

ASIIN Seal

Accreditation Report

Bachelor's Degree Programme Doctor of Dental Medicine

Specialist Programmes Prosthodontics, Prosthodontics Specialist Endodontics, Endodonthics Specialist Periodonthics, Periodonthics Specialist

Provided by Universitas Hasanuddin

Version: 24 September 2024

Table of Content

Α	About the Accreditation Process	3
P	endidikan Dokter Gigi	3
D	octor of Dental Medicine Programme	3
В	Characteristics of the Degree Programmes	5
С	Peer Report for the ASIIN Seal	9
	1. The Degree Programme: Concept, content & implementation	9
	2. The degree programme: structures, methods and implementation	20
	3. Exams: System, concept and organisation	25
	4. Resources	26
	5. Transparency and documentation	30
	6. Quality management: quality assessment and development	32
D	Additional Documents	34
E	Comment of the Higher Education Institution (15.11.2022)	35
F	Summary: Peer recommendations (23.11.2022)	38
G	Comment of the Technical Committee 14 - Medicine (02.12.2022)	40
	Technical Committee 14 – Medicine (02.12.2022)	40
Н	Decision of the Accreditation Commission (09.12.2022)	41
I	Fulfilment of Requirements (24.09.2024)	43
	Analysis of the experts and the Technical Committee (09.09.2024)	43
	Decision of the Accreditation Commission (24.09.2024)	50

A About the Accreditation Process

Name of the degree programme (in original language)	(Official) Eng- lish transla- tion of the name	Labels applied for	Previous accredita- tion (issu- ing agency, validity)	Involved Technical Commit- tees (TC) ²
Pendidikan Dokter Gigi	Doctor of Den- tal Medicine Programme	ASIIN	IAHEEH: BDS/DDM 27.08.2021 AUN QA: 29.12.2018	FA 14
Pendidikan Dokter Gigi Spesialis Prostodonsia	Prosthodon- tics, Prostho- dontics Spe- cialist Pro- gramme	ASIIN	IAHEEH 02.10.2016	FA 14
Pendidikan Dokter Gigi Spesialis Konservasi	Endodontics, Endodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	ASIIN	IAHEEH 05.03.2017	FA 14
Pendidikan Dokter Gigi Spesialis Pe- riodonsia	Periodonthics, Periodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	ASIIN	IAHEEH 24.12.2016	FA 14
Date of the contract: 04.02.2021				
Submission of the final version of the self-assessment report: 27.01.2022				
Date of the online visit: 24.05.2022-26.05.2022				
Peer panel:				
Prof. Dr. Holger Jentsch, University Leipzig				

¹ ASIIN Seal for degree programmes

² TC: Technical Committee for the following subject areas: TC 14 - Medicine

Prof. Dr. Raden Darmawan Setijanto, Universitas Airlangga, Indonesia	
Dr. med. dent. Thomas Koch, Medical University Graz	
Darin Hulwani Rinaldi, student at Universitas Airlangga	
Representative of the ASIIN headquarter: Paulina Petracenko	
Responsible decision-making committee: Accreditation Commission for Degree Pro-	
grammes	
Criteria used:	
European Standards and Guidelines as of May 15, 2015	
ASIIN General Criteria, as of December 10, 2015	
Subject-Specific Criteria of Technical Committee 14 – Medicine - WFME Global Standards 2015	

B Characteristics of the Degree Programmes

a) Name	Final degree (original/Eng- lish translation)	b) Areas of Spe- cialization	c) Corre- sponding level of the EQF ³	d) Mode of Study	e) Dou- ble/Joint Degree	f) Duration	g) Credit points/unit	h) Intake rhythm & First time of offer
Doctor of Den- tal Medicine Programme	Bachelor of Medicine Medical Doctor (M.D.)	Dentistry	6 7	Full time	/	11 Semes- ter	174 SKS/ 345,34 ECTS	August/annually & Started in 1983
Prosthodontics Specialist Pro- gramme	Sp.Pros/ Prosthodontic Specialist	Prosthodontic	8	Full time	/	6 Semester	49 SKS/ 154.16 ECTS	August and January / twice a year & starting in 2010
Endodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	Sp.KG/ Endodontic Spe- scialist	Endodontic	8	Full time	/	6 Semester	56 SKS/ 164.21 ECTS	August and January / twice a year & Started in 2010
Periodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	Sp.Perio/ Periodontic Specialist	Periodontic	8	Full time	/	6 Semester	45 SKS/ 123.15 ECTS)	August and January / twice a year & Started in 2012

For the programme <u>Doctor of Dental Medicine</u> the institution has presented the following profile on their programme's website:

"The Dentistry Education Study Program consists of 2 stages, namely the academic (Bachelor of Dental science) and professional stages. The professional stage is a continuation of the academic stage. Admission of professional students is carried out at each academic stage of the judicial period. Student activities at the professional stage begin with the 2week professional student admission orientation program. Furthermore, students will undergo clerical activities for 4 semesters in 9 departments, namely 8 clinic-based departments and 1 community-based department (IKGM). At the end students receive the professional stage that is Doctor of Dental Medicine.

³ EQF = The European Qualifications Framework for lifelong learning

The competencies that must be achieved by professional students are in accordance with the SKDGI which is described in the curriculum for the professional stages, by carrying out the One Visit Department (OVD) program. Clinical learning activities at the stage of the Dentist profession are supported by the quality of the UNHAS Oral and Dental Hospital which is adequate and fully accredited. Professional student activities are guided directly by experienced professionals with qualifications of 20 professors, 54 Doctors or Sp-2 equivalent and 34 Masters or Sp-1 equivalents to produce dentists who are competent and have quality, professionalism and responsibility.

Students who have completed the stages of a series of educational activities will take part in the UKP2DG Student Competency Test for the Dentist Profession Program."

For the <u>Specialist Program Prosthodontics</u> the institution has presented the following profile on their programme's website:

"Prosthodontic Specialist Program at Hasanuddin University is the first and only prosthodontic specialist study program in eastern Indonesia. Formed in January 15th 2010, Prosthodontic Specialist Program already released many graduates spread around Indonesia, while at the same time responding to the challenges of the community's needs regarding the services of dentist specialists in prosthodontics, especially in eastern Indonesia.

In undergoing education at Prosthodontic Specialist Program, residents are required to complete education in six semesters, which includes comprehensive basic knowledge and knowledge of dentistry in the field of prosthodontics. During the audit, the peers learn that the programme has recently been changed into a six-semester programme due to requirements of the government. There are several specialist requirement that must be fulfilled by residents such as dental implants, TMD (Temporomandibular disorder) therapy and maxillofacial prostheses. For taking the final exam, Residents are required to complete a thesis as part of the educational process.

The education process at Prosthodontic Specialist Program is centered at Hasanuddin University Oral and Dental Hospital for case recruitment. In supporting the educational process, Prosthodontic Specialist Program has 10 teaching staff consisting of 6 consultants and 4 lecturers. Prosthodontic Specialist Program has also collaborated with Ministry of Health which allows residents to get scholarships while attending education."

For the <u>Specialist Program Endodontics</u> the institution has presented the following profile on their programme's website:

"To create a quality study program, in line with the vision and mission of the University and the Faculty, Endodontic Specialist Program has a vision: 'To become an Endodontic Specialist Program and produce Endodontic Specialist who are ethical and virtuous in accordance with national standards and international perspective.' To realize this vision, the mission is formulated as follows, first: to organize a student-centered learning process to produce endodontic specialist graduates who excellent in science and technology and fear God Almighty, secondly to conduct research that focuses on superior study programs. in the development of maritime materials to be used in dental and oral health services, especially in the field of endodontic specialist and finally in carrying out community service with promotive, preventive, curative and rehabilitative approaches in the field of endodontic specialists. The objectives of the Endodontic Specialist program are to improve the quality of endodontic specialist education services; improve the quality of research results and the competitiveness of endodontic specialist graduates as well as increase the productivity and creativity of community service programs based on endodontic specialist services. The Endodontic Specialist Program has advantages in the fields of research and community service based on maritime continents, as well as excellence in the field of endodontic surgery expertise. Supported by the latest facilities and technology that support specialist practice processes such as microscopes, endomotors, apex locators, rotary instruments, ultrasonic endodontics and many more.

The educational curriculum of the Endodontic Specialist Program has been designed in accordance with the curriculum standards of the Indonesian Endodontic Collegium to shape the personality of a dentist who specializes in specialist hard skills, is capable of soft skills, and has high ethical attitudes and behavior. Teaching and education are carried out by permanent lecturers who hold 2nd Degree of Endodontic Specialist (consultant) and doctoral degrees from well-known universities both at domestically and abroad, and have extensive experience in endodontic practices. The learning method is directed to become Student Centered Learning, which means that students are learning objects and lecturers are learning facilitators, so it is hoped that the learning method can provide understanding and learning experiences for students."

For the <u>Specialist Program Periodontics</u> the institution has presented the following profile on their programme's website:

"Periodontia is a branch of dentistry that studies the periodontium (gingiva, alveolar bone, periodontal ligament and cementum) in healthy and pathological conditions, as well as taking preventive, care, regenerative and maintenance measures, in order to maintain and restore optimal function of the stomatognathic system. The study program was first opened in 2010 and is the only periodontics specialist study program in East Indonesia. Teaching and learning activities in our Specialist Educational Program are carried out supported by adequate and sophisticated facilities and infrastructure. The Specialist Educational Program students have high academic excellence and have various achievements on a national and international scale. The graduates and alumni are expected to work for various agencies in regions throughout Indonesia to promote health and contribute to advancing oral health."

C Peer Report for the ASIIN Seal

1. The Degree Programme: Concept, content & implementation

Criterion 1.1 Objectives and learning outcomes of a degree programme (intended qualifications profile)

Evidence:

- Objective-module-matrices
- Self-Assessment Report
- Study plans of the degree programmes
- Module handbooks
- Student Handbook
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The auditors refer to the respective ASIIN Subject-Specific Criteria (SSC) of the Technical Committee Medicine (TC 14) as a basis for judging whether the intended learning outcomes of the programmes as defined by Hasanuddin University (UNHAS) correspond with the competencies outlined in the SSC. For this, UNHAS has provided descriptions of all Programme Learning Outcomes (PLO) and Intended Learning Outcomes (ILO) as well as matrices that show the relations between PLO and ILO and how the PLO and ILO are substantiated in the courses of the study programmes. In addition, the module descriptions include the learning outcomes of each individual module. After carefully reviewing these documents and discussing them with the programme coordinators, the auditors come to the following conclusion:

The ILO for all programmes are well-anchored, binding and easily accessible to the public as they are presented on the website, in the student handbook and in the Diploma Supplements of each programme. Furthermore, the ILO of every programme reflect the respective level of the European Qualification Framework (EQF) and are categorically in line with the learning outcome examples described in the ASIIN Subject-Specific Criteria (SSC) of the Technical Committee Medicine. The peers remark that the overall learning outcomes for all programmes give a moderate overview of the skills and competencies of the graduates of each programme. However, the peers also agree they do not offer a detailed insight into the intended qualifications of the graduates due to the generic description of the learning outcomes and the insufficient reference to technically specialized qualifications. Since dental graduates require a significant amount of practical practice and skills, it is crucial that these skills are also embedded in the ILOs of the degree programs. For instance, it is unclear to the peers how the ILO of the DDM (Doctor of Dental Medicine) programme "Be competent to perform a professional dentist in accordance with ethical and legal standards based on the five principles of PAN-CASILA" can be achieved and measured. Furthermore, the peers deem that the function and correlation of each ILO to the respective programme should be revised and clarified. In other words, each learning objective must be tailored to the specific program of study and illustrate the minimum set of skills that graduates of the programs should have achieved. Eventually, it should be visible how every ILO contributes to the achievement of the final qualification profile of every graduate. In this context, the peers also recommend emphasising the correlation between the ILOs and the curriculum of each programme in the documents. According to the peers, the curriculum must be able to explain that tooth extraction competence must be formed by courses or modules that produce the main competencies of tooth extraction skills i.e. mannequin tooth extraction skills course in the first stage, and human tooth extraction skills in the second stage respectively. At the same time, students must also receive courses on basic medical science, such as anatomy, biology, pathology, bio-chemistry, physiology as several courses that support the main competencies in a synergistic manner. Thus, the content and learning objectives of every module should mirror the ILO of the respective programme.

Similarly, the peers review the learning objectives for each module as presented in the module handbooks for all programmes and find that these are equally generic and lacking reference to technically specialized qualifications. For example, it does not become evident from the descriptions or the learning objectives of the module "Marine Science in Dentistry" in the DDM programme, what the exact content of this module is and which qualifications the students acquire in this context. Moreover, in the module "Comprehensive OSCE" it is stipulated that the students require the following competencies:

- 1. "Be able to explain and simulate history taking, diagnosis, management of disorders/diseases related to oral soft tissues
- 2. Be able to explain and simulate history taking, diagnosis, management of disorders/diseases related to dental hard tissues
- 3. Be able to explain and simulate history taking, diagnosis, management of disorders/diseases related to periodontal tissue

- 4. Be able to explain and simulate history taking, diagnosis, management of disorders/diseases related to growth and development
- 5. Be able to explain and simulate the management of disorders/diseases related to public dental health"

In this example, as in many other modules, the peers are missing more detailed information about the exact competencies of the students, especially with regard to the technical skills in the respective area.

Regarding the employment options of the graduates, UNHAS states that graduates of the <u>DDM programme</u> "are mostly well accepted as an employee in the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Defense, the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education, to perform medical services in the government hospital and become a lecturer in universities as well as to perform dental services in a private clinic." In the <u>Prosthodontic Specialist Programme</u>, graduates should be able to become professional prosthodontists, lecturers, researchers, prosthodontic consultants, or managers who are able to compete internationally. Similarly, graduates of the <u>Periodontics and Endodontics Specialist Programmes</u> should be qualified to work as professionals and consultants in their respective fields, become leaders or managers, and take over positions as lecturers and researchers. The peers are satisfied with the outlined professions and believe that the intended qualification profiles allow the students to take up one of the listed occupations.

The program coordinators inform the peers during the audit that the stakeholders are continuously involved in the formulation and development of the ILOs and the curriculum. The peers are glad to hear this but think that the ILOs as well as the curricula are not sufficiently adapted to the state of the art of the respective fields. Thus, all programmes are very much attached to traditional topics and methods within dentistry. The peers, therefore, believe that the ILO and the curricula should be stronger oriented towards current and international developments in the respective fields of dentistry. They suggest, for example, that the existence of an academic mobility program at Hasanuddin University (including international research collaboration, student inbound, student outbound, international lecture) should be utilized to update the curriculum of dentistry. Furthermore, the study program coordinator must be able to develop a curriculum that has been standardized by the collegium and not only implementing the conventional curriculum standards from the collegium. This aspect will be addressed in more detail in criterion 1.3.

The peers conclude that both the overall intended learning objectives for each programme as well as the learning objectives for every module should be specified and focused more on the technical competences. Furthermore, the programme coordinators should make sure that the curriculum and the ILOs are in line with each other.

Criterion 1.2 Name of the degree programme

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report
- Diploma Supplements

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The names of both degree programmes follow the rules for naming study programmes set by the Indonesian Ministry of Education. The peers hold the opinion that the English translation and the original Indonesian names of the programme Doctor of Dental Medicine, Prosthodontic Specialist Program, Endodontics Specialist Program, and Periodontics Specialist Program correspond with the intended programme and learning outcomes as well as the main course language.

In the case of the DDM programme, the university explains that the title "Doctor" was introduced since it is in accordance with the general term for dental education programs acknowledged by the American Dental Association (ADA). In addition, the program adapted this name because students pursuing this program have similar education curriculums and receive similar training set by the accreditation standards for dental education programs. Based on this explanation, the peers find the title of the programme satisfactory.

Criterion 1.3 Curriculum

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report
- Study plans of the degree programmes
- Module Handbooks
- Objective-Module-Matrices
- Student handbook
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The curriculum of the <u>DDM programme</u> consists of two stages: the bachelor and the clerkship degree, which comprise altogether general science, basic and clinic medical and dental science, applied dental science, and dental public health. The Bachelor degree should be completed in seven semesters for 3.5 years with 38 courses. In the first academic year, the students are taught basic knowledge, basic medical and dental science. Between the third and seventh semester, students deepen their knowledge in clinical dental sciences. During the eight until eleventh semester, students complete the professional dental education (clerkship degree) at a hospital or a community-based dentist. The detailed curriculum for this programme as well as all programmes is attached in the annex of this report. Overall, the students need to have achieved 174 Indonesian credit points, which equal 345.34 ECTS, at the end of the DDM programme. The curriculum in its current form was introduced in 2019 after an extensive evaluation procedure, in which various lecturers, students and staff from each department as well as other stakeholders developed a new curriculum in a series of meetings. Overall, the peers believe that curriculum of the DDM programme is well structured and will produce students that are capable of carrying out the professions as carved out in the graduation profiles. Nonetheless, the peers think that the current curriculum is rather traditional. In this context, they are missing a stronger orientation and adaptation to current discourses and developments in international research. For example the peers note that there is a need for a bridging course between Bachelor degree (study with mannequins) and Professional degree (study with patients as subject). Bridging courses are recommended courses or internship modules or operator assistants in order to add to the student experience after graduating from the Bachelor Program. In addition, the peers recommend that emergency skills should be enhanced in the DDM programme since they are not sufficiently covered in the modules. Furthermore, the peers are missing detailed training of international approved obturation techniques in the endodontic programme and new methods of diagnostic in about all programmes based on international literature review and evaluation.

The peers also discuss the practical training of the students. They learn that next to several field studies, every student does, for example, between three to eight scaling and root planning treatments. Each practical treatment is accompanied by a verbal discussion of the case with the relevant course instructor. In addition, every student practices at dummies. The peers are glad to hear that there are fixed guidelines that regulate how many treatments every student in the respective programme has to complete during their studies and deem these numbers as sufficient.

In preparation for the audit, the HEI submits documents (SAR, module handbooks, etc.) according to which, the specialist programmes are 5 semester programmes. However, during the audit, the peers are informed that the program coordinators changed the curriculum of all specialist programmes at the beginning of 2022 into 6-semester programmes. The reason for this were new study guidelines issued by the College mid of 2021, which

provided for an extension of the duration of study by one semester from five to six semesters. The three specialist programmes then revised their curriculum in accordance with the Collegium curriculum regulation into 6-semester curriculum, which were then approved by the Academic Senate of UNHAS in the early of 2022. Therefore, commencing the academic year of 2022, the three specialist programmes applied the new 6-semester curriculum. After the audit, the HEI has submitted new study plans and module handbooks for the six semester programmes. The following assessment is based on the new curricula.

According to the self-assessment report, the curriculum of the <u>Prosthodontics Specialist</u> <u>Programme</u> has been agreed upon by respective stakeholders and approved by the Indonesian Medical Council (IMC). The curriculum covers six areas within Prosthodontics: Removable Dentures, Fixed Dentures, Gnathology, Gerodontology, Maxillofacial and Dental Implant. The students study these seven areas by exploring developments in molecular biology and nanotechnology, in the basic sciences of Dentistry such as Prosthodontic Aesthetics, and in general dentistry and medicine. In the first academic year, students are taught basic medical and dental science related to prosthodontics complex cases with the Student-Centered Learning (SCL) method. In the second year, students will learn the basics of prosthodontics clinics and start working on case recruitment in real patients and in the final year, students will treat more complex cases and complete the thesis and final examination. At the end of the Programme, all students must take the comprehensive test held by the study program and pass the national board examination held by the Indonesian Prosthodontic Collegium in order to get a prosthodontist license.

During the audit, the peers inquire how UNHAS ensures and assesses the difference in level between the DDM programme and the specialist programmes. The program coordinators explain that students of the specialist programmes are required to complete more difficult cases and treatments than in the DDM programme. For example, in Prosthodontics, every student has to carry out at least three cases at real patients. Most of these treatments are in the fields of implantation and maxillofacial treatments. The peers are content to hear that specialist students need to carry out more advanced and demanding treatments, however, they would recommend increasing the number of treatments that an Prosthodontics student has to complete. In addition, they suggest that students treat more cases with crowns, bridges, veneers, and different partial prostheses.

The peers conclude that the curriculum of the Prosthodontic specialist programme teaches the indispensable skills and competencies in the field of Prothodontics. They agree that graduates will be able to carry out one of the professions as outlined in the learning objectives. Nevertheless, as in the DDM programme, the peers agree that the programme coordinators base the curriculum too much on the specifications of the collegium, and would like to see a wider range of subjects and methods. Furthermore, the curriculum should also be stronger adapted to current trends in international research. Overall, the peers clearly see room for improvement in both the scope and the level of the curriculum of the Prosthodontic specialist programme as well as the other specialist programmes.

The university explains in the self-assessment report that the <u>Endodontics specialist pro-</u><u>gramme</u> was developed together with stakeholders from the branch of Science and Technology in Endodontics and approved by the Indonesian Medical Council. Central topics that are covered in the Endodontics programme are diseases/abnormalities of dental hard tissues, diseases/disorders of pulp and periapical tissue, conventional endodontics (pain, endodontic flora, trauma, medicaments, and emergencies) and surgical endodontics, dental restorations including aesthetic restorations, and post-endodontic restorations. Endodontics is also associated with other branches of clinical dentistry, such as Endodontics–Periodontics, Endodontics–Orthodontics, Endodontics–Surgery, Gerodontology, Barodontology, and Trauma. In terms of practical training and clinical skills, students are dealing with hard tissue disease/disorder/damage with non-invasive and invasive approaches, including restoration, prevention, temporary and permanent restoration (direct, indirect), periapical pulp tissue disease with conventional endodontics, surgical endodontics, and esthetic treatments.

The structure of the curriculum is similar to the other specialist programmes: In the first year, students learn basic medical and dental science related to endodontics complex cases. In the second year, they are taught the basics of endodontics and in the third year are handling more complex cases and complete the final thesis and examination. Finally, they must pass the National board examination license in order to practice as an endodontist. During the audit, the peers learn that every student of the Endodontics programme needs to acquire 14 national credit points in the field of root canal treatment or restoration or in chirurgical treatments. The peers are satisfied with the number and form of treatments that Endodontics students have to carry out.

The peers conclude that the curriculum of the Endodontics specialist programme teaches the indispensable skills and competencies in the field of Endodontics. They agree that the graduates will have enough skills be able to carry out one of the professions as outlined in the learning objectives. Nevertheless, as in the other programmes, the peers agree that the curriculum is too much based on the specifications of the collegium, and would like to see a wider range of subjects and methods. Furthermore, the curriculum should also be stronger adapted to current trends in international research. Again, the peers clearly see room for improvement in both the scope and the level of the curriculum of the Endodontics specialist programme.

According to the self-assessment report, the curriculum of the <u>Periodontics Specialist Pro-</u><u>gram</u> is based on national curriculum standards that were published by the Indonesian Society of Periodontology and validated by Indonesian Medical Council. The core of the Periodontics Specialist Program consists of the study of periodontium (gingiva, alveolar bone, periodontal ligament and cementum) in healthy and pathological conditions and develops preventive, care and maintenance measures to maintain and restore optimal function of the stomatognathic system. Other aspects that are covered in the study programme are the diagnosis and management of periodontal diseases/disorders, consisting of non-surgical periodontal treatment and periodontal medicine; therapeutic, regenerating, reconstructive and aesthetic periodontal surgical treatment; and periodontal prosthetics and dental implants.

In the first year, students will learn about basic specialities, academic periodontics, research design, and scientific publication activities. During the second year, students are trained in integrated and will start working with patients and preparing to compose the research proposals. Students in the third year will work on more complex cases in the field of periodontia and complete theses and comprehensive exams. Finally, students need to pass the National Competency Test held by the Indonesian Collegium of Periodontists, consisting of MCQ-CBT and OSCE and the national board examination administered by the Indonesian Collegium of Periodontists. As in the other specialist programmes, the students need to complete a certain number of practical treatments. One student reports that she carried out 25 practical cases during her studies. The peers are glad to hear that the students have the opportunity to carry out such a high number of treatments in the programme.

The peers conclude that the curriculum of the Periodontics specialist programme teaches the indispensable skills and competencies in the field of Periodontics. They agree that the raduates will have sufficient skills to be able to carry out one of the professions as outlined in the learning objectives. Nevertheless, as in the other programmes, the peers agree that the curriculum is too much based on the specifications of the collegium, and would like to see a wider range of subjects and methods. Thus, the peers agree that the curriculum that has been set by the collegium has to be developed, by adding updates to research on dental implant materials, learning more updates on CAD (Computer Added Design)/CAM (Compiter Added Machine) in accordance with the development of medicine worldwide.

Furthermore, the curriculum should also be stronger adapted to current trends in international research. To conclude, the peers also see here room for improvement in both the scope and the level of the curriculum of the Periodontics specialist programme.

Upon the question of the peers regarding the frequency and the procedure of evaluations of the curricula in all programmes under review, the program coordinators inform them that all curricula are evaluated and updated every four to five years. The evaluations and developments consider changes in sciences and technology, the review of previous academic evaluations, and the feedback and input from stakeholders collected by online questionnaires. Thus, both internal (e.g. faculty leaders, students, lecturers, and supporting staff) and external stakeholders (e.g. alumni, hospitals, and education experts from the Association of Indonesian Dentistry Faculty) are involved in the evaluation process. This is also confirmed in the discussions with the stakeholders. Furthermore, the peers are told that the curricula are heavily influenced by the norms of the Indonesian Dental Collegium. The program coordinators explain that all universities in Indonesia, which offer dental programs, have to follow the standards specified the collegium. For this reason, UNHAS reports to be restricted in the development of curricula of dental programmes as many subjects are prescribed by the collegium. The peers understand that these national stipulations have to be followed by Indonesian universities, however, according to the peers' knowledge, these guidelines do not dictate the entire curriculum and focus mostly on the qualifications that graduates need to have acquired but not the subjects per se. Consequently, every dental department in Indonesia still has a certain degree of freedom that allows the department to continuously develop and adapt curricula to current trends in inter-/national research. Therefore, the peers stipulate that the curricula of all programmes should be adapted to the state-of-the-art research in order to ensure that all programmes are up-todate. Furthermore, they urge the program coordinators to align the programme contents more closely with current discourses and developments in international research.

Criterion 1.4 Admission requirements

Evidence:

- Educational Guidelines: Doctor of Dental Medicine
- Educational Guidelines: Dental Specialist Programs
- Statistical Information on the Number of Applicants and Students

- Self-Assessment Report
- Student Handbook
- Websites

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

According to the self-assessment report, admission of new students to UNHAS is possible via different modes of entry (national and local modes). The different modes of entry are designed not only to select the top-quality students from high schools, but also to provide opportunities for high school students from all over Indonesia, especially those from rural areas.

For students of <u>Doctor of Dental Medicine</u>, there are the following different modes of entry:

- 1. SNMPTN (National Entry Selection of Public Universities), based on academic performance during high school.
- 2. SBMPTN (Joint Entry Selection of Public Universities), based on a nationwide selection test that is held every year for university candidates.
- 3. Local admission, these students are selected under special consideration of their education, local origin, social background, achievements in sports or science, and financial means.
- 4. International Selection Entrance, for students from abroad who can provide at least a Certificate of Graduation.

The entire enrollment procedure as well as regulations are described in the Educational Guidelines and on the website of UNHAS.

For each academic year, the university determines the ratio of students admitted through these four ways. Generally, the number of applications is considerably higher than the number of admitted students. For the academic year 18/19, there were 4305 applicants while 152 were admitted into the DDM programme, and in 20/21 there were 2494 applicants while 188 were admitted.

For the <u>specialist programs</u> there are admission twice per year. Basic requirements for students are a minimum GPA of 2.50 in DDM and that they did not exceed the maximum number of ten study years. In addition, prospective students will go through a series of tests, including English proficiency tests, personality tests, dental knowledge tests, and interviews. Applicants also must have written recommendations from professional organizations as well as physical health and drug-free certificates from a government hospital. The entire enrollment procedure as well as regulations are described in the Educational Guidelines and on the website of UNHAS.

In contrast to the DDM programme, the numbers of applications and admission are much lower in the specialist programmes and more congruent with each other. In the academic year 20/21 17 students applied while 13 were admitted into the Periodontics Programme. In the same year, there were 18 applicants for the Endodontics programme of whom 12 were admitted. In the Prosthodontics programme, 23 students applied for the programme while 16 were accepted. Overall, it is visible that the numbers of both applicants and admission increased slightly over the last six years in the specialist programmes.

The tuition fees for the programmes are determined by the Ministry of Finance based on a proposal from UNHAS. There are different levels for these fees, depending on the parents' income. For students from underprivileged families, there is no tuition fee. Furthermore, there are various options for scholarships that cover the tuition fees.

The admission website informs potential students in great detail about the requirements and the necessary steps to apply for admission into the programmes. Since the rules are based on decrees by the ministry of education and on the university's written regulations, the auditors deem them binding and transparent. They confirm that the admission requirements support the students in achieving the intended learning outcomes.

Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 1:

UNHAS submits a comment, which is quoted in chapter E of this report.

However, from the perspective of the peers, the university's statement does not provide sufficient information or evidence that the critical issues mentioned above have been removed/improved. Thus, the peers further insist that UNHAS formulates the learning objectives precisely and particularly with regard to the students' technical skills, and so that they describe the academic, subject-specific and professional classification of the qualifications gained in the degree programmes. In addition UNHAS hat to make sure that the curriculum is regularly assessed with the participation of all stakeholders and adapted to developments in international research. Moreover, UNHAS has to ensure that the learning objectives and the curriculum are aligned. In case of the Doctor of Dental Medicine programme Finally, the peers recommend to improve the emergency skills of the students.

Criterion not fulfilled.

2. The degree programme: structures, methods and implementation

Criterion 2.1 Structure and modules

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report
- Module Handbooks
- Objective-Module-Matrices
- Annex Academic Mobility
- Discussions during the audit
- Study plans of the degree programmes

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The structure of the programmes under review is clearly outlined on the subject specific website for each study programme. The programmes consists of modules, which comprise a sum of teaching and learning. After reviewing the subsequently submitted module handbooks and study plans based on the six semester programmes, the peers note that the order of the modules has changed in the new curricula. For example in the prosthodontic and periodontic progamme, modules from the sixth semester has been shifted to the second semester. The new order of the modules seems arbitrary to the peers as the modules now do not seem to build on each other coherently. In order to ensure that the learning outcomes can be reached and that students do not face any difficulties with the feasibilities of their studies, the sequence of the modules must be revised in the specialist programmes so that they build on each other in a coherent manner.

Internship / Practical Work

As already outlined in criterion 1.3, the students of all programmes need to carry out a certain number of practical treatments on both dummies and real patients throughout their studies. Additionally, in order to receive the clerkship degree, which is a mandatory part of the DDM programme, students need to work for the last four semester of their studies at hospitals and/or local dentists and gain practical first-hand experience. As mentioned in 1.3, the peers recommend increasing the number of treatments that students have to complete during their studies. In particular, they recommend that students are confronted with more complex and advanced cases so that they will be prepared for such cases in real life. Thus, it seems that students of the DDM programme only treat a few advanced cases throughout their studies. The peers argue that it is important, though, that

general dentistry graduates should have gone through difficult cases as well, not just when they do their specialization, since they will already be able to work as dentists after graduating from the DDM programme.

Mobility

In order to support the international mobility of students the faculty has established several student exchange programmes with international universities and offers organizational and financial support for students studying abroad. The faculty has collaborations with 16 countries and 37 universities or organizations. However, the peers learn that there are only student exchange programmes within the <u>DDM programme</u>. In this framework, students can spend a semester abroad, for example, at the Federal University of Para in Brazil or the VU University Medical Center in the Netherlands. The programme coordinators especially underline the successful and intense collaboration with Japanese universities such Hiroshima University and Hokkaido University. The programme coordinators report that per year two to three students of the DDM programme participate in the exchange program with Japanese universities. In exchange, there are frequently incoming students from Japan. During the covid19-pandemic, UNHAS and Japanese partner universities organized virtual exchange sessions between the students. The peers are satisfied with the exchange opportunities for the DDM students.

While there are no exchange programs in the specialist programmes, students nonetheless receive the opportunity to share their work in an international context. According to the self-assessment report, every student of the specialist programmes must participate twice in national and once in international conferences during their studies. Students can present a case report, literature review, or a poster. For example, in the Endodontics programme, students participated in the IFEA World Endodontic Congress in Chennai, India, in 2021. In the Prosthodontics programme, the most recent conference was the Joint Research Symposium Programme held at the University Malaya and China Medical University in 2021. Students of the Periodontology programme had the chance to take part in the International Medical Devices and Technology Conference (IMEDITEC) in Malaysia in 2021. In addition, UNHAS states that they regularly invite guest lecturers both from Indonesia as well as abroad to enrich the curriculum and widen the students' academic horizons. In the field of Porosthodontics, for instance, the department organized an online seminar, in which the prosthodontist Dr. Cortino Sukotjo, DDS., Ph.D., from the University of California Los Angeles (UCLA) delivered a topic on "CAD-CAM in Dentistry". Upon the question of the peers whether the guest lecturers are also involved in the development of the curriculum, the program coordinators reply that the feedback of guest lecturers is always welcome and adopted into the curricula. For example, after on online lecture in 2020 about clinical studies on modifications of protocols, the faculty included this reference in their teaching but

not the methodology itself. The peers are glad to hear that UNHAS is regularly organizing guest lecturers but recommend that the research of these guest lecturers is included stronger into the curricula of the programmes. Thus, the peers would like to see more clearly how the guest lectures, the student exchanges, and the students' participation in international conferences contribute to the development of the programmes and the students' knowledge as well.

Criterion 2.2 Work load and credits

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report
- Study plans of the degree programmes
- Samples of module assessment
- Survey of student satisfaction
- Module descriptions
- Discussions during the audit
- Student handbook

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

Based on the National Standards for Higher Education of Indonesia (SNPT), UNHAS uses the national credit point system, in which one credit point equals 1.32 ECTS points in the <u>DDM</u> <u>programme</u>. In comparison to the ECTS credit system, where 1 credit point may consist of 25-30 hours of workload, it is determined that one national CP consists of 50 minutes contact time, 60 minutes structured assignment, 60 minute of independent study each week for 16 weeks period or equivalent eight hours in a day for a week. In the case of practicum field study, research, workplace study, or clerkship one CP consists of 170 minutes of practical session or equivalent 8 hours in a day for a week. Thus, one CP corresponds to 45,3 hours of student workload. However, in the applied dental science section of the <u>DDM program</u>, the ECTS ratio increases above the normal ratio because the actual number of hours of student activity is based on daily work in the dental clinic, i.e., eight hours per day according to the Association of Indonesian Dentistry Faculty. This results in one CP that is equivalent to 3.56 ECTS.

In the specialist programmes, the correlation between national CPs and ECTS points is slightly different: Here one CP corresponds to 1.81 ECTS. The average number of ECTS points per semester varies a bit among the specialist programmes. In the Prosthodontics programme, the average number of ECTS per semester is 37.44 ECTS, while in the Periodontics programme, students acquire on average 28.26 ECTS points per semester. In the

Endodontics programme, the average number of ECTS per semester amounts to 32.84 ECTS points.

The peers are glad to see that the amount and composition of the workload is described in detail for every module in the module handbook. Furthermore, comparing the objectives and the content, the workload defined for the single modules in general seems to be realistic for the peers. The students confirm this impression.

The program coordinators inform the peers that every second semester they carry out evaluations in order to assess the students' progress with their studies. If they recognize that a student's grades are worsening, they will contact the student and inquire the reasons for the decline. The peers are content to hear that the students' performance is closely reviewed so that it is ensured that the workload is manageable.

Criterion 2.3 Teaching methodology

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report
- Module Handbooks
- Discussion during the Audit
- Appendix Dentistry including Teaching Methodologies

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The staff members of UNHAS apply various teaching and learning methods such as lecture, small group discussion, project based learning, case based learning & discussion, Student Oral Case Analysis (SOCA), and Journal reading/journal appraisal. Particularly interesting is the Chair side teaching (CST), where student and instructor attend the patient to discuss the case and demonstrate a clinical procedure, and simulation based learning, where students practice clinical skills at a dental phantom/simulator. The peers appreciate the diversity of teaching methods and believe that they ensure that the course objectives and the overall intended learning outcomes are achieved.

In the specialist programmes, it is furthermore a mandatory part of the curriculum that students are trained in academic research and writing. The programme coordinators add that they regularly offer workshops on finding and applying the correct research methodology for their own projects.

In summary, the peer group judges the teaching methods and instruments to be suitable to support the students in achieving the intended learning outcomes. In addition, they confirm that the study concept of all both programmes comprises a variety of teaching and learning forms as well as practical parts that are adapted to the respective subject culture and study format. It actively involves students in the design of teaching and learning processes (student-centred teaching and learning).

Criterion 2.4 Support and assistance

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report
- Student handbook
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

Hasanuddin University offers a comprehensive advisory system for all students. Each student is assigned an academic advisor who monitors their student's academic performance and assists them in creating a plan of study. Every student should consult their advisor at least three times per semester. Furthermore, when writing the final thesis, every student will be supported by two thesis advisors, who provide full guidance in carrying out the thesis, starting from finding research ideas, writing proposals, conducting research, writing the report, and preparing publication articles. UNHAS also offers students counselling services through mental health specialists such as psychologists and a help center. Moreover, students can apply for a range of financial support: DDM students, for example, can apply for several scholarships offered from Non-Government Organizations, the private sector or the government. Specialist students have an opportunity to get funds from the ministry of health. In terms of future career planning, UNHAS organizes Job Career Events every semester, where students can talk to different companies about their career interests and submit their job applications directly.

Students confirm in the discussion with the peers that the advisory system works very well, that they meet their academic advisors regularly and that they always may contact them personally for support or advice. In general, students stress that the teachers are open minded, communicate well with them and take their opinions and suggestions into account and changes are implemented if necessary.

The peers notice the good and trustful relationship between the students and the teaching staff; there are enough resources available to provide individual assistance, advice and sup-

port for all students. The support system helps the students to achieve the intended learning outcomes and to complete their studies successfully and without delay. The students are well informed about the services available to them.

Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 2:

UNHAS submits a comment, which is quoted in chapter E of this report.

However, from the perspective of the peers, the university's statement does not provide sufficient information or evidence that the critical issues mentioned above have been re-moved/improved. Thus, the peers insist that UNHAS has to ensure that the learning objectives and the curriculum are aligned. Furthermore for the specialist programmes, the peers recommend to increase the number of treatments that the students have to complete during their studies. In addition, the experts suggest that guest lectures and international collaborations are given greater consideration in the program development.

Criterion not fulfilled.

3. Exams: System, concept and organisation

Criterion 3 Exams: System, concept and organisation

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report
- Student handbook
- Module Handbooks
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

According to the Self-Assessment Report, the students' academic performance is evaluated through various forms of assessments. These methods include quizzes, clinical skills laboratory, individual and group assignments, student logbooks, project presentations, and final-term exams. Each module is assigned certain types of assessment, which are communicated to the students on the first day of the course and can be accessed on a specific page for each module/course on the student platform www.sikola.unhas.ac.id. Furthermore, the types of assessment for each module are indicated in the respective module handbook of the programme. Nevertheless, the peers recommend expanding the information on the form of examination in the module handbooks since currently only abbreviations of the examinations are listed in the handbooks. For example, in the module "Oral Rehabilitation" the only information referring to the assessment are "MCQ and OSCE" (i.e. Multiple Choice Question-Test and Objective structured clinical examination).

To illustrate the correlation between the types of assessment and the ILOs, the university provides a table for each programme illustrating how each form of assessment contributes to achieving the ILOs. The peers are glad to see the variety of examination used in each programme and agree that they are adequate to assess the student's achievement of the individual ILOs. The students confirm that all forms of examination are manageable.

In order to be permitted to the final exams, students must have attended at least 80% of the course sessions and completed a certain number of practical cases. Students, who fail the final exam, have opportunity to retake the final exam in the end of course period of the following terms. Overall, students can retake an exam up to two times.

The peers review the logbooks and the portfolios submitted by the HEI. According to them the documents prove that the level of the students' academic performance and the modules' contents is sufficient for the respective programme. However, as mentioned in 1.3 the peers agree that the level of the curriculum and the requirements for the students should be enhanced. Consequently, students should be confronted with more advanced and complex cases during their studies.

Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 3:

UNHAS submits a comment, which is quoted in chapter E of this report.

However, from the perspective of the peers, the university's statement does not provide sufficient information or evidence that the critical issues mentioned above have been re-moved/improved. Thus, the peers further insist that UNHAS ensures that the form and procedure of the respective examination method is communicated transparently and bindingly to the students.

Criterion not fulfilled.

4. Resources

Criterion 4.1 Staff

Evidence:

• Self-Assessment Report

- Staff Handbook
- Module Handbooks
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

At UNHAS, the staff members have different academic positions. There are professors, associate professors, assistant professors and lecturers. The academic position of each staff member is based on research activities, publications, academic education, supervision of students, and other supporting activities. For example, a full professor needs to hold a PhD degree.

In the Department of Dentistry, there are two ways to recruit new teaching staff: In the first option, lecturers can be hired as civil servants by the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education of the Republic of Indonesia. The second option is for UNHAS to hire lecturers who are not registered as government officials. According to the self-assessment report, there are currently 88 teachers involved in the DDM programme, including 20 professors and 22 associate professors. In the specialist programmes, the number and composition of teaching staff is as follows: 15 lecturers (including 4 professors and 6 associate professors) work at the Endodontics Specialist Programme, 27 lecturers (including 10 professors and 9 associate professors) work at the Periodontics Specialist Programme, and 18 lecturers (including 9 professors and 3 associate professors) teach in the Prosthodontics Specialist Programme. The lecturer-student ratio is in the DDM programme 1:5, in the clerkship stage 1:4; and in the specialist programmes 1:3. The peers are satisfied with the number and qualifications of the teaching staff and agree that there enough qualified lecturers to support the students adequately.

Furthermore, all teaching staff are obliged to be involved in research as well. Hence, the peers learn during the audit that the faculty has a goal of publishing 180 articles in international journals such as SCOPUS per year, which was achieved in 2021. The teachers report that they receive funding, for instance, for delivering presentations of the research in both national and international conferences. As was already outlined in criterion 2.1, UNHAS hosts national and international conferences twice a year, at which the teaching staff of the programmes under review can share their own projects with other international researchers. In addition, the teaching staff also has the opportunity to carry out a research semester at universities abroad. The lecturers can for instance choose one of the partner universities mentioned in criterion 2.1. The peers are glad to see that the lecturers of the programmes under review are motivated and supported with the implementation of their own research. However, they see room for improvement in terms of international collaboration and research. Therefore, they would like to see more exchange between UNHAS

faculty and other international universities and, especially, more results of these collaborations including joint projects/articles and developments of the programme curriculum developments.

To conclude, the peers are satisfied with the composition and qualification of the staff, which allows for qualified teaching and support of the students. However, they recommend increasing the international research and collaboration of the teaching staff.

Criterion 4.2 Staff development

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report
- Staff handbook
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

UNHAS encourages the training of its academic and technical staff, so it has developed a workshop programmes for improving the didactic abilities and teaching methods. Two of those programmes consist of Basic Training for Instructional Skills (PEKERTI), and Applied Approach (AA), particularly for newly acquired lecturers. These types of training are provided by the Institute for Quality Assurance and Educational Development (IQAED). In the audit, the teachers explain that some of the seminars and workshops are mandatory and that all teachers have to attend once per year a one-day workshop. During these sessions, the lecturers are trained, for instance, in developing multiple-choice exams or in their competencies as clinical instructors. Furthermore, as already outlined in criterion 4.1, lecturers are encouraged and supported in their research activities through financial funding.

In summary, the auditors confirm that the university offers sufficient support mechanisms and opportunities for members of the teaching staff who wish to develop further their professional and teaching skills.

Criterion 4.3 Funds and equipment

Evidence:

- Live tour through the laboratories
- Video of the facilities
- Self-Assessment Report
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The auditors learn that financial resources for UNHAS originate from government research funding, societal funds and tuition fees. Annually, 70% of the funds is allocated to strategies of development particularly for facilities and infrastructure. As the audit was conducted online, the peers were not able to visit the laboratories and teaching spaces. Instead, UN-HAS has provided a video of relevant facilities and laboratories. In addition, during the audit, members of the teaching staff gave a live-tour through some of the many laboratorial spaces UNHAS hold and answered questions the peers had. During the audit discussions, the peers inquire about the specific tools with which the dentistry department is equipped. They learn that in the last years UNHAS invested significantly in the equipment of the laboratories, specifically, those of the specialist programmes. In the Prosthodontics programme, for instance, the dental center was equipped with a number of new tools, and for the Endodontics programme new tool kits were purchased. The peers thus believe that the quality of the laboratories and equipment is sufficient to adequately train students and enable them to achieve the ILOs of their respective degree programs. Moreover, the peers confirm that the current funding allows for maintaining the standards as well as purchasing further instruments.

Nonetheless, they see room for improvement in terms of the equipment. The peers' assessment is mirrored by the feedback of both lecturers and students. Although both state to be generally satisfied with the facilities, they indicate that acquiring more advanced tools could enhance the quality of the programmes as well. Lecturers communicate that if they had more modern tools, they could also do more advanced research projects. Students would like to see a 3D X-ray machine or expanded equipment for oral surgery, among other things. Students and lecturers are aware, however, that the efforts of the Dentistry Department are largely limited to the governmental and societal funding they receive.

In conclusion, the peers recommend quantitative and qualitative improvements in facilities for all programs.

Since the peers were only able to virtually visit the facilities and laboratories of UNHAS, they require to carry out a subsequent on-site visit, at which the exact laboratories and equipment can be assessed in presence.

Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 4:

UNHAS submits a comment, which is quoted in chapter E of this report.

However, from the perspective of the peers, the university's statement does not provide sufficient information or evidence that the critical issues mentioned above have been re-moved/improved. Thus, the peers further insist that an on-site visit needs to be carried out in order to assess the exact laboratories and equipment. Furthermore, the peers recommend to improve the equipment of the programmes in quantity and quality.

Criterion partly fulfilled

5. Transparency and documentation

Criterion 5.1 Module descriptions

Evidence:

- Module handbooks
- Websites

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The students and teaching staff have access to the module descriptions via UNHAS' online learning platform SICOLA. According to the students, the module handbooks are uploaded to SICOLA before the beginning of each semester.

After studying the module descriptions, the peers confirm that they include most of the necessary information about the persons responsible for each module, the teaching methods and work load, the awarded credit points, the intended learning outcomes, the content, the applicability, the admission and examination requirements, and the forms of assessment. However, the module descriptions are lacking a detailed explanation on how the final grade is calculated. To meet ASIIN's criteria, the module descriptions must include information on how the module's final grade is calculated.

Furthermore, after reviewing the module handbooks for all degree programs, the peers note various ambiguities and incomprehensibilities that call for a revision of the documents. First of all, the titles of the modules do not always offer a clear understanding of their content due to vague formulations. This is especially the case in the specialist programmes, in which many module titles are composed of the name of the specialization and a number. In Prosthodontics, for example, six modules are designated "Clinical Prosthodontic I – VI". In other specialty programs, module title constellations are similar. Examples include "Integration Periodontology I-II", "Academic Periodontology I-IV", "Conservative Dentistry Clinical Skills I-V", or "Advance Clinical Conservative I-III". Therefore, the module titles should be revised and made more precise to reflect the exact content of the modules. Furthermore, the peers agree that various module descriptions also need to be specified because they do not provide a clear understanding of the actual content of the module.

For example in the module "Conservative Dentistry Clinical Skills I" it should be emphasized that students will treat diseases or disorders of hard tissue tooth and reversible pulpitis with minimal preparation. In the module "Conservative Dentistry Clinical Skills II", the description should specify that the module conveys advanced knowledge and practice in terms of management of invasive dental hard tissue management with non-plastic restoration. Furthermore, from the module descriptions it is not clear which different diagnostic methods (especially instrumentation methods, length measurements and filling techniques) are used. Finally, the module descriptions are lacking information on how many treatments students have to complete during their studies.

To conclude the module handbooks must be revised so that they include precise information about the exact module titles, contents and learning outcomes, the conditions for the award of credits and the calculation of the final grade.

Criterion 5.2 Diploma and Diploma Supplement

Evidence:

- Sample Transcript of Records for each degree programme
- Sample Degree certificate for each degree programme
- Sample Diploma Supplement for each degree programme

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

According to the self-assessment report, UNHAS provides the degree certificate, academic transcript, and diploma supplement to every student, who has completed all modules and has passed the National Board Examination in case of the DDM programme and Comprehensive Exam in the case of the specialist programmes. The Diploma Supplement contains all necessary information about the degree programme including acquired soft skills and awards (extracurricular and co-curricular activities). The Transcript of Records lists all the courses that the graduate has completed, the achieved credits, grades, cumulative GPA, and mentions the seminar and thesis title.

Criterion 5.3 Relevant rules

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report
- Educational Guidelines for every programme
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

The auditors confirm that the rights and duties of both UNHAS and the students are clearly defined and binding. All rules and regulations are published on either the university's website or the platform SICOLA and hence available to all relevant stakeholders. In addition, the students receive all relevant course material in the language of the degree programme at the beginning of each semester.

Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 5:

UNHAS submits a comment, which is quoted in chapter E of this report.

However, from the perspective of the peers, the university's statement does not provide sufficient information or evidence that the critical issues mentioned above have been re-moved/improved. Thus, the peers further insist that UNHAS rewrites the module descriptions so that they include information about the precise module titles, contents and learning outcomes, the conditions for the award of credits and the calculation of the final grade.

Criterion partly fulfilled.

6. Quality management: quality assessment and development

Criterion 6 Quality management: quality assessment and development

Evidence:

- Self-Assessment Report
- Educational Guidelines
- Discussions during the audit

Preliminary assessment and analysis of the peers:

According to the self-assessment report, UNHAS possesses a quality assurance system that complies with the regulations of the Indonesian government. Internal evaluations are carried out in two ways: The first form of evaluation is organized by DEU (Dental Education Unit) and consists of a questionnaire for each course at the end of the term. There, students can give their feedback on the teaching and content of the subject. Furthermore, all students have to complete a questionnaire at the end of the term, which assesses the student's satisfaction with different academic services including library, facilities, and student support. In the audit, the students confirm that the evaluations are carried out regularly, and that lecturers communicate the results of the survey in the next session. Another evaluation takes place in the form of an assessment of the students' performance before and after a module to evaluate the module's content and its alignment with the intended learning outcome. This monitoring is carried out by the Faculty Quality Assurance Unit (FQAU). UNHAS states that feedback obtained through the evaluations is forwarded to official meetings where it is discussed and actions are developed for implementation. Examples for implementations include workshops for course modules, Focused Group Discussions for module writing, and MCQ (Multiple Choice Question) and OSCE (Objective Structured Clinical Examination) review. In the audit, the program coordinators inform the peers that stakeholder feedback is also regularly collected in the form of a questionnaire. The results show their high satisfaction with the students and graduates, which is mirrored in the audit discussion with the stakeholders.

The peers are glad to hear that UNHAS regularly conducts evaluations of all stakeholder's feedback and students' performance. In the audit discussions, the students report that there are regular teaching evaluations at the end of each course and that they receive the results of these evaluations in the new semester. They also assure that there is a working feedback loop, as any criticism voiced by students is accepted by teachers and quickly transformed into action to improve the respective conditions. However, the peers believe that there is room for improvement in terms the systemic quality management. As mentioned in criterion 1.3, the peers believe that student and stakeholder feedback should be more strongly encouraged and considered in relation to the curriculum to ensure that the programmes are dynamically developing in line with the feedback from the evaluations and recent developments in international research. Thus, the HEI must introduce regular evaluations, in which the programmes are assessed by all stakeholders. These assessments must follow a documented procedure that is made transparent to all stakeholders. In these evaluations, the feedback of students and industry partners must be given greater consideration so that there is a well-functioning feedback loop in terms of the systematic evaluation of the programmes. Furthermore, the quality management should be completed with

regard to exact mechanisms that are set in motion when, for example, students' scores on the state exam deteriorate.

In relation to the evaluation of the student's performance, the peers are missing exact parameters, which illustrate the assessment of the students' achievement particularly with regard to the ILOs. Furthermore, the peers argue that the course portfolio should be part of the students' assessment.

To conclude, the peers are satisfied with the quality management in its basic features but see the need for improvement in various locations such as the implementation of a successful systemic assessment of the programmes and the introduction of fixed parameters to assess the students' achievement.

Final assessment of the peers after the comment of the Higher Education Institution regarding criterion 6:

UNHAS submits a comment, which is quoted in chapter E of this report.

However, from the perspective of the peers, the university's statement does not provide sufficient information or evidence that the critical issues mentioned above have been re-moved/improved. Thus, the peers further insist that UNHAS ensures that the assessment of the students' performance is based on transparent parameters. Moreover, they recommend that the feedback of students and stakeholders is given greater consideration in the quality assurance of the programmes.

Criterion not fulfilled.

D Additional Documents

No additional documents needed

E Comment of the Higher Education Institution (15.11.2022)

The following quotes the comment of the institution:

"Criterion 1.1

DDM: In each course modul, ILO of "Be competent to perform a professional dentist in accordance with ethical and legal standards based on the five principles of PANCASILA" achieve with implement the principle of PANCASILA in their activity during the activities in their course such as tolerance with the difference in discussion, define the decision with all members agreement. This ILO measure as formative assessment of Problem Based Learning assessment. the tutor evaluate student affective (implementation of PANCASILA) during their activities using rubric of tutorial evaluation. In the Doctor program the competencies of tooth extraction will teach and train in oromaxillofacial course, the student will learn the basic of tooth extraction and practice to perform tooth extraction using mannequin. in clerkship program, the student will discuss related the case of tooth extraction, observe a tooth extraction in real patients, be an assisstant of dental specialist students and performe tooth extraction in real patient under supervision.

Prosthodontics: We will use this input in the next curriculum revision, namely by carrying out activities that increase insight into the global atmosphere in the field of prosthodontics. In the near future, the study program will carry out benchmarking, and internships at foreign universities will simultaneously carry out or adopt topics that are in accordance with the existing curriculum. The ILO which is loaded in modules based on the new curriculum has been updated from the old curriculum. In the new curriculum there is a Clinical Skill Lab module which aims to upgrade students' clinical competence.

Criterion 1.3 Curriculum

Endodontics: Obturation technique learning is included in Case Management of Conservative Dentistry I; CLO5 (Residents will able to master knowledge and practice about thermal obturation comprehensively by understanding the principles of cost effectiveness and evidence-based dentistry through a case based on learning approach). In this module handbook, residents learn the internationally approved obturation techniques in accordance with the development of science and technology. The theory of obturation technique is also learned from the updated textbook during the Case Management of Conservative Dentistry I module through some texbooks such as, Cohen's Pathways of the Pulp 11th ed (Cohen, 2021), Grossman's Endodontic Practice 14th ed (Grossman, 2020), Endodontics Principles and Practice 6th ed (Torabinejad, 2020), etc. New techniques for diagnostics are also carried out in accordance with scientific developments obtained from reading journals and textbooks and are applied during treatment of patients. This is indicated in the SAR description: This clinical activity is supported by scientific abilities, including journal reading, case reports or discussions, literature extracts, and research as preparation for thesis writing.

DDM: In the Doctor program, the students train using mannequin and role play with their peers (communication skills), in professional degree, student will observe and be operator assistant than will be perform tooth extraction in real patient under supervision.

Prosthodontics: 1. Students of the Prosthodontic Specialist Program in addition to working on implants and maxillofacial prostheses are also required to do the requirement of cases of crowns, bridges, veneers and other prostheses. 2. The learning materials in the curriculum are not exactly the same as those in the collegium material, the specifications for the collegium curriculum are the minimum standards and the study program has developed a curriculum by utilizing up to date research and community service results and receiving input from graduate users.

Endodontics: According to the study programme curriculum, there are 6 CP which can be a place for improvement which is local content for competency development and adaptation to current trends.

Periodontics: To adapted the state-of-the-art research in order to ensure that all programmes are up-to-date and put it in the curriculum of the Periodontics specialist programme, we include it in modul of elective courses and clinical skill lab 4 (implant) of our curriculum we already adapt state of the art research based on international research, still because we are still focused to found the best material to be developed in periodontal field, based on marine source which is in accordance with the vision of Hasanuddin University research strategic plan. To adapt the international research, we add elective course which are in description of the course, the resident are given freedom to choose subject matter that is directly related to their research.

To adapt the development of implant research, especially on CAD/CAM implant, we add the description in modul of clinical skill lab 4 (implant), which the resident can join the international course before they do the implantation of dental implant.

Criterion 2.1 Structure and Modules

DDM : During the pandemic the number of cases was reduced based on Indonesian Dental Faculty Association consideration and the the original curriculum the number of cases are appropriate to reach competency level.

Criterion 3: Exams

Endodontics: The total credits according to the curriculum are 56 CP with 6 CP of local content. In local content, there is room for curriculum development based on the latest trends in science and technology regarding the Endodontics specialist program. Complex case treatment requirements can be started from semester 4 according to the description of the Advanced Clinical Conservative Dentistry II module; CLO2: Resident are able to perform complex restoration treatment in term of post-endodontic patien comprehensively.

DDM : We acknowledge that currently, only abbreviations of the examinations are listed in the module handbooks. Therefore we will attach an explanation for each assessment type used in every course module.

Prosthodontics: We will use this input in the next curriculum revision, namely by increasing research and service by collaborating with institutions from abroad.

Criterion 6: Quality Management

Prosthodontics: Thank you for the advice. In the future, we will add parameters for student achievement, such as graduating on time, graduating with grades above the average.

DDM: DDM study program regularly asked students for their feedback regarding the learning process through the google form questionnaire at the end of every course. Feedback from stakeholders and industry partners is obtained during curriculum evaluation workshop.

Periodontics: 1. we already update logbook and modul in six semester curriculum but we haven't uploaded it yet because the 6 semester resident has not fully completed the case requirement. (lampirkan blue print assessment untuk perbaikan di course modul yang lama dan baru.. in all we already mention the blue print assessment where the final grade can achieved)."

F Summary: Peer recommendations (23.11.2022)

Taking into account the additional information and the comments given by UNHAS the peers summarize their analysis and **final assessment** for the award of the seals as follows:

Degree Programme	ASIIN Seal	Maximum duration of accreditation
Doctor of Dental Medicine Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028
Prosthodontics Specialist Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028
Endodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028
Periodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028

Requirements

For all programmes

- A 1. (ASIIN 1.1) Formulate the learning objectives precisely, particularly with regard to the students' technical skills.
- A 2. (ASIIN 1.1) Draft the learning outcomes so that they describe the academic, subjectspecific and professional classification of the qualifications gained in the degree programmes.
- A 3. (ASIIN 1.1, 2.1) Ensure that the learning objectives and the curriculum are aligned.
- A 4. (ASIIN 1.3, 6.1) Ensure that the curriculum is regularly assessed with the participation of all stakeholders and adapted to developments in international research.

- A 5. (ASIIN 3.1) Ensure that the form and procedure of the respective examination method is communicated transparently and bindingly to the students.
- A 6. (ASIIN 4.3) An on-site visit needs to be carried out in order to assess the exact laboratories and equipment.
- A 7. (ASIIN 5.1) Rewrite the module descriptions so that they include information about the precise module titles, contents and learning outcomes, the conditions for the award of credits and the calculation of the final grade.
- A 8. (ASIIN 6.1) Ensure that the assessment of the students' performance is based on transparent parameters.

For all specialist programmes

A 9. (ASIIN 2.1) Make sure that the modules build on each other coherently.

Recommendations For all programmes

- E 1. (ASIIN 2.1) It is recommended that guest lectures and international collaborations are given greater consideration in the program development.
- E 2. (ASIIN 4.2) It is recommended to increase the internal exchange of lecturers to enhance international research projects.
- E 3. (ASIIN 4.3) It is recommended to improve the equipment of the programmes in quantity and quality.
- E 4. (ASIIN 6.1) It is recommended that the feedback of students and stakeholders is given greater consideration in the quality assurance of the programmes.

For the Specialist Programmes

E 5. (ASIIN 2.1) It is recommended to increase the number of treatments that the students have to complete during their studies.

For the Doctor of Dental Medicine

E 6. (ASIIN 1.3) It is recommended to improve the emergency skills of the students.

G Comment of the Technical Committee 14 - Medicine (02.12.2022)

Technical Committee 14 – Medicine (02.12.2022)

Assessment and analysis for the award of the ASIIN seal:

The TC sees a large number of points of criticism, this is reflected in a total of nine requirements, some of which also concern essential areas of the study programme (technical equipment, learning objectives, QM, examinations). In addition, six recommendations are made.

The Technical Committee discusses the procedure and agrees with the requirements and recommendations.

The Technical Committee 14 – Medicine recommends the award of the seals as follows:

Degree Programme	ASIIN Seal	Maximum duration of accreditation
Doctor of Dental Medicine Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028
Prosthodontics Specialist Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028
Endodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028
Periodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028

H Decision of the Accreditation Commission (09.12.2022)

Assessment and analysis for the award of the subject-specific ASIIN seal:

The Accreditation Commission discusses the procedure and agrees with the requirements and recommendations formulated by the peers.

Degree Programme	ASIIN Seal	Maximum duration of accreditation
Doctor of Dental Medicine Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028
Prosthodontics Specialist Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028
Endodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028
Periodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	With requirements for one year	30.09.2028

The Accreditation Commission decides to award the following seals:

Requirements For all programmes

- A 1. (ASIIN 1.1) Formulate the learning objectives precisely, particularly with regard to the students' technical skills.
- A 2. (ASIIN 1.1) Draft the learning outcomes so that they describe the academic, subjectspecific and professional classification of the qualifications gained in the degree programmes.
- A 3. (ASIIN 1.1, 2.1) Ensure that the learning objectives and the curriculum are aligned.
- A 4. (ASIIN 1.3, 6.1) Ensure that the curriculum is regularly assessed with the participation of all stakeholders and adapted to developments in international research.

- A 5. (ASIIN 3.1) Ensure that the form and procedure of the respective examination method is communicated transparently and bindingly to the students.
- A 6. (ASIIN 4.3) An on-site visit needs to be carried out in order to assess the exact laboratories and equipment.
- A 7. (ASIIN 5.1) Rewrite the module descriptions so that they include information about the precise module titles, contents and learning outcomes, the conditions for the award of credits and the calculation of the final grade.
- A 8. (ASIIN 6.1) Ensure that the assessment of the students' performance is based on transparent parameters.

For all specialist programmes

A 9. (ASIIN 2.1) Make sure that the modules build on each other coherently.

Recommendations For all programmes

- E 1. (ASIIN 2.1) It is recommended that guest lectures and international collaborations are given greater consideration in the program development.
- E 2. (ASIIN 4.2) It is recommended to increase the internal exchange of lecturers to enhance international research projects.
- E 3. (ASIIN 4.3) It is recommended to improve the equipment of the programmes in quantity and quality.
- E 4. (ASIIN 6.1) It is recommended that the feedback of students and stakeholders is given greater consideration in the quality assurance of the programmes.

For the Specialist Programmes

E 5. (ASIIN 2.1) It is recommended to increase the number of treatments that the students have to complete during their studies.

For the Doctor of Dental Medicine

E 6. (ASIIN 1.3) It is recommended to improve the emergency skills of the students.

I Fulfilment of Requirements (24.09.2024)

Analysis of the experts and the Technical Committee (09.09.2024)

Requirements

For all degree programmes

A 1. (ASIIN 1.1) Formulate the learning objectives precisely, particularly with regard to the students' technical skills.

Initial Treatment				
Peers	Not (completely) fulfilled Justification:			
	The experts recognise that UNHAS has submitted revised PLOs. Whilst the PLOs have been clarified, the reviewers note that not all intended outcomes are comprehensible.			
	For instance, in the documents for all programmes (DDM, Endo, Perio and Prostho) it is written that clinical competence refers to performing treatments on patients, but the chosen teaching method is only Clinical Skills Lab and Chair Side Teaching. There is no explanation of what is meant by chair side teaching, what the intended outcomes are and how to ensure that stu- dents achieve these outcomes. Chair side teaching is commonly used for the work of dental assistants whose role is to prepare the room, prepare the equipment for treatment and assist the dentist in treating patients. Therefore, the documents need to demonstrate in more detail which technical skills are being taught and how they correspond to EFQ 6 or 7 level.			
	The experts also miss an explanation of how big the difference in learning experience with patients must be between the DDS pro- gramme and the specialist programme in order to be considered as passed.			
TC 14	not (completely) fulfilled Vote: unanimous Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts.			

AC	not fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the ex-
	perts.
Secondary Treat	nent
Peers	not (completely) fulfilled
	Justification:
	The experts recognise that UNHAS has revised the PLOs and that
	the description of the courses (including teaching methods, stu-
	dent activities, teaching activities), which should show how these
	contribute to the achievement of the learning objectives, is now
	more detailed.
	However, they still find that UNHAS has failed to explain how the
	achievement of each intended learning outcome is to be meas-
	ured. In other words, the experts find no explanation of how
	each programme explains how each course contributes to the
	achievement of the programme's learning outcomes. The experts
	consider this shortcoming to be crucial, as for them the basis for
	the study programmes is therefore missing. The experts also miss
	a portfolio for each course that shows the exact skills and abili-
TC 14	fulfilled
_	Vote: unanimous
	Justification:
	As only two experts assessed the fulfilment of the requirement
	and the experts' statement does not fully relate to the original
	requirements, the Committee decides to review the documenta-
	tion submitted by UNHAS itself.
	The review shows that although the learning objectives do not
	fully meet the very detailed requirements of the experts, they
	are well developed and therefore do not prevent the accredita-
	tion of the programmes. The technical committee therefore con-
	siders the requirement to be met.
AC	fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the TC
	14.

A 2. (ASIIN 1.1) Draft the learning outcomes so that they describe the academic, subjectspecific and professional classification of the qualifications gained in the degree programmes.

Initial Treatment	t
Peers	Not (completely) fulfilled
	Vote
	Justification:
	As mentioned above, UNHAS has provided more precise in-
	tended learning outcomes at programme and module level. They
	are also more detailed in terms of academic, subject and profes-
	sional classification. However, they need to be improved in terms
	of outlining the precise clinical skills to be achieved by students.
TC 14	not (completely) fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts.
AC	not fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the ex-
	perts.
Secondary Treat	ment
Peers	not (completely) fulfilled
	Justification:
	The experts conclude that UNHAS has not yet precisely defined
	the clinical skills to be acquired by students. This is also im-
	portant because they cannot currently see any difference in the
	competences and learning experiences between the four study
	programmes. Therefore, a precise definition of the clinical skills
	and the exact cases covered in the four degree programmes is es-
	sential to determine the level of competence achieved by gradu-
	ates. However, as this is still lacking, the experts do not consider
	the requirement to have been met.
TC 14	fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification:
	The Committee decides to review the documentation itself (see
	above). The review shows that although the learning objectives
	do not fully meet the very detailed requirements of the experts,
	they are well developed and therefore do not prevent the ac-
	creditation of the programmes. The technical committee there-
	fore considers the requirement to be met.
AC	fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the TC
	14.

A 3. (ASIIN 1.1, 2.1) Ensure that the learning objectives and the curriculum are aligned.

Initial Treatment	Initial Treatment			
Peers	Fulfilled Vote Justification: UNHAS has provided a comprehensive explanation of how the el- ements of the curricula are linked to the achievement of the PLOs. In addition, the university has explained in detail the differ- ences between the 5-semester and 6-semester curricula of the specialist programmes and the reasons for changing the curricula from 5 to 6 semesters. The experts find that the documents demonstrate well how the curricula are aligned with the PLOs. However, as mentioned above (A1), the reviewers would like to see a more precise explanation in both the PLOs and the curricula as to which clinical competences are achieved.			
TC 14	fulfilled Vote: unanimous Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts.			
AC	fulfilled Vote: unanimous Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the ex- perts.			

A 4. (ASIIN 1.3, 6.1) Ensure that the curriculum is regularly assessed with the participation of all stakeholders and adapted to developments in international research.

Initial Treatment				
Peers	Not (completely) fulfilled			
	Vote			
	Justification:			
	UNHAS states that curricula are evaluated and updated every 4-5 years. Changes are made taking into account the latest developments in science and technology, previous academic evaluations and feedback from stakeholders gathered through online questionnaires. For each programme, UNHAS provides several examples of feedback from industry partners and research findings that have been incorporated into the programmes.			
	The experts appreciate that UNHAS takes into account recom- mendations from students, alumni and industry partners, as well as new developments in research, when improving programmes. However, few improvements are based on international re-			

	search. UNHAS should therefore take greater account of interna-							
	tional research and reduce the cycle of curriculum revision from							
	4 or 5 years to, for example, every 2 years.							
TC 14	not (completely) fulfilled							
	Vote: unanimous							
	Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts.							
AC	not fulfilled							
	Vote: unanimous							
	Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the ex-							
	perts.							
Secondary Treat	ment							
Peers	not (completely) fulfilled							
	Justification:							
	The experts appreciate the efforts of UNHAS to explain the role							
	of international research in the curriculum, but it seems to them							
	that the university has not addressed exactly the issue outlined							
	by the experts. In the statement of UNHAS, they refer to various							
	international research and how they intend to implement or							
	have already implemented the outcomes (e.g. virtual reality in							
	dental education) in the study programmes. The experts wel-							
	come these changes, but would like to see UNHAS present the							
	results of its own international research collaboration and ho							
	these are being incorporated into the curricula.							
TC 14	fulfilled							
	Vote: unanimous							
	Justification:							
	The Committee considers that the requirement is met, as it notes							
	that UNHAS appears to have put in place measures to demon-							
	strate that the curriculum is regularly evaluated with the partici-							
	pation of all stakeholders and takes into account developments							
	in international research.							
AC	fulfilled							
	Vote: unanimous							
	Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the TC							
	14.							

A 5. (ASIIN 3.1) Ensure that the form and procedure of the respective examination method is communicated transparently and bindingly to the students.

Initial Treatment					
Peers	Fulfilled				
	Vote				
	Justification:				

	UNHAS states that at the beginning of each new semester, lectur- ers give a presentation on the exact examination methods, the calculation of the module grade, the teaching methods and the learning objectives of the module. As evidence, the university provides exemplary ppt presentations for each degree pro- gramme.
TC 14	fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts.
AC	fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the ex-
	perts.

A 6. (ASIIN 4.3) An on-site visit needs to be carried out in order to assess the exact laboratories and equipment.

Initial Treatment	Initial Treatment							
Peers	fulfilled Vote Justification: One of the experts has carried out an onsite visit and inspected the facilities used in the study programmes. The expert concludes that the labs, equipment and overall infra- structure of the university is sufficient to carry out the degree programmes at an adequate level.							
TC 14	fulfilled Vote: unanimous Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts.							
AC	fulfilled Vote: unanimous Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the ex- perts.							

A 7. (ASIIN 5.1) Rewrite the module descriptions so that they include information about the precise module titles, contents and learning outcomes, the conditions for the award of credits and the calculation of the final grade.

Initial Treatment					
Peers	fulfilled				
	Vote				
	Justification:				

	UNHAS provides revised module descriptions for each pro- gramme. The experts note that they now contain precise and ac- curate information on the module titles, content and learning outcomes, the conditions for the award of credits and the calcu- lation of the final grade. The experts consider that the require- ment is met.
TC 14	fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts.
AC	fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the ex-
	perts.

A 8. (ASIIN 6.1) Ensure that the assessment of the students' performance is based on transparent parameters.

Initial Treatment	
Peers	fulfilled
	LINHAS procents the assessment methods and parameters for all
	programmes in detail. The experts find that the assessments are
	transparent and that the grading seems appropriate.
TC 14	fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts.
AC	fulfilled
	Vote: unanimous
	Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the ex-
	perts.

For all specialist programmes

A 9. (ASIIN 2.1) Make sure that the modules build on each other coherently.

Initial Treatment	
Peers	Fulfilled
	Vote
	Justification: UNHAS has revised the documents and demon-
	strated in detail that all modules are arranged in a sustainable
	and coherent manner.
TC 14	fulfilled

	Vote: unanimous						
	Justification: The TC follows the assessment of the experts.						
AC	fulfilled						
	Vote: unanimous						
	Justification: The Commission follows the assessment of the ex-						
	perts.						

Decision of the Accreditation Commission (24.09.2024)

Degree programme	ASIIN-label	Accreditation until max.
Doctor of Dental Medicine Pro- gramme	All Requirements ful- filled	30.09.2028
Prosthodontics Specialist Pro- gramme	All Requirements ful- filled	30.09.2028
Endodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	All Requirements ful- filled	30.09.2028
Periodonthics Specialist Pro- gramme	All Requirements ful- filled	30.09.2028

Appendix: Programme Learning Outcomes and Curricula

According to self-assessment report the following **objectives** and **learning outcomes (intended qualifications profile)** shall be achieved by the degree programme <u>Doctor of Dental</u> <u>Medicine</u>:

"Objectives are:

- a) Care Provider: Be able to treat patients holistically, as individuals and as part of families and communities, and provide continuous quality care within the sphere of a trustworthy and mutually beneficial doctor-patient relationship
- b) Decision maker: Be able to choose appropriate technology to be used in enhancing proper and low-cost health services
- c) Communicator: Be able to promote a healthy lifestyle with effective counselling and appropriate advice in a cultural and economic context, thereby improving individuals and groups health
- d) Community leader: Be able to identify the health needs of individuals and groups so that they can play a role in motivating the community to participate in improving the community's oral and dental health
- e) Manager: Be able to work effectively and harmoniously with other people both inside and outside the health care organization system to find out what aspects the patient and society need
- f) Creator and innovator: Being responsive and liable toward health needs in the environment and having creativity and innovation to make changes and solutions to improve the health status of the community
- g) Lecturer or researcher: Be able to act as professional educators and scientists, who are always able to develop themselves according to the advancement of science and technology appropriately through the addition of knowledge and research.

Graduates are mostly well accepted as an employer in the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Defense, the Ministry of Research, Technology, and Higher Education, to perform medical services in the government hospital and become a lecturer in universities as well as to perform dental services in a private clinic."

"Intended learning outcomes:

- 1. Be competence to perform a professional dentist in accordance with ethical and legal standards based on the five principles of PANCASILA
- Apply psychosocial sciences, culture, and humanity to perform dental practices within one's scope of competence and consult with or refer to professional colleagues when indicated;
- 3. Apply basic concepts of medical and dental sciences as well as utilize marine natural resources to support dental practices and research;
- Actualize both medical and dental clinical sciences to perform dental practices effectively and efficiently;
- 5. Utilize information through a variety of media to keep updating with the recent development of dental science and technology for better dental services;
- 6. Demonstrate team working skills and to collaborate with other health professions in patient management;
- 7. Perform therapeutical communication, general physical and stomatognathic system examination, diagnose, and to develop a dental treatment plan and to establish prognosis in the form of medical record;
- 8. Perform a restoration of the stomatognathic system through dental clinical management and documentation in the form of a medical record;
- 9. Perform medical treatments in emergency and medical compromised patients;
- 10. Perform management functions in dental practices to analyze public health problems and to provide innovative solutions using evidence-based dentistry approaches."

According to self-assessment report the following **objectives** and **learning outcomes (intended qualifications profile)** shall be achieved by the Prosthodontic Specialist Programme:

"Objectives:

- a) Graduates who are academically competent and professional, with an understanding of local wisdom as a result of the student-centered learning approach and the longterm learning concept, in order to manage the stomatognathic system problem;
- b) Graduates will have a teaching qualification as lecturer that is relevant to the level of teaching responsibility in prosthodontic, with good communication skills also working in any educational environment;
- c) Graduates who are capable of satisfying evidence-based medical-dentistry and public health requirements, conducting research that supports clinical application of prosthodontics, and becoming national references for prosthodontic cases;

- d) Graduates can become an honorary consultant registered for prosthodontics and rehabilitative dentistry with highly and experienced skills to accept referrals for more complex prosthodontic cases;
- e) Graduates who are reliable to work in health care industry with honesty, ethics, confidence and having integrity while making fair decisions based on the community needs in order to lead a healthcare organization to excellence."

"Intended learning outcomes:

- 1. To have graduates that believe in God, professional, with Pancasila values in providing treatments.
- 2. To demonstrate in-depth theory and applicative knowledge of basic medicine and dentistry to support advanced removable and fixed denture design principles and its aesthetic rehabilitation.
- 3. To demonstrate in-depth theory and applicative knowledge of temporomandibular joint structure, jaw movement biomechanics, static and functional occlusion, and temporomandibular disorder.
- 4. To demonstrate in-depth theory and applicative knowledge of gerontology, maxillofacial prosthetic, logopedic and gnathology for specific oral rehabilitation.
- 5. To be able to communicate effectively in a team work, an independent decision maker and a critical evaluator in solving problem.
- 6. To be able to make, publish and document scientific report for the benefit of the profession and government national policy.
- 7. Perform treatment in patients with full and partial edentulous using both fixed and removable denture, veneer, bleaching, crown lengthening, precision attachment and implant.
- 8. Perform treatment in patients with maxillofacial conditions using logopedic principal.
- 9. Perform treatment in patients with temporomandibular join disorder."

According to self-assessment report the following **objectives** and **learning outcomes (in-tended qualifications profile)** shall be achieved by the Endotontics Specialist Programme:

"Objectives:

a) Professional: Graduates who are able to apply science and technology in providing endodontics specialist services to the community in accordance with applicable scientific, ethical and legal rules.

- b) Clinician: Graduates who are able to carry out endodontics specialist services according to scientific principles to solve complex problems that occur in the community related to the health of dental and periradicular tissues.
- c) Dental Center Providers and Managers: Graduates are able to provide and manage oral health services in intradisciplinary and multidisciplinary manner in solving endodontics specialist problems.
- d) Scientists/Educators: Graduates who have expertise and are involved in the field of science and clinical endodontics specialist, and can act as educators who are more education-oriented.
- e) Counselor: Graduates who have the ability to communicate and are experts in counseling/extension to individuals, groups and communities in an effort to resolve the problem of endodontic specialists that occurs in the community in an intradisciplinary and multidisciplinary manner.
- f) Researcher: Endodontists who have expertise in researching, reporting and publishing results in the field of endodontic specialists."

"Intended learning outcomes:

- 1. Believe in God Almighty based on Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution of Republic of Indonesia
- 2. To demonstrate an attitude of responsibility as an endodontist by enhancing science and technology based on ethical principles and academic norms.
- 3. To demonstrate comprehensive understanding of embryology and biology of dental hard tissue, pulp and periradicular tissue as a basis for prevention, diagnosis, and treatment planning.
- 4. To demonstrate comprehensive understanding of tooth discoloration, aesthetic restoration as the basis for in-depth management of dental aesthetic disorders.
- 5. To demonstrate comprehensive understanding of pulp and periradicular tissue diseases, as a basis for endodontic diagnosis and treatment using cutting-edge endodontic materials and advanced technology.
- 6. To demonstrate comprehensive understanding of pulp and periradicular tissue diseases, as a basis for endodontic diagnosis and treatment using cutting-edge endodontic materials and technology in depth.
- 7. To demonstrate comprehensive understanding of entrepreneurship, health law, hospital management, bioethics, and therapeutic communication in depth, application of methodology, educational psychology and patient psychology in depth, philosophy of science, epidemiology, research methodology, biostatistics, to produce scientific papers in depth.

- 8. To increase the learning capacity independently by following scientific developments and professional expertise, in collaboration with other professions in solving complex work problems related to the endodontics profession as well as wider problems from the field of the profession.
- 9. To communicate the results of studies in various forms of media, as well as compile reports or produce design work in the field of endodontics, based on design rules and standard procedures, as well as professional code of ethics, which can be accessed by the academic community.
- 10. To achieve and retrieve data for developing professional work in endodontics.
- 11. To conduct anamnesis, physical examination, analyze radiographic, diagnosis, treatment plan in cases of endodontics and documented in filling out medical records and informed consent procedures.
- 12. To conduct treatment management on specialized hard tissue teeth using smile design analysis using the latest materials and technology independently on models and patients according to standard.
- 13. To perform specialized pulp and periradicular tissue care management using the latest materials and technology independently on models and patients according to standard. To perform emergency management in the field of endodontics both in general patients and medical compromises through standardized multidisciplinary approach. To apply methodology and conduct research for the development of science and technology in the field of endodontics to produce theses and publications."

According to self-assessment report the following **objectives** and **learning outcomes (in-tended qualifications profile)** shall be achieved by the <u>Periodontics Specialist Programme:</u>

"Objectives:

- a) Professional: Fear of God Almighty and able to demonstrate religious attitudes, and uphold human values in carrying out duties based on religion, morals and ethics. Able to practice periodontist specialist in accordance with authority standards, according to ethics and law. Be able to analyze, design and implement therapy for various cases of specialist periodontal disease/disorders, evidence-based using science and technology.
- b) Leadership and manager: Able to work and lead effectively and harmoniously with individuals and groups, inside and outside the health care system organization to meet the periodontal treatment needs of the community

- c) Lecture and researcher: Able to act as professional educators and scientists, who are always able to develop themselves according to the progress of science and technology in an effective manner through the addition of knowledge and research
- d) Creator and Innovator: Have sensitivity to health needs in their environment and have creativity and innovation to make changes and solutions to improve public health status.
- e) Manager: Periodontics have communication skills and experts in counseling individuals, and community groups in terms of intradisciplinary and multidisciplinary periodontics."

"Intended Learning Objectives:

- 1. Trust in the Almighty God and uphold the values of Pancasila and the 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia in carrying out treatment procedures
- 2. Internalize the spirit of independence, entrepreneurship, academic norms, and ethics and demonstrating a responsible attitude towards work in the periodontal field.
- 3. Proficiency in theory and application of ethics, medical law, and health communication
- 4. Proficiency in theory and application of basic medical science and clinical medicine as the basis for periodontal treatment of medically compromised patients
- 5. Proficiency in theory and application of diagnosing diseases and disorders of periodontal tissues and their treatment plan.
- 6. Capable of communicating effectively and cooperating in international and global interprofessional collaboration teams, as well as being accountable for work in specific and complex areas of professional expertise in accordance with the code of ethics.
- 7. Capable of making autonomous decisions based on the findings of research, criticisms, appreciation, arguments, or innovation efforts, and critically analyze the work and decisions made.
- 8. Capable of publishing research findings in prominent international publications in the field of periodontics
- 9. Be able to diagnose periodontal disease/disorder and establish a treatment plan independently
- 10. Be able to perform non-surgical as well as minor and complex surgical treatment of periodontal conditions.
- 11. Be able to independently perform reconstructive, regenerative, plastic, and aesthetic surgery, as well as dental implant procedures
- 12. Be able to perform multidisciplinary periodontal treatment and periodontal medicine in patients with systemic disease

The following curriculum is presented for the Prosthodontic Specialist Programme:

SEM	COURSE													
XI	Marine Innovation in Dentistry													
	(2 CP /7,18 ECTS)													
x	Prosthodontics Clinic					Dental Public Health				Integration/Holistic Care				
	(-	4 CP/14	4,36 E(CTS)		(3 CP/10,77 ECTS)				(1	CP/3,	59 ECTS)		
IX	Conse	ervative	Dentis	stry Clinic			Pedia	tric Dei	ntistry	Clinic		Or	thodor	ntics Clinic
	(4 CP/1	4,36EC	STS)		(3 CP/10,77 ECTS)				(3 CP/10,77 ECTS)				
VIII	Radiolo	gy	Ora	Disease (Clinic		Pe	riodont	ics Cli	nic		Ora	i and i Surder	Aaxiliofaciai
	(1 CP/3,59	ECTS)	(2 0	CP/7,18 EC	CTS)		(3	CP/10,7	77 EC1	rs)		(4	CP/14	,36 ECTS)
				Gerodon	tology		Dece	arch an	d		Bach	elor		Comprehen
VII	Oral Reha	bilitatio	n 2	(2 CP/2	2.64	E	ntrep	eneurs	hip	De	aree	Thesis	;	sive OSCE
1996	(6 CP/7,9	93 ECT	S)	ECT	S)	(2	CP/2	,64 EC	TS)	(4 CF	9/12,4	4 EC	TS)	(2 CP/2,64
				~							Eni	domio	logy	ECIS)
		Ste		atognathi	Den	ital Et	hic,	1.3	Oral		Ма	anager	nent	ty
	Soft Tissu	e 2	c Sv	stem 2	La		aw and Rehab		bilitation 1		a	and Health		Services
VI	(3 CP/3,97		(4 C	(4 CP/5,29		Forensic (6 C		CP/7,93		Polic	y	(4		
	ECTS)		E	ECTS) (CP/5,	29	E	CTS)	ees l	(3	3 CP/3	,97	CP/5,29
				E		ECTS)				ECTS)		ECTS)		
								Media			cal and Rese		Research	
	Periapical-pulp Disease			Stomatognath		hic Oromaxillofr		acial 2		De	Dental		Method and	
V	(7 CP/9.2	(7 CP/9,26 ECTS)		System 1		(6 CP/7,9		P/7,93 I	ECTS) E		Emergency		r .	Biostatistics
			(4 CP/5,29 EC		29 EG	TS)					(2 CP/2,64			(3 CP/3,97
5 1	На			2269.2		1	Der	iodonta		926	EC	(15)	romavi	ECIS)
IV	((6 CP/7	,93 EC	TS)		(5 CP/6,61 ECTS) (6 CP/7,9				93 ECTS)				
S 8	Dancacil	_	Soft	Ticcuo 1		Cro	uth or	ad.					Ha	ard Tissue
ш	(2 CP/2 6	34	(3)	2D/3.96		GIU	lonme	ntal	Der	ital Co	mmu	inity	D	isease 1
	ECTS)	ECTS) ECTS) ((5	5 CP/6 61 ECTS)			(3 CP/3,97 EC		7 EC	CTS) (4 CP/5,29		CP/5,29	
	/		-					,						ECTS)
	Scienc		nce-								Me	dical	Dental	
	Civic Education (2 CP/2,64	vic		Englis	English		asic De	ental	Basic Dental		ital	CI	inic	Clinic
Ш		Persr	y t		64	S	Scienc	e 1	Science 2		2	Scie	ence	Science
		F CI OF		FCTS	3)	(5	5 CP/6	5,61	(5 (CP/6,6	51	(4	(4
	ECTS)	(2 CP	P/2.64			ECTS)		5)	ECTS)		Y.	CP/	5,29	CP/5,29
		(2 CP/2,64 ECTS)								EC	TS)	ECTS)		
1	Bahasa	Relig	gion	Maritin	ne	Stu	dy ski	lls, IT	Bi	omedi	с	Ba	isic	Basic

Table 2.1. The curriculum of DDM Program

22

1	(2 CP/2,64	Education	Social Culture	& Scientific	(CP 5/6,61	Medical	Medical
	ECTS)	(2 CP/2,64	(CP/2,64	Writing	ECTS)	Science 1	Science 2
		ECTS)	ECTS)	Methodology		(5	(5
				(3 CP/3,97		CP/6,61	CP/6,61
				ECTS)		ECTS)	ECTS)
	General Science	Basic Med	ical & Dental	Dental Public Health	Clinical Dental	Ap	plied Dental

The following curriculum is presented for the Prosthodontic Specialist Programme:

Curriculum 6 Semester

Semester	Course						
Semester 6 (27.23 ECTS)	Thesis	Comprehensive Exam					
(27.25 LC15)	CP: 2; 23.6 ECTS	CP: 2; 3.6 ECTS					
Semester 5 (35.84 ECTS)	Implant Dental Treatment	Treatment of Partial Edentulous with Fixed Dentures (Comprehensive cases)	Temporomandibular Disorders Treatment (Non- surgical approaches)				
	CP: 3; 13.4 ECTS	CP: 3; 13.4 ECTS	CP: 2; 9 ECTS				1
Semester 4 (40.32 ECTS)	Full Edentulous Treatment with Full Denture (Comprehensive cases)	Partial Edentulous Treatment with Partial Denture (Comprehensive cases)	Maxillofacial Prostheses				
	CP: 3; 13.4 ECTS	CP: 3; 13.4 ECTS	CP: 3; 13.4 ECTS				
Semester 3 (14.51 ECTS)	Skills Labs	Community Services	Herbs in Dentistry				
	CP: 5; 9.1 ECTS	CP: 2; 3.6 ECTS	CP: 1; 1.8 ECTS				
Semester 2 (18.13 ECTS)	Temporomandibular Disorders	Edentulous treatment with Periodontal disease	Edentulous treatment with advances material and technology	Dental implant	Specialists Oral Rehabilitation	Prosthodontic- esthetic rehabilitation	Research Methodology
	CP: 2; 3.6 ECTS	CP: 2; 3.6 ECTS	CP: 1; 1.8 ECTS	CP: 1; 1.8 ECTS	CP: 1; 1.8 ECTS	CP: 1; 1.8 ECTS	CP: 2; 3.6 ECTS
Semester 1 (18.13 ECTS)	Professionalism	Basic Medical Sciences	Basic Dental Sciences	Partial Edentulous Treatment	Full Edentulous Treatment	Edentulous Treatment with Fixed Denture	Scientific Writing
	CP: 1; 1.8 ECTS	CP: 1; 1.8 ECTS	CP: 1; 1.8 ECTS	CP: 2; 3.6 ECTS	CP: 2; 3.6 ECTS	CP: 2; 3.6 ECTS	CP: 1; 1.8 ECTS

CP: 49 ECTS: 154.16

General Sciences Basic Medical Sciences and Dental Sciences Basic Specialist Clinical Specialist

The following curriculum is presented for the Endodontics Specialist Programme:

B. 6 (Six) Semester Curriculum Endodontic Specialist Program

SEM		MATA K	ULIAH	27.111			
1	Profesionalismm 1 (1CP/1.81 ECTS)	Dental Hard Tissue 1 (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Oral Diagnosis 1&2 (2 CP/8.96 ECTS)	Pulp Tissue and Periradicular 1 (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Endodontics Scientific (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Endodontics Skills Lab (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Cases Presentation (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)
2	Research Methodology and Biostatistics (2 CP/3.63 ECTS)	Dental Hard Tissue 2 (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Pulp Tissue and Periradicular 2 (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Oral Diagnosis 3 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Dental Hard Tissue Treatment 1 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Pulp Tissue and Periradicular Treatment 1 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Endodontics Scientific 2 (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)
3	Teaching Skills (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Integrated Medical Science (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Integrated Dental Science (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Stomagtonatic System (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Dental Hard Tissue Treatment 2 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Pulp Tissue and Periradicular Treatment 2 (1 CP/4.48ECTS))	Cases Examination 2 (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)
4	Profesionalism 2 (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Thesis 1 (1 CP/1.81 ECTS))	Dental Trauma (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Dental Aesthetic (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)	Dental Hard Tissue Treatment 3 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Pulp Tissue and Periradicular Treatment 3 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Cases Examination 3 (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)
5	Community Services (1 CP/6.29 ECTS)	Thesis 2 (1 CP/3.63 ECTS)	Dental Hard Tissue Treatment 4 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Pulp Tissue and Periradicular Treatment 4 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Interdiciplines Endodontics 1 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Aesthetic Treatment 1 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Cases Examination 4 (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)
6	Thesis 3 (2 CP/3.63 ECTS)	Treatment of Dental and dentoalveolar trauma (1 CP/8.96 ECTS)	Interdiciplines Endodontics 2 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Aesthetic Treatment 2 (1 CP/4.48ECTS)	Comprehensive Examination (1 CP/1.81 ECTS)		

The following curriculum is presented for the Periodontics Specialist Programme:

	0. 0 (Six) semester Curriculum Feriodonius specialist Frogram						
SEM		COURSE SUBJECT					
1	Periodontal Diseases (1CP/3,63 ECTS)	Non-surgical periodontal management (1 CP/1,81 ECTS)	Basic periodontal surgery (2CP/3,83 ECTS)	Interdisipliner therapy (1CP/1,81 ECTS)	Skill laboratory 1_ Periodontal status (4 CP/15,25 ECTS)	Bio-ethic and Communication (1 CP/1,81 ECTS)	
2	Periodontal Surgery (1 CP/1,81 ECTS)	Dental Implant Treatment (2 CP/3,17 ECTS)	Advance Periodontal Diseases (1 CP/1,81 ECTS)	Special Need Patients' Management (1 CP/1,81 ECTS)	Skill laboratory 2_ Periodontal Surgery (3 CP/13.44 ECTS)	Research Methodology and Dental Biostatistics (1 CP/1,81 ECTS)	Periodontal Clinical Skill 1 (1CP/1,81 ECTS)
3	Periodontal Research 1 (1 CP/1,81 ECTS)	Periodontal Journal Critical Appraisal (1 CP/4.48 ECTS)	Advance Periodontal Surgery (1 CP/4,48 ECTS)	Skill laboratory 3_Regenerative Therapy (1 CP/4,48 ECTS)	Periodontal Clinical Skill 2 (2 CP/3,63 ECTS)		
4	Periodontal Case Report (1 CP/4,48 ECTS)	Advance Periodontal Regenerative Therapy (1 CP/4,48 ECTS)	Periodonal Book Summary (1 CP/1,81 ECTS)	Skill laboratory 4_ Dental Implant (1 CP/4,48 ECTS)	Periodontal Clinical Skill 3 (1 CP/4,48 ECTS)		
5	Periodontal Research 2 (1 CP/3,17 ECTS)	Periodontal Clinical Skill 4 (1 CP/4,48 ECTS	Elective Courses (2 CP/3,17 ECTS)	Marine Periodontal (1 CP/1,59 ECTS)			
6	Community Service (2 CP/4,48 ECTS	Periodontal Research 3 (1 CP/1,59 ECTS)	Periodontal Clinical Skill 5 (2 CP/8,96 ECTS)	Clinical Ethic Implementation (1 CP/1,59 ECTS	Clinical education (1 CP/1,59 ECTS)		

b. 6 (Six) Semester Curriculum Periodontics Specialist Program