrumentation	2	3.63	Publication	5	9.07
ENDODONTIC	Management and Policy of Dental and Oral Health Services	1	1.81	Dentin-pulpa complex	2	3.63	Dental Restorations	2	3.63			
				Proposal of Qualification	2	3.63						
	TOTAL ECTS=	6	10.88	TOTAL ECTS=	10	18.13	TOTAL ECTS=	8	14.51	TOTAL ECTS=	18	32.64

9. Major Pediatric Dentistry

144 TOD	SEMESTER 1			SEMESTE	R 2		SEMESTER 3		ECTS COURSE 3 63 Seminar on Thesis	SEMESTI	ER 4	
MAJOR	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS	COURSE	CP	ECTS	COURSE	СР	ECTS
	Philosophy of Dentistry	1	1.81	Hard tissue problems and hard tissue oral pathology	2	3.63	Behavior of normal and special needs children	2	3.63	Seminar on Thesis Research Results	4	7.25
	Research Methodology and Biostatistics	2	3.62	soft tissue problems and oral soft tissue pathology	2	3.63	Telemedicine dentistry	2	3.63	Thesis	9	16.32
PEDIATRIC	Molecular Biology and Immunology	2	3.62	Craniofacial development	2	3.63	Marine dentistry	3	5.44	Publication	5	9.07
DENTISTRY	Management and Policy of Dental and Oral Health Services	1	1.81	Malocclusion and problems	2	3.63						
				Proposal of Qualification	2	3.63						
	TOTAL ECTS=	6	10.88	TOTAL ECTS=	10	18.13	TOTAL ECTS=	7	12.69	TOTAL ECTS=	18	32.64

Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program

		INTENDED LEARNING OUTCOMES (ILOs)
		Have a quality of religion, uphold human values, respect cultural and religious diversity,
Attitude	ILO-1	be able to cooperate, have social sensitivity, obey the law, in order to internalize
rittide	120 1	academic values, norms, and ethics, with attitudes and responsibilities in their fields of
		expertise.
	ILO-2	Able to master behaviour and social sciences, biomedical theory, clinical medicine, clinical
		dentistry applications, physical diagnostics, and radiographic comprehensively to support oral maxillofacial surgery medical treatment.
	ILO-3	Able to master the theory and its application in infectious diseases, congenital disorders,
Knowledge/Un	.20 0	trauma, neoplasms, cysts, growth and development, degenerative, medically
derstanding		compromised disorders, mental barriers (mentally handicapped), physical barriers
		(Physically handicapped) and emergency management in the maxillofacial region.
	ILO-4	Able to master the theory and its application in dentoalveolar surgery, pre-prosthetics,
		osteodistraction, salivary gland abnormalities, neurocranial tissue, TMJ and maxillofacial
		implants.
	ILO-5	Able to work in specific and complex areas of professional expertise, make independent decisions based on logical, critical, systematic, creative, and comprehensive thinking, as
		well as able critically evaluate the results of work and decisions made, compile them into
		a report the results of studies in the form of publications and also communicate the
Skills		results of studies and innovation works for professional development.
	ILO-6	Able to improve professional skills through training and work experience, have a
		responsibility and a quality of team leader to improve the quality of resources in the
		development of organizational strategic programs in conjunction with a professional code
	ILO-7	of ethics that can be used as a contribution in the development of national policies Able to evaluate the outcome of biological, psychological, and social examinations,
	120-7	develop interpretations of patient radiographic examination results and determine the
		diagnosis of oromaxillofacial abnormalities.
	ILO-8	Able to perform medical procedures for dentoalveolar surgery, pre prosthetics,
	ILU-8	osteodistractions, infectious diseases, congenital abnormalities, trauma, neoplasms,
Competence		cysts, growth and development and degenerative disorders, salivary gland abnormalities,
		neurocranial tissue, TMJ, dentomaxillofacial implants, patients with medically
		compromised, medically handicap, physically handicap, reconstruction and rehabilitation and emergency management in the field of oromaxillofacial surgery.
		Able to develop marine biota materials through technology development to overcome
	ILO-9	oromaxillofacial skeletal abnormalities with the bone substitute method.

The following curriculum map is presented for the *Oral and Maxillofacial Surgery Specialist Study Program*:

HASANUDDIN UNIVERSITY ORAL AND MAXILLOFACIAL SURGERY COURSES

			Semester 8	the second second]			
(12 CP;32.43 ECTS)	Reconstruction and Rehabilitation of Oromaxilofacial Deformity (3 CP/5.44 ECTS)	Practice 15: Jaw Fracture Treatment and Management of TMD (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Practice 16: Mayor Cyst / Odontogenic Tumor Management (2 CP/8.96 ECTS)	Practice 17: Orthognatic and Osteodistraction Surgery/Hard Tissue Reconstruction (Osteotomy, Genioplasty) (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Final Scientific Work (Thesis) (5 CP/9.07 ECTS)				
				GF74.40 EC131	Semester 7				
(10 CP;31.46 ECTS)	Disgnaty (2 CP/3.63 ECTS)	Skill Lab 6: Tumor Skill Lab (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Skill Lab 7: Orthognatic and TMJ Skill Lab (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Practice 10: Dental Implant Treatment (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Practice 11: Dentoalveolar Surgery and Other Cases Treat Under General Anesthesia (Biopsy, Caldwell- lucprocedure Squesterectomy, Odontectomy, Plate Removal, Necrotomy, Parotidectomy) (1 CP/ 4.48 ECTS)	Practice 12: Unilateral Cleft Lip Reconstruction (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Practice 13: Bilateral Cleft Lip Reconstruction (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Practice 14: Cleft Palate Reconstruction (Palatoplasty, Gnatoplasty, Veloplasty) (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Skill Lab 8: Community Serv Skill Lab Overse Visiting Fellow CP/1.81 ECTS)
				Semester 6					
(10 CP/23.46 ECTS)	Special Care Dentistry (2 CP/3.63 ECTS)	Practice 8: Oral and Jaw Tumor Surgery / Patology Anatomy Examination (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Practice 9: Dentoalveolar Trauma Management (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Marine Biota Materials (4 CP/7.25 ECTS)	Skill Lab 4 : Congenital Disorder Skill Lab (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Skill Lab 5: Trauma Skill Lab (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)			
		Semeste	r 5						
(9 CP; 22.62 ECTS)	Salivary Gland Disorder, Neurocranial Disorder and TMD (2 CP/3.63 ECTS)	Skill Lab 2: Out Patient Management (2 CP/3.63 ECTS)	Practice 6: Minor Cyst/Salivary Gland Disorder Management (1 P; 4.48 ECTS)	Practice 7: Pre- Prosthetic Surgery, Endodontic Surgery, and Gingival Surgery (1 CP; 5.44 ECTS)	Dental Implant (3 CP; 5.44/ECTS)				
			Semester 4			J			
(10 CP; 42.13 ECTS)			10 CP/42.13 ECTS)					
40 CD:		Semeste	r 3						
(10 CP; 42.13 ECTS)		Basic Surgery (10 CP/42.13 ECTS)					
(9 CP; 24.32 ECTS)	Practice 4: Odontectomy of Lower Wisdom Teeth (2 CP/8.96 ECTS)	Practice 5: Odontectomy of Upper Wisdom Teeth, Canine, and Other Tooth Impaction (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Oromaxillofacial	Dentoalveolar Surgery (3 CP/5.44 ECTS)					
	ii ii	GP/4.40 EC (S)		Semester 1			1		
(8 CP; 25,17 ECTS)	Biomedicine (2 CP/3.63 ECTS)	Behavior and Humaniora (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Skill Lab 1: Dentoalveolar Surgery (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Practice 1: Open and Close Method Extraction (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Practice 2: Emergency of Infection and Trauma (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Practice 3: In Patient Management (2 CP/8.96 ECTS)			
	General Science	e Medica	l and Dental Science		ecialistic Clinical Spi	ecialistic			